F] טער	15	E 2021	
FRESNO By	COUN	NTY SU	PERIOR	COURT

MMD - DEPUTY

RECEIVED 5/17/2021 1:50 PM FRESNO COUNTY SUPERIOR COURT By: I. Herrera, Deputy

SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA

COUNTY OF FRESNO

NENG VU; WILLIE THOMPSON; ELVIA REYES; CATALINA MENDOZA; ANTONIO MARTINEZ; and MALAQUIAS ESTEVEZ individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

JOHN HOVANNISIAN, an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; DAVID HOVANNISIAN, an individual d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN an individual, and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership; JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership; JCH Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership and DOES 1-100, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. 14 CECG 00062

SETTLEMENT CLASS ACTION

[PROPUSED] FINAL JUDGMENT AND ORDER

The Final Approval Hearing came on regularly for hearing on April 29, 2021, in Department 503 of the above-referenced Court, the Honorable Kimberly A. Gaab presiding. Michelle Marie Kezirian, Attorney at Law, 2335 E. Colorado Boulevard, Suite 115, Pasadena, CA 91107; Barrett Stephen Litt of McLane, Bednarski & Litt, LLP, 975 East Green Street, Pasadena, CA 91106, appeared as Class Counsel for the Representative Plaintiffs and the Settlement Class. William C. Hahesy of Law Offices of William C. Hahesy, 5260 N. Palm

Avenue, Suite 400, Fresno, CA 93704 and Linda Northrup of Northrup Schlueter Professional Law Corporation, 31365 Oak Crest Drive, Suite 250, Westlake Village, CA 91361 appeared on behalf of JOHN HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; DAVID HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership; JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership, and JCH Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership ("Defendants").

The Court having reviewed all pleadings, records and other documentation on file in this case, and good cause appearing therefor:

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED AS FOLLOWS:

- 1. This Judgment incorporates by reference the definitions in the Joint Stipulation of Settlement ("Joint Stipulation"), and all terms defined therein shall have the same meaning in this Order. The Joint Stipulation is attached hereto as Exhibit "A" and incorporated herein by reference.
 - 2. The Joint Stipulation shall be and hereby is fully and finally approved.
 - 3. The Class for settlement purposes is defined as follows:

CURRENT TENANT SETTLEMENT CLASS

The "Current Tenant Settlement Class" is defined as all individuals who, at the time of the Order Granting Preliminary Approval of this Joint Stipulation of Settlement, are current tenants (i.e., lease signatories and/or adult occupants listed on a lease) in a residential property owned or managed, in whole or in part, including through a partnership or corporation, by any of the Defendants, including JD Home Rentals and/or any of the owners of the units listed on the Properties List (as defined herein), in the City or County of Fresno, California. The list of Current Tenant Settlement Class Members compiled by JD Home Rentals is based on its review of reasonably available data. JD Home Rentals and the Defendants are not responsible in the event a person is omitted from or not included on such list. Any person omitted from such as list is not a Class Member and is not bound by this Settlement.

The Current Tenant Settlement Class Members are all those who meet the definition of the Current Tenant Settlement Class and do not opt out of the Settlement.

FORMER TENANT SETTLEMENT CLASS

The Former Tenant Settlement Class is defined as all individuals who, on or after January 9, 2010, had been, but were not as of the time of the Order Granting Preliminary Approval of this Joint Stipulation of Settlement, tenants (i.e., lease signatories and/or adult occupants listed on a lease) in a residential property owned or managed, in whole or in part, including through a partnership or corporation, by any of the Defendants, including JD Home Rentals and/or any of the owners of the units listed on the Properties List (as defined herein), in the City or County of Fresno, California. The list of Former Tenant Settlement Class Members compiled by JD Home Rental is based on its review of reasonably available data. JD Home Rentals and the Defendants are not responsible in the event a person is omitted from or not included on such list. Any person omitted from such a list is not a Class Member and is not bound by this Settlement.

The Former Tenant Settlement Class Members are all those who meet the definition of the Former Tenant Settlement Class and do not opt out of the Settlement

- 4. The Court hereby finally and unconditionally certifies the Class for settlement purposes only. In the event this Final Judgment is overturned, reversed or not affirmed in its entirety or never becomes final, the Effective Date of the Joint Stipulation does not occur or the Joint Stipulation is nullified or invalidated for any reason, the Court acknowledges that the fact that the Parties were willing to stipulate to class certification only as part of the Joint Stipulation shall have no bearing on, nor be admissible in connection with, any issue in this Action or in any other action.
- 5. The Court finds that all required notices, including the Class Notice, Newspaper Notice and website notice were given properly to Class Members in accordance with the Court's orders and that the notice was the best notice under the circumstances and satisfies all requirements of due process and California law, including under California Rules of Court, Rule 3.766 and all other applicable law.

- 6. The Court finds that the Joint Stipulation and the terms and conditions set forth in the Joint Stipulation are fair, reasonable and adequate to the Class and each Class Member and that the Joint Stipulation and its terms and conditions fully satisfy all requirements of applicable law.
- 7. The Court further finds that all Class Members who have not opted out of the Class should be and hereby are barred by the Joint Stipulation and this Final Judgment, including the releases set forth in Section 12 of the Joint Stipulation and paragraph 12 of this Final Judgment.
- 8. The Court hereby permanently enjoins, bars and forever precludes any and all Class Members (and/or all agents, representatives, or other persons acting on behalf of Releasors, or any of them) from initiating, pursuing, prosecuting in any forum (or allowing to be initiated, pursued or prosecuted in their own right or on their own behalf) any of the Released Claims in Section 12 of the Joint Stipulation (and the Amendment to Joint Stipulation) and as set forth further in paragraph 13 below.
- 9. The Court approves the amount of attorneys' fees and costs requested by Class Counsel, and orders the payment of \$1,141,185.44 as reasonable attorneys' fees and costs. This order extinguishes any and all claims for attorneys' fees, costs and expenses in this Action by Class Counsel and any other attorneys or firms who may have served or claim to have served as counsel in or relating to this Action. The Court hereby authorizes the payment of said amount in accordance with the Joint Stipulation. The Court further approves and orders that Class Counsel shall receive no more than the sum of \$70,000 for all attorneys' fees and costs after the Effective Date of the Settlement relating in any way to this Action, the Settlement or the Judgment, provided that all such fees are actually and reasonably incurred, excepting, attorneys' fees and costs incurred after the fifth Extended Repair Challenge as set forth in Section 5 of the Joint Stipulation, the final amount of which shall be agreed to by the parties or determined by Mediator Judge Wanger through an informal process he directs. The costs of Judge Wanger shall be borne by Defendants.

2

5		OCCUPANT	<u>SUM</u>
6	Α.	Occupants at 3508 S. Elm Ave., #107, Fresno, CA	,
7		Malaquias Esteves	\$40,186.00
8		Angelica Luengas	\$5,000.00
9		Jesucita Esteves	\$4,000.00
10		Pedro Santiago	\$2,500.00
11		Erika Esteves	\$4,000.00
12		Yesenia Esteves	\$4,000.00
13		Carlos Esteves	\$5,000.00
14		Mauricio Esteves	\$4,000.00
15		Jocenith Santiago	\$2,000.00
16	B.	Occupants at 230 W. Geary St., Fresno, CA	
17		Elvia Reyes	\$36,792.00
18		Hector Miranda Carbajal	\$5,000.00
19		Hector Miranda Reyes	\$3,000.00
20		Diamante Miranda	\$3,000.00
21		Miriam Miranda Reyes	\$5,000.00
22		Adrian Ventura Miranda	\$3,000.00
23		Esmeralda Ventura Miranda	\$3,000.00
24		Savannah Elvia Miranda	\$2,000.00
25		Ruby Maday Oros Miranda	\$2,000.00
26		Zayliah Medina Miranda	\$2,000.00
27	C.	Occupants at 2616 E. Washington St., Apt. 102, Fresno,	<u>CA</u>
28		Catalina Mendoza	\$20,022.00
	1	_	•

Antonio Martinez Vega	\$5,000.00
Rene Martinez	\$3,000.00
Iccel Evelina Martinez	\$3,000.00
Emily Elizabeth Martinez	\$3,000.00
Cathy Ariana Martinez	\$2,000.00
- 1 0	~ .

D. Previous Occupant of 3622 E. Clay St., Apt. B, Fresno, CA

Neng Vu \$28.000.00 Zang Moua \$5,000.00

E. Previous Occupant of 2211 W. Princeton Ave., Fresno, CA and 360 N. Roosevelt Ave., #101, Fresno, CA

Willie Thompson \$35,500.00

as the Settlement Administrator. The Court orders that the payment of the expenses of the Settlement Administrator shall be borne by Defendants; however, in the event that the settlement does not become effective for any reason and the Action continues thereafter, Defendants shall be entitled to a credit against the judgment or settlement in this Action against all sums paid or to be paid to a class or other multi-person group (except counsel or the Representative Plaintiffs) in a sum equal to fifty percent (50%) of all amounts paid by or on behalf of Defendants to the Settlement Administrator; provided, however, that the credit shall not be used in a manner that results in a judgment that causes the class or other multi-person group to owe money to the Defendants based solely on the credit.

12. The Court further orders, adjudges and decrees that Upon the Effective Date of this Settlement, the Releasors, and each of them, fully and finally release and forever discharge Releasees, and each of them, and shall be deemed to have, and by operation of the Judgment and any related order shall have expressly waived, released, discharged and relinquished the Released Claims defined below.

"Releasees" are defined as: Defendants DAVID B. HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; JOHN HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME

28

RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, individually and doing business as JD HOME RENTALS; LINDA R. HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; JJD MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATES d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; JD INVESTMENTS; J&V PROPERTIES, INC., a California corporation; BDHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; JDHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; LEHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; WRHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; JHS FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership; JCH FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership; DBH FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership, owners of the properties on the Properties List (as defined herein); and each of them, and each of their fictitious business names, dbas, current and former parent companies, affiliates, subsidiaries, divisions, trusts, limited partnerships, entities, successors, predecessors, related companies, joint ventures or partnerships, and each of their present and former employees, contractors, vendors, all persons, entities or others performing or engaged to perform any work or service relating to any of the units on the Properties List (as defined herein), Lindsay Hovannisian, John Hovannisian, Jr., John David Hovannisian, Whitney Hovannisian, officers, directors, stockholders, spouses, agents, servants, advisors, representatives, attorneys. consultants, insurers, trustees, general and limited partners, predecessors, successors, and assigns and all their heirs, executors, successors, assignees or transferees of the foregoing.

"Released Claims" means claims, demands, rights, debts, obligations, costs, expenses, wages, restitution, disgorgement, benefits of any type, equitable relief, contract obligations, statutory relief penalties, attorneys' fees, costs, interest, actions, liabilities and causes of action that were or might have been asserted (whether in tort, contract or otherwise), for violation of any state or federal law for claims that are set forth or attempted to be set forth in the Complaint in the Action which are, could be or could have been the basis of claims by the Class relating in any way to restitution, disgorgement, equitable relief, injunctive relief or other monetary relief concerning: rent, rent overcharges, rent credits, deposits, disposition of deposits, collection of rent while permitting rental units to be maintained in untenantable or

uninhabitable conditions, payment of rent or other monies for an untenantable or uninhabitable unit, expenses incurred to make repairs, and/or other lost money or property paid by a Class Member relating in any way to the condition or maintenance of the unit.

The Released Claims include, without limitation all of the following as it relates to restitution, disgorgement, equitable relief, injunctive relief or monetary relief and all of the following to the extent (and only to the extent) of the categories contained in the foregoing paragraph:

- 1. Any and all claims under Business & Professions Code Section 17200, et seq. as set forth in the First Cause of Action of the Complaint, including, but not limited to, the permitting of rental units to be maintained in untenable conditions and continue to collect rent, in violation of the Civil Code, including Sections 1941, 1941.1, 1941.3 and 1942.4 and Health & Safety Code Sections 17980, et seq., engaging in a scheme that caused, permitted and maintained untenable rental units, in violation of Civil Code Sections 1714, 1940.2, 1941, 1941.1, 1941.3, 1942.5, 1954 and the Health & Safety Code including Sections 17920.3 and 17920.10:
- 2. Any and all claims relating to lost money or property by the Class Members relating to the payment of rent or deposits relating to any of the rental units rented or offered for rent by any of the Defendants in the City and/or County of Fresno, California;
- 3. Any and all claims for injunctive relief or other relief under Business & Professions Code Section 17203;
- 4. Any and all claims set forth or attempted to be set forth in the Second Cause of Action;
- 5. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Third Cause of Action to the extent the Third Cause of Action incorporates the First and Second Causes of Action.
- 6. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Complaint that JD Homes engaged in a pattern and practice of violating the basic housing rights of its tenants by refusing to make its rental properties habitable by refusing to comply with all applicable health

and safety laws; and taking advantage of, harassing and retaliating against any tenants who exert their rights and request repairs, as alleged in Paragraph 8 of the Complaint;

- 7. Any and all claims relating in any way to any rent rebates or any other return of rent or other charges paid by any Class Member to Defendants relative to any properties rented or offered for rent during the period January 9, 2010 to the end of the Class Period;
- 8. Any and all claims that Defendants have failed to keep the properties habitable and fit for occupancy as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;
- 9. Any and all claims relating to untenantable rental property or properties not meeting the standards of California Civil Code Section 1941.1 and Health & Safety Code Sections 17920, 17920.3 and 17920.10 or other applicable law;
- 10. Any and all claims that Defendants have failed to abate untenantable living conditions after receiving notice of them from tenants and/or the City of Fresno, as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;
- 11. Any and all claims that Defendants have retaliated and/or harassed tenants, including Plaintiffs and others similarly situated, when they attempt to enforce their legal rights as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint; and
- 12. Any other claim asserted or attempted to be asserted in the Complaint, including any and all claims for injunctive relief, restitution, disgorgement, retroactive rent rebate, rent reductions, rent abatement and attorneys' fees and costs for this Action.

Notwithstanding any of the foregoing, the Released Claims do not include, and are not intended to release, damages claims for physical injury or personal injury (including but not limited to illness, mental stress, emotional distress, anxiety, annoyance and discomfort), including such damages recoverable under any of the statutes listed in sub-paragraphs 1 and 9. The Released Claims do include statutory damages recoverable under any of the statutes listed in sub-paragraphs 1 and 9, but do not otherwise include statutory damages under any other statute.

With respect to the Released Claims, the Class Members and the Representative Plaintiffs each further waive all rights and benefits afforded by section 1542 of the Civil Code

of the State of California. Section 1542 provides:

A general release does not extend to claims which the creditor does not know or suspect to exist in his or her favor at the time of executing the release, which if known by him or her must have materially affected his or her settlement with the debtor.

The Representative Plaintiffs and the Class Members agree not to sue or otherwise make a claim against any of the Releasees that is in any way related to, arises out of or is connected in any way with the Released Claims.

Stipulation, or any other pleadings, documents, orders or judgment relating thereto, is to be construed or deemed an admission of liability, culpability, negligence, or wrongdoing on the part of Defendants or any of the Releasees, and Defendants and Releasees expressly deny the same. The Parties have entered into this Joint Stipulation with the intention to avoid further disputes and litigation with the attendant inconvenience, business and personal disruption, and expenses. Defendants oppose, and continue to oppose, class or representative treatment of the Claims advanced herein if those Claims were to be litigated rather than settled pursuant to this Joint Stipulation. In the event the judgment is overturned, reversed, not affirmed in its entirety, or never becomes final, the Effective Date for this Joint Stipulation does not occur, or the Joint Stipulation is nullified or modified for any reason, Defendants do not waive any and all rights, including their right to oppose class certification of the Claims. This Joint Stipulation is a settlement document and shall be inadmissible in evidence in any proceeding, except an action or proceeding to approve, interpret, or enforce this Joint Stipulation.

Whether or not the Settlement is finally approved, neither the Settlement nor any of its terms, nor any document, statement, orders, judgments, proceeding or conduct related to this Joint Stipulation nor any accounts or reports thereof, shall in any event be:

1. Construed as, offered or admitted in evidence as, received as, or deemed to be evidence for any purpose adverse to the Releasees, including, but not limited to, evidence of a presumption, concession, indication or admission by any of the Releasees of any liability, fault, wrongdoing, omission, concession or damage; and/or

- 2. Disclosed, referred to or offered to receive in evidence against any of the Releasees, in any further proceeding in this Action, or in any other civil, criminal, administrative action or proceeding of any types, or used in any other way for any other purpose, except for the purposes of settling this Action pursuant to the terms of this Joint Stipulation, enforcing the Judgment or enforcing the release of the Released Claims;
- 14. The Court orders that a Qualified Settlement Fund, as defined in Treasury Regulations Section 1.468B-1, or other applicable law, shall be established to effectuate the terms of the Joint Stipulation and the orders of the Court, if requested by Defendants. The Court hereby finds and orders that the Qualified Settlement Fund:
- a. Shall be established pursuant to this order of the Court prior to the receipt of any monies from any Defendant.
- b. That it shall be established to resolve and satisfy the contested Claims that have resulted, or may result, from the matters that are the subject of this Action and that are released in Section 12 of the Joint Stipulation.
- c. That the contested Claims have given rise to multiple claims by the Releasors asserting liability arising out of tort, breach of contract or other violations of law; and
- d. That the fund or account be established and its assets be segregated (within a separately established fund or account) from the assets of all Defendants, and all related other persons in the meaning of Title 26, United States Code, Sections 267(b) and 707(b)(1).
- Defendants' Counsel all agree and the Court shall order that any work performed by the Inspector, Ombudsman, pest control inspector, the Mediators who assisted in settlement (Chiantelli and Wanger), any mediator used on a going forward basis, and/or the Defendants relating to the inspections and repairs, or reports or other information generated by or provided to them, shall be considered confidential, subject to the mediation privilege, if applicable, and not be used for any purpose other than solely in connection with this Action and shall not be used in or admissible in any other proceeding, except that information

pertinent to a particular unit may be used by a tenant in opposition to an unlawful detainer action or to enforce the terms of the Settlement in this Action. As a condition prior to their performing work and as part of the Court's orders approving this Settlement, the Inspector, the Ombudsman, the pest control inspector and the mediator shall execute confidentiality agreements in the form and content attached hereto as Exhibit T with Class Counsel, Defendants' Counsel, Plaintiffs, Defendants and the Class (executed by Class Counsel on their behalf) agreeing, among other things, that all work product or other information generated by, for or relating in any way to the Inspectors, pest control personnel, the Ombudsman, and/or by, for or relating to any repairs performed under this Settlement by anyone, including any of the Defendants, shall be confidential, not be used for any purpose other than solely in connection with this Action and shall not be used in or admissible in any other proceeding, except that information pertinent to a particular unit may be used by a tenant in opposition to an unlawful detainer action or to enforce the terms of the Settlement in this Action.

- 16. The Court hereby appoints Russell Cook to serve as the Ombudsman pursuant to Section 5.C. of the Joint Stipulation of Settlement and orders Defendants to pay the sums referenced therein as may be required for performance of those services.
- 17. The Court approves the Voucher program and Cash Alternative program set forth in Section 6 of the Joint Stipulation of Settlement, including the following dates:
- a. Using first class mail, the Settlement Administrator will mail the Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form to all Former Tenant Settlement Class Members. Only those Former Tenant Settlement Class Members who return a Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form to the Settlement Administrator within seventy-five (75) calendar days after its mailing will be eligible to participate in the Voucher or Cash Alternative programs. Within sixty (60) calendar days of the Effective Date of the Settlement, the Settlement Administrator will send by first class mail the Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form to all Former Tenant Settlement Class Members.

///

b. Only those Former Tenant Settlement Class Members who return a			
Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form to the Settlement Administrator within seventy-			
five (75) calendar days after its mailing ("75-day Claim Period") will be eligible to participate			
in the Voucher or Cash Alternative terms discussed above. Any Former Tenant Settlement			
Class Claim Form (1) not postmarked by the end of the 75-day Claim Period, (2) not received			
by the Settlement Administrator by the fifth (5th) calendar day after the 75-day Claim Period			
(or, if timely postmarked but lost in the mail and delivered no later than 90 calendar days after			
the end of the 75-day Claim Period). Any Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form (1) not			
postmarked by the end of the 75-day Claim Period, (2) not received by the Settlement			
Administrator by the fifth (5 th) calendar day after the 75-day Claim Period; (3) not received by			
other means by the Settlement Administrator by the end of the 75-day Claim Period (4) not			
signed by the Class Member under penalty of perjury; and/or (5) that does not otherwise			
comply with the claims process is not considered a valid Former Tenant Settlement Class			
Claim Form. Any Former Tenant Class Member who submits a Former Tenant Settlement			
Class Claim Form that is not considered timely and valid will not be entitled to participate in			
the Voucher or the Cash Alternative terms set forth above.			
c. The Settlement Administrator will use reasonable best efforts to locate			

and send the Class Notice and Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form to the most recent address of said Former Tenant Settlement Class Member. The Settlement Administrator shall be responsible for taking reasonable steps, consistent with its agreed job parameters and any court orders, to trace the address of any Former Tenant Settlement Class Member for whom a Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form are returned by the post office as undeliverable. These reasonable steps shall include, at a minimum: tracking of all undelivered mail; performing additional address searches using additional address databases or equivalent means for all mail returned without a forwarding address; and promptly re-mailing to Class Members for whom new addresses are found. Any returned envelopes with forwarding addresses will be utilized by the Settlement Administrator to trace Class Members.

EXHIBIT A

	[Counsel listed on following two pages]	
1		
2		
3	·	•
4		
5		
6		
7	SUPERIOR COURT	OF CALIFORNIA
8	COUNTY O	F FRESNO
9		
10	NENG VU, et al.,	Case No. 14 CE CG 00062
11	Plaintiffs,	JOINT STIPULATION OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT
12	i initias,	
13	ν.	
14	JOHN HOVANNISIAN, et al.,	
15		
16	Defendants.	J.
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		•

u j	
	There was not be the first of t
مو. پيد	975 East Green Street 2335 E. Colorado Blvd., Suite 115
3	
4	T: (626) 844-7660 T: 626-817-6341 F: 626-628-2151
5	Parish transport the said
6	Julius C. Thompson, #198450 Kenneth M. Greenstein, #201224 Bet Tzedek Legal Services Greenstein and McDonald
7	3250 Wilshire Blvd., 13th Floor 300 Montgomery St., Suite 621
8	Los Angeles, CA 90010-1577 San Francisco, CA 94104
9.	1:415-773-1240
	Email: ithompson@hettzedek.org Email: ken@greensteinmcdonald.com
10	De Trades Hindele
11	Dean Preston, #184545 Tenants Together
12	474 Valencia Street, Suite 156
13	San Francisco, CA 94103 T: 415-495-8100
14	Email: dean@tenantstogether.org
15	Attorneys for Plaintiffs
16	North T. Winspid, 4110640 District T Nintellian, 4000002
•	Mark L. Kincaid, #118640 Benjamin T. Nicholson, #239893 Kincaid & Associates McConnick, Barstow, Sheppard, Wayte &
17	1851 E 1st Street, Suite 900 Carruth LLP
18	Santa Ana, CA 92705 7647 N. Fresno Street T: 714-955-6995 Fresno, CA 93720
19	F: 714-784-2546 T: 559-433-1300
20	Email: mkincaid@mkincaidlaw.com F: 559-433-2300 Email: ben.nicholson@mccomickbarstow.com
21	
22	Attorneys for Defendants DAVID HOVANNISIAN, an individual and dba JD HOMB RENTALS, BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, an individual and dba JD HOME RENTALS,
23	BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	

	William C. Habany #105742
	For Office of William C. II.
	225 W. Shaw Avenue, Suite 105
3	Fresno, CA 93704 T: 559-579-1230
4	F: 559-579-1231
5	Email: bill@hahesylaw.com
6	
7	RENTALS, JHS Family Limited Partnership and JCH Family Limited Partnership
8	Linda Northrup, #102156
9	Northrup Schlueter, A Professional Law Corporation
10	Westlake Village, CA 91361
	T: 818-707-2600 F: 818-707-2675
11	Email: <u>Inorthrup@nsple.com</u>
12	Attorneys for Defendants JOHN HOVANNISIAN, an individual and dba JD HOME
13	RENTALS, JHS Family Limited Partnership and JCH Family Limited Partnership
14	
15	
16	1
17	<u> </u>
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
41	

25

26

27

28

This Joint Stipulation of Settlement ("Joint Stipulation") is made and entered into by and between Defendants JOHN HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; DAVID HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOMB RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership; JHS Pamily Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership; and JCH Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership and DOES 1 - 100 ("Defendants"), on the one hand, and Plaintiffs NENG VU; WILLIE THOMPSON; ELVIA REYES; CATALINA MENDOZA; ANTONIO MARTINEZ; and MALAQUIAS ESTEVEZ (the "Representative Plaintiffs"), on the other hand, on behalf of themselves and on behalf of all putative Class Members (as defined below), to be certified for settlement purposes only as provided for in this Joint Stipulation, in the action pending in the Superior Court of the State of California, Fresno County (the "Court"), Case No. 14 CB CG 00062 (the "Action") and subject to the terms and conditions hereof. This Joint Stipulation is subject to approval of the Court and is made for the sole purpose of attempting to consummate settlement of this Action on a class-wide basis subject to the following terms and conditions. By entering into this Joint Stipulation, Defendants do not make any admissions, including that the Action is properly certified as a class action. As detailed below, in the event the Court does not enter an order granting preliminary and final approval of the Joint Stipulation or the condition precedents are not met for any reason, this Joint Stipulation shall be void and shall be of no force or effect whatsoever.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

4	SECTION 1 – DEFINITIONS 1
Ĩ	3 (
24	1. "Action"
5	5
6	
7	
8	
9	6. "Class Counsel"
10	7. "Class Lîsts"
11	8. "Class Member(s)" or "Members of the Class"
12	9, "Class Notice"
13	10. "Class Period"
14	11. "Complaint"
15	12, "Court"
16	13. "Current Tenant Settlement Class" or "Current Tenant Settlement
17	Class Members ³²
18	14. "Defendants"3
19	15. "Defendants' Counsel"3
20	16. "Effective Date"
21	17. 'Final Approval Hearing' 4
22	18. "Final Approval of the Settlement"
23	19. "Former Tenant Settlement Class" or "Former Tenant Settlement
24	Class Members 4
25	20. "Former Tenants' Settlement Class Claim Form"
26	21. "Inspection Notice"6
27	22. "Inspected Unit",6
28	23. "JD Home Rentals"6
-	24. "Joint Stipulation", 6

1	25. "Judgment"6
2	26 "Mediator"
3	27 "Newspaper Notice"
4	28. "Objection Deadline"
5	29. "Ont-Out Deadlines"7
6	30. "Order Granting Preliminary Approval"
7	31 "Parties"
8	32 "Plaintiffs"
9	33. "Press Release"
10	34. "Release"
	35. "Released Claims"8
11	36 "Releasees"
12	37. "Releasors"
13 14	38 "Rent Freeze"8
- '	39 "Representative Plaintiffs"9
15	40. "Settlement"
16 17	41 "Settlement Administrator"9
	42. "Voucher."
18	SECTION 2 – BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF THE ACTION9
19	A. Plaintiffs' Complaint9
20	B. Class Counsel's Investigation and Opinions
21	C. Defendants' Denials of Liability
22	D. Bona Fide Dispute and Cooperation
23	E. No Injunctive Relief
24	SECTION 3 - GENERAL PROVISIONS
25	A. Conditional Settlement Certification
26	B. No Admission of Liability14
27	C. Confidential and Privileged Nature of Work
28	

	D. No Right to Appeal
5	SECTION 4 - CLASS NOTICE AND OPT OUT
3	A. Information Regarding Class Members
Z	B. Distribution of Class Notice
3	C. Opt-out Provisions
6	D. Defendants' Nullification Rights
7	SECTION 5 – INSPECTION AND RENT FREEZE TERMS RELATING TO
8	CURRENT TENANT SETTLEMENT CLASS
9	A. Introduction
10	B. Inspection/Repair Process for Units
1:1	1. Units Subject to Inspection
12	2. Notice to Current Tenant Settlement Class Members
13	3. The Inspector
14	4. Creation of Inspection List and Initial Inspection Schedule
15	5. Inspection/Repair Process for Units
1.6	6. Checklist and Inspection/Repair Process
17	7. Extended Repairs
18	8. Tenant Challenge
19	C. The Ombudsman
20	SECTION 6 – TERMS RELATING TO FORMER TENANT SETTLEMENT CLASS 36
21	A. Voucher Program36
22	B. Cash Alternative
23	C. Claim Process for Former Tenant Settlement Class Members
24	SECTION 7 – OTHER SETTLEMENT TERMS RELATING TO PEST
25	CONTROL AND TERMINATION OF TENANCIES41
26	A. Furnigation and Pest Remediation
27	B. Limitations on Tenancy's Terminations
28	

	SECTION 8 - THE SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATOR
ر. ب	A. Duties of Settlement Administrator
7	B. Other Provisions
.4	SECTION 9 – OBJECTIONS TO JOINT STIPULATION
Į.	A. Objection Procedure45
6	SECTION 10 - SETTLEMENT OF REPRESENTATIVE PLAINTIFFS'
7	INDIVIDUAL CLAIMS AND CLAIMS BY OTHER OCCUPANTS46
8	SECTION 11 - ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS
9	SECTION 12 - RELEASES
10	A. Definition of Released Claims
' 11	B. Waiver of Civil Code Section 1542 as to Released Claims
12	SECTION 13 – DUTIES OF THE PARTIES PRIOR TO COURT APPROVAL
13	A. Stipulation for Preliminary Approval
14	SECTION 14 – DUTIES OF THE PARTIES CONCERNING FINAL COURT
15	APPROVAL59
16	SECTION 15 - CONTINUING JURISDICTION
17	SECTION 16 - OTHER PROVISIONS
18	A. Enforcing/Voiding the Agreement
19	B. Mutual Full Cooperation60
20	C. No Prior Assignments
21	D. Attorneys' Fees
22	E. Notices,
23	F. Construction61
24	G. Captions and Interpretations
25	H. Modification
26	I. Integration Clause
27	J. Binding on Assigns
28	K. Class Counsel Signatories

	1 I., Counterparts
, d	M. Choice of Law and Forum
ź	O. Publicity
5	P. Privacy of Documents and Information
, 6	Q. Invalidity of any Provision
7	R. Representative Plaintiffs' Waiver of Right to Opt Out and Object64
8	TABLE OF EXHIBITS
9	Exhibit A - Inspection Notice
10	Exhibit B - Notice of Date and Time of Inspection
11	Exhibit C - Checklists:
12	Cover Page
13	Exterior Checklist
14	Interior Checklist
15	Exhibit D - Notice of Repair Completion
16	Exhibit E - Settlement Administrator Quarterly Report Form
17	Exhibit F - Extended Repair FormF-1
18	Exhibit G - Deadline Form to Challenge Extended Repair Form
19	Exhibit H - Extended Repair Challenge Form
20	Exhibit I - Inspector's Notice of Impasse
21	Exhibit J - Settlement Administrator's Notice of Deadline to File Court Challenge
22	Exhibit K - Press Release
23	Exhibit L - General Release by Representative Plaintiff/Other OccupantsL-1 to L-5
24	Exhibit M - Class Notice
25	Exhibit 1 to Exhibit M - Release Language
26	Exhibit N - Former Tenant Settlement Class Member Claim Form
27	Exhibit O - Newspaper Notice
28	Exhibit P - [Proposed] Preliminary Approval Order

	Exhibit Q - Final Judgment and OrderQ-1 to Q-14
1	Exhibit R - Voucher
2	Exhibit S - Notice re: OmbudsmanS-1
3	Exhibit S - Notice re: Ombudsman
4	Exhibit T - Confidentiality AgreementT-1 to T-3
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	/
12	
13	•
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
4	
25	
7	
8	

γi

SECTION 1 - DEFINITIONS

For the purposes of this Joint Stipulation, the following terms shall carry the following accompanying definitions. To the extent terms of phrases used in this Joint Stipulation are not specifically defined below, but are defined elsewhere in this Joint Stipulation, they are incorporated by reference into this definitions section.

1. "Action."

The action entitled Neng Vu, et al., individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated v. JOHN HOVANNISIAN, an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; DAVID HOVANNISIAN, an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership; JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership; JCH Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership and DOES 1-100, Case No. 14 CE CG 00062, pending in the Superior Court for the State of California, Fresno County.

2. "Administrative Expenses."

All court-approved costs and expenses associated with the Settlement Administrator.

- 3. "Checklist." Checklist means the Checklist attached hereto as Exhibit C.
- 4. "Claims." All claims referenced in the Release in Section 12 of this Joint Stipulation.

5. "Class."

Consists of the Former Tenant Settlement Class Members and the Current Tenant Settlement Class Members which are defined infra.

6. "Class Counsel."

Michelle Marie Kezirian, Attorney at Law, 2335 E. Colorado Blvd., Suite 115, Pasadena, CA 91107; Dean Preston of Tenants Together, 995 Market Street, Suite 1202, San Francisco, CA 94103; Barrett Stephen Litt of Kaye, McLanc, Bednarski & Litt, LLP, 975 East Green Street Pasadena, CA 91106; Kenneth M. Greenstein of Greenstein and McDonald, 300 Montgomery Street, Suite 621, San Francisco, CA 91404; and Julius C. Thompson of Bet Tzedek Legal Services, 3250 Wilshire Boulevard, 13th Floor, Los Angeles, CA 90010.

7. "Class Lists."

7.

12.

The list or lists prepared by JD Home Rentals setting forth the Current Tenant
Settlement Class or Current Tenant Settlement Class Members and the Former Tenant
Settlement Class or Former Tenant Settlement Class Members. These lists are based on the
review by JD Home Rentals of reasonably available data. JD Home Rentals and the Defendants
are not responsible in the event a person is omitted from or not included on a list.

8. "Class Member(s)" or "Members of the Class."

Consists of the Former Tenant Settlement Class Members and the Current Tenant Settlement Class Members.

9. "Class Notice"

The Court-approved form of notice to Class Members, substantially in the form attached as Exhibit M hereto, which will, among other things, notify Class Members of the preliminary approval of the Settlement and scheduling of the Final Approval Hearing. This notice will also be translated into Spanish, Hmong and Lao.

10. "Class Period."

The period from January 9, 2010, through the date of the Opt Out Deadline.

11. "Complaint."

The Complaint (or any amended complaint) filed by the Representative Plaintiffs in this Action.

12. "Court."

The Fresno County Superior Courl.

13. "Current Tenant Settlement Class" or "Current Tenant Settlement Class Members,"

The "Current Tenant Settlement Class" is defined as all individuals who, at the time of the Order Granting Preliminary Approval of this Joint Stipulation of Settlement, are current tenants (i.e., lease signatories and/or adult occupants listed on a lease) in a residential property owned or managed, in whole or in part, including through a partnership or corporation, by any of the Defendants, including ID Home Rentals and/or any of the owners of the units listed on

the Properties List (as defined herein), in the City or County of Fresno, California. The list of Current Tenant Settlement Class Members compiled by JD Home Rental is based on its review of reasonably available data. JD Home Rentals and the Defendants are not responsible in the event a person is omitted from or not included on such list. Any person omitted from such a list is not a Class Member and is not bound by this Settlement.

The Current Tenant Settlement Class Members are all those who meet the definition of the Current Tenant Settlement Class and do not opt out of the Settlement.

14. "Defendants."

JOHN HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; DAVID HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership; JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership; and JCH Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership. The definition of Defendants includes JD Home Rentals.

15. "Defendants' Counsel."

Benjamin T. Nicholson of McCormick Barstow, LLP, 7647 North Fresno Street, P.O. Box 28912, Fresno, CA 93729-8912; William C. Hahesy of Law Offices of William C. Hahesy, 225 W. Shaw Avenue, Suite 105, Fresno, CA 93704; Mark L. Kincaid of Kincaid & Associates, LLP, 1851 East First Street, Suite 900, Santa Ana, CA 92705; and Linda Northrup of Northrup Schlueter Professional Law Corporation, 31365 Oak Crest Drive, Suite 250, Westlake Village, CA 91361.

16. "Effective Date."

The Effective Date of the Settlement shall be the date when all of the following events have occurred: (a) this Joint Stipulation has been executed by the Representative Plaintiffs, Class Counsel, Defendants and Defendants' Counsel; (b) the Court has given preliminary approval to the Joint Stipulation; (c) notice has been given to the Class Members providing them with an opportunity to opt out of the Settlement; (d) the Court has held a Final Approval Hearing and entered a final order and judgment certifying the Current Tenant Class and the

Former Tenant Class and approving this Joint Stipulation; and (e) the later of the following events: (i) the date on which the period for filing any appeal, writ, or other appellate proceeding opposing the Settlement has lapsed without any appeal, writ or other appellate proceeding having been filed; or (ii) the date of the dismissal of any appeal, writ, or other appellate proceeding opposing the Settlement with no right to pursue further remedies or relief; or (iii) the date of the issuance of such other final appellate order upholding the Court's final order with no right to pursue further remedies or relief. The Effective Date of the Settlement shall be no earlier than sixty (60) calendar days from the date of entry of the Judgment.

17. "Final Approval Hearing."

The final hearing at which the Court approves the Settlement.

18. "Final Approval of the Settlement"

The date of the Final Approval Hearing where the Court finally approves the Settlement.

19. "Former Tenant Settlement Class" or "Former Tenant Settlement Class Members."

The Former Tenant Settlement Class is defined as all individuals who, on or after January 9, 2010, had been, but were not as of the time of the Order Granting Preliminary Approval of this Joint Stipulation of Settlement, tenants (i.e., lease signatories and/or adult occupants listed on a lease) in a residential property owned or managed, in whole or in part, including through a partnership or corporation, by any of the Defendants, including JD Home Rentals and/or any of the owners of the units listed on the Properties List (as defined herein), in the City or County of Fresno, California. The list of Former Tenant Settlement Class Members compiled by JD Home Rental is based on its review of reasonably available data. JD Home Rentals and the Defendants are not responsible in the event a person is omitted from or not included on such list. Any person omitted from such a list is not a Class Member and is not bound by this Settlement.

28 | ///

Ĭ.

The Former Tenant Settlement Class Members are all those who meet the definition of the Former Tenant Settlement Class and do not opt out of the Settlement.

Current tenants who move between the filing date of the Order Granting Preliminary
Approval of the Settlement and the Effective Date of the Settlement shall not be considered
Former Tenant Settlement Class Members for purposes of sending class notice and being
provided the option to opt out as Former Tenant Settlement Class Members. They will have
received notice as a Current Tenant Settlement Class Member. However, for these individuals,
ID Home Rentals will notify the Settlement Administrator within fifteen (15) calendar days of
the Effective Date of the Settlement of the tenants who have so moved out and the Settlement
Administrator shall mail them a Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form, which they must
send to the Settlement Administrator as set forth below in Section 6 and as ordered by the
Court if they wish to participate in the Voucher or Cash Alternative program available to
Former Tenant Settlement Class Members. Such individuals shall not have a further right to
object or opt out as they had that opportunity as Current Tenant Settlement Class Members.
These tenants may at times be referred to as "Current Tenants Who Moved," but will, for
purposes of this Joint Stipulation and membership in the proposed Class, still be considered
Current Tenant Settlement Class Members.

Current tenants who did not opt out, who were current tenants at the time of the Effective Date of the Settlement, and who requested an inspection, but moved out of their unit before receiving their requested inspection, shall have the right to participate in the Cash Alternative program upon the same terms as Former Tenant Settlement Class Members including the timing of the payment. However, for purposes of this Joint Stipulation and membership in the proposed Class, these tenants still will be considered Current Tenant Settlement Class Members. For these individuals, JD Home Rentals will compile a list every sixty (60) calendar days of the names and last-known or known forwarding addresses of these individuals and send it to the Settlement Administrator. Within thirty (30) calendar days of receipt of that list, the Settlement Administrator will mail them a Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form, which they must return to the Settlement Administrator within forty-five

g

4

3

5

7

9

10

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24 25

26

27 28 (45) calendar days of the mailing if they wish to participate in the Cash Alternative program available to Former Tenant Settlement Class Members.

Current tenants who did not opt out, who were current tenants at the time of the Effective Date of the Settlement, but who did not request an inspection, and therefore received the immediate benefit of the rent freeze available to such persons (or some portion thereof), shall not have the right to participate in the Voucher or Cash Alternative program. For purposes of this Joint Stipulation and membership in the proposed Class, these tenants will still be considered Current Tenant Settlement Class Members.

20. "Former Tenants' Settlement Class Claim Form."

A proof of claim in substantially the form as Exhibit N attached hereto. This form will also be translated into Spanish, Hmong and Lao,

21. "Inspection Notice."

Inspection Notice means the Notice attached hereto as Exhibit A. This form will also be translated into Spanish, Hmong and Lao.

22. "Inspected Unit."

Inspected Unit refers to a specific unit inspected pursuant to the terms of Section 5.B of this Joint Stipulation of Settlement.

23. "JD Home Rentals."

Defendant JD Home Rentals and/or any successor, assignee and/or delegatee.

24. "Joint Stipulation"

This Joint Stipulation of Settlement, including all exhibits.

25. "Judgment."

A final order and judgment issued by the Court following the Final Approval Hearing, with content substantially identical to Exhibit Q attached hereto.

26. "Mediator."

The term "Mediator" (when capitalized) for purposes of this Joint Stipulation refer to Hon. Oliver Wanger (Ret.). At times, this Joint Stipulation refers to "mediator" (not capitalized), in which case it refers to a professional mediator retained to assist the parties in

	1
1	re
2	th
3	or
4	Es
5	
б	
7	ot
8	E
9	
10	
11	no
12	fil
13	
14	
15	th
16	
17	
18	id
19	
20	
21	М
22	

24

25

26

27

28

ij

resolving specified case issues on a going forward basis. When the term "mediator" is used in this Joint Stipulation, the use of said mediator will be at the sole option of Defendants and his or her services will be paid for by Defendants. The Parties agree to propose James Phillips, Esq. to be the mediator, subject to Court approval.

27. "Newspaper Notice."

The Court-approved notice to be published as set forth in the Joint Stipulation or as otherwise ordered by the Court. A copy of the proposed Newspaper Notice is attached hereto as Exhibit O.

28. "Objection Deadline."

The date set by the Court by which all objections to the Joint Stipulation and all written notices of intent to appear as described more fully in Section 9 of the Joint Stipulation must be filed and served as set forth therein.

29. "Opt-Out Deadlines."

The date by which a Class Member must exclude himself or herself from the Class in the manner provided in Section 4 of this Joint Stipulation or order of the Court.

30. "Order Granting Preliminary Approval."

The order preliminarily approving the Joint Stipulation, with content substantially identical to Exhibit P attached hereto.

31. "Parties."

The Representative Plaintiffs, Class Members, Current Tenant Settlement Class Members, Former Tenant Settlement Class Members and Defendants.

32. "Plaintiffs."

The Representative Plaintiffs, the Class, the Class Members, Current Tenant Settlement Class Members and Former Tenant Settlement Class Members.

33. "Press Release."

The Press Release refers to the Press Release attached hereto as Exhibit K.

34. "Release"

The provisions of Section 12 of this Joint Stipulation.

1

2

5

7

8

10

11 12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24

25 26

27

28°

35. "Released Claims."

The claims released as more fully set forth in Section 12 of this Joint Stipulation.

36. "Releasees."

Defendants DAVID B. HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS: JOHN HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, individually and doing business as JD HOME RENTALS; LINDA R. HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; JJD MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATES d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; JD INVESTMENTS; J&V PROPERTIES, INC., a California corporation; BDHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; JDHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; LEHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; WRHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; JHS FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership; JCH FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership; DBH FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership, owners of the properties on the Properties List (as defined herein); and each of them, and each of their fictitious business names, dbas, current and former parent companies, affiliates, subsidiaries, divisions, trusts, limited partnerships, entities, successors, predecessors, related companies, joint ventures or partnerships, and each of their present and former employees, contractors, vendors, all persons, entities or others performing or engaged to perform any work or service relating to any of the units on the Properties List (as defined herein), Lindsay Hoyannisian, John Hoyannisian, Jr., John Dayid Hovannisian, Whitney Hovannisian, officers, directors, stockholders, spouses, agents, servants, advisors, representatives, attorneys, consultants, insurers, trustees, general and limited partners, predecessors, successors, and assigns and all their heirs, executors, successors, assignees or transferees of the foregoing.

37. "Releasors."

All Class Members, all Current Tenant Settlement Class Members, all Former Tenant Settlement Class Members and the Representative Plaintiffs.

38. "Rent Freeze."

Rent Freeze means that the rent charged for a particular unit occupied by a Current

Tenant Settlement Class Member as of the date of the Final Approval Hearing, shall not be increased for a period of eight (8) months thereafter.

39. "Representative Plaintiffs,"

Plaintiffs NENG VU; WILLIE THOMPSON; ELVIA REYES; CATALINA MENDOZA; ANTONIO MARTINEZ VEGA; and MALAQUIAS ESTEVES.

40. "Settlement."

The terms and conditions set forth in the Joint Stipulation.

41. "Settlement Administrator,"

The Settlement Administrator approved by the Court.

42. "Voucher." The Voucher to be provided to Former Tenant Settlement Class Members, a proposed copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit R. The Voucher will also be translated into Spanish, Hmong and Lao.

SECTION 2 - BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF THE ACTION

A. Plaintiffs' Complaint

This Joint Stipulation briefly summarizes the allegations of the Complaint, but is not intended to be exhaustive. This Joint Stipulation applies to all claims and the underlying facts alleged in the Complaint.

The Complaint alleges that:

- I. The Plaintiffs are or were tenants or authorized occupants in rental properties located in the City and County of Fresno, California, and owned or managed by one or more of the Defendants, in whole or in part, either directly or through an entity of some kind (e.g., partnership, limited liability company), which Plaintiffs assert are managed by ID Home Rentals.
- 2. ID Home Rentals is a fictitious business name for a property management company that is owned and operated and/or managed by one or more Defendants, and manages the properties presently or previously occupied by the Representative Plaintiffs and the putative class(es), which portfolio constitutes one of the largest providers of residential property in California. (As used in this summary by Plaintiffs, ID Homes Rentals and

J,

- 3. ID Home Rentals maintains a huge portfolio of untenantable housing, which it rents to tenants without bringing the units into compliance with applicable health and safety laws; fails to timely respond to requests for repairs; makes inadequate, cosmetic repairs when it does make them, whether sought or requested by tenants or government agencies; and often retaliates against tenants who complain or seek repairs by raising the rent or otherwise harassing and intimidating the tenants.
- 4. ID Home Rentals rents to vulnerable income tenants, who have few housing options and are affaid to assert their rights; fails to invest sufficient money into repair and maintenance to have Defendants' properties in tenantable condition, so as to maximize their profits; and rents grossly substandard housing.
- 5. Defendants acquire untenantable properties, list them as available, let them stand vacant unless and until a tenant applies to rent one, and promise to repair them within two weeks of a tenant filing a rental application, but only perform cosmetic repairs.
- The Plaintiffs and the putative class have suffered from dilapidated, untenantable, unsafe, dangerous and/or substandard conditions in their homes, including but not limited to; severe roach infestations; substantial mold growth; collapsed ceilings; water-damaged walls, ceilings and flooring; lack of proper security in common areas; criminal activity in common areas; non-original construction without proper permits; corroded piping; leaking roofs; long standing, pervasive and visibly dilapidated sink and bathtub enamel; evidence of raw sewage leakage; out-of-date fire extinguishers; unsanitary construction debris blocking emergency means of egress for habitable space; unprofessional, unfinished, and failed work on window repairs evidenced by leakage and damage; rust and corrosion around metal window frames; loose ground connectors on outlets near sinks constituting shock and fire hazards; large holes in walls constituting a fire hazard and allowing vermin to enter; undermined walkways due to improper irrigation and ensuing erosion; rotted, cracked, loose, and detaching wood material on windows; rain gutters clogged with dead plant growth; defective downspouts which both cause and aggravate mold conditions and excessive

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

dampness in buildings; large stains on ceilings consistent with water intrusion from a failed roof; evidence of painting and caulking as a means of abatement of previous mold growth; plumbing lines missing flanges at entry point, allowing moisture and vermin into structures; and stagnant water and other liquids in outdoor common areas with visible mosquito larvae; visible structural damage, including bowed walls and ceilings, large holes in ceilings, and sinking floors; extensive water damage to ceilings, floors, and areas under and around sinks, showers, and toilets; excessive and visible mold on ceilings, floors, and walls; leaking pipes connected to sinks and toilets; improperly installed and loose toilets; kitchen and bathroom flooring that is old, cracking, and corroded; carpeting that is old, dirty, matted, stained, and constitutes a trip hazard; dilapidated kitchen and bathroom cabinetry, with doors off hinges or otherwise inoperable; non-working appliances, heaters, and air-conditioning units; inadequate and exposed lighting; exposed light sockets and electrical wiring; missing or inoperable closet doors; doors that do not fit properly into door jambs; non-working locks on doors and windows; broken, inoperable, missing, and/or uninsulated windows; non-working smoke alarms; non-existent carbon monoxide detectors and alarms; unstable and unsafe walkways; unstable and unsafe balconies; leaking and damaged roofs; lack of adequate weather protection; filthy and unsafe common areas; and infestation by cockroaches, bedbugs, mice, rats, and/or other vermin. Plaintiffs contend that the defective conditions in the rental properties were not caused by the wrongful or abnormal use of the premises by tenants or by anyone acting on the authority of tenants.

- 7. Defendants have had knowledge of the foregoing conditions and have not taken proper steps to abate them, leaving the properties in a state of extreme neglect and disrepair.
- 8. Defendants have a pattern and practice of engaging in the above listed conduct and maintaining their properties in unsafe, untenantable and/or substandard conditions within the meaning of various California Health & Safety Code and California Civil Code housing statutes, all of which constitute unlawful and unfair business practices within the meaning of Business and Professions Code Sections 17200 et seq.

<u>2</u>7

9. The Representative Plaintiffs and other JD Homes tenants in Fresno have experienced the following harms, among others: having to pay rent for an untenantable unit; incurring expenses for making their own repairs; incurring expenses for medical bills and the cost of treatment; sustaining physical injuries including respiratory problems, allergies, infections, bites from vermin, insomnia, depression, and anxiety; and suffering from extreme emotional distress including fear, frustration, humiliation, and hopelessness, for which they prayed for compensatory and punitive damages, and for pre and post-judgment interest.

On behalf of the classes, Representative Plaintiffs sought a variety of forms of relief including injunctive relief, appointment of a receiver, a rent rebate, and attorneys' fees. On behalf of the Representative Plaintiffs individually (as opposed to for the Class), Representative Plaintiffs asserted the tort of negligent maintenance of the premises and sought compensatory damages, punitive damages, pre-and post-judgment interest and other relief.

B. Class Counsel's Investigation and Opinions.

Class Counsel has conducted a significant investigation of the facts and law during the prosecution of this Action. Such investigation has included, *inter alta*, the exchange of information pursuant to informal discovery, interviews with many JD Home Rentals tenants in addition to the Named Plaintiffs, and hiring an inspector to inspect some of the JD Home Rentals units. Class Counsel has further investigated the applicable law as applied to the facts discovered regarding the causes of action and damages claimed in the Action and the potential defenses thereto. In addition, the Parties engaged in multiple sessions of mediated negotiations of this dispute with two different professional mediators experienced in class actions, including at least five in-person sessions and several additional phone sessions between the parties, some with the participation of a professional mediator and some without. The first Mediator was Hon. Alfred G. Chiantelli (Ret.), with whom two in-person sessions were done, and the second was Hon. Oliver Wanger (Ret.), with whom the remaining in-person sessions were done involving all or some of the parties and/or others. Judge Wanger also met separately, in person and by telephone with each side on several occasions, and had several joint telephone conferences involving both sides.

б

22²

11/

Class Counsel is of the opinion that the Joint Stipulation is fair, reasonable, adequate, and is in the best interest of the Current Tenant Settlement Class and Former Tenant Settlement Class in light of all known facts and circumstances, including the risk of significant delay and the numerous defenses and arguments Defendants are asserting. Class Counsel has fully advised the Representative Plaintiffs of this Joint Stipulation and represents that each approves of and consents to this Joint Stipulation.

C. Defendants' Denials of Liability.

Defendants have denied and continue to deny the claims asserted or attempted to be asserted in this Action. Defendants further deny any and all other claims raised, asserted or attempted to be asserted in the Action. Defendants have asserted and continue to assert defenses to this Action and have expressly denied and continue to deny any wrongdoing or legal liability arising out of the Action. Neither the Joint Stipulation nor any action taken to carry out the Joint Stipulation is or may be construed as or used as an admission, concession, or indication by or against Defendants or anyone else of any fault, wrongdoing, liability whatsoever or agreement that a class action is appropriately asserted here.

D. Bona Fide Dispute and Cooperation.

The Parties desire fully, finally, and forever to settle, compromise, and discharge all Claims arising from or related to the Action, as more particularly set forth in Section 12 of this Joint Stipulation. The Parties agree that a bona fide dispute exists concerning the relief requested by the Plaintiffs, the Class, the Current Tenant Settlement Class and the Former Tenant Settlement Class in this Action. The Parties agree to cooperate and to take all steps reasonable, necessary and/or appropriate to effectuate this Joint Stipulation.

E. No Injunctive Relief.

Defendants shall not be required as part of the Joint Stipulation to enter into any consent decree nor shall Defendants be required to agree to or be subject to any provision for injunctive relief. Any recourse Plaintiffs may have regarding an alleged breach of this Joint Stipulation are solely those set forth in this Joint Stipulation and in the Judgment.

SECTION 3 - GENERAL PROVISIONS

A. Conditional Settlement Certification.

The Representative Plaintiffs shall seek conditional certification of the Class, which certification is and will be for the sole purpose of this Joint Stipulation and the settlement of this Action only. Should the Joint Stipulation not become final or the Effective Date of the Joint Stipulation not occur for whatever reason, any class certification as part of or related in any way to the Joint Stipulation shall become null and void *ab initio* and shall have no bearing on, and shall not be admissible in connection with, the issue of whether or not certification is or would be appropriate in a non-settlement context, including in this Action or any other action. Defendants expressly reserve their rights and declare that each opposes and intends to oppose class certification vigorously should this Joint Stipulation not become final.

B. No Admission of Liability.

As a material term of this Settlement and to be included as part of the Judgment entered herein, nothing contained herein, nor the consummation of this Joint Stipulation, or any other pleadings, documents, orders or judgment relating thereto, is to be construed or deemed an admission of liability, culpability, negligence, or wrongdoing on the part of Defendants or any of the Releasees, and Defendants and Releasees expressly deny the same. The Parties have entered into this Joint Stipulation with the intention to avoid further disputes and litigation with the attendant inconvenience, business and personal disruption, and expenses. Defendants oppose, and continue to oppose, class or representative treatment of the Claims advanced herein if those Claims were to be litigated rather than settled pursuant to this Joint Stipulation. In the event the judgment entered pursuant to this Joint Stipulation is overturned, reversed, not affirmed in its entirety, or never becomes final, the Effective Date for this Joint Stipulation does not occur, or the Joint Stipulation is nullified or modified for any reason in a manner unacceptable to Defendants, Defendants do not waive any and all rights, including their right to oppose class certification. This Joint Stipulation and the Judgment are settlement documents and shall be inadmissible in evidence in any proceeding, except an action or proceeding to approve, interpret, or enforce this Joint Stipulation.

1 2

3 4 5

6 7

8

9 10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

. 24

25

26

27

20°

Whether or not the Settlement is finally approved, neither the Settlement nor any of its terms, nor any document, statement, orders, judgments, proceeding or conduct related to this Joint Stipulation nor any accounts or reports thereof, shall in any event be:

- a. Construed as, offered or admitted in evidence as, received as, or deemed to be evidence for any purpose adverse to the Releasees, including, but not limited to, evidence of a presumption, concession, indication or admission by any of the Releasees of any liability, fault, wrongdoing, omission, concession or damage; and/or
- b. Disclosed, referred to or offered to receive in evidence against any of the Releasees, in any further proceeding in this Action, or in any other civil, criminal, administrative action or proceeding of any types or used in any other way for any other purpose, except for the purposes of settling this Action pursuant to the terms of this Joint Stipulation, enforcing the Judgment or enforcing the release of the Released Claims and the claims released by the Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants.

C. Confidential and Privileged Nature of Work

As a further material term of the Settlement, the Parties, Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel all agree and the Court shall order that any work performed by the Inspector, Ombudsman, pest control inspector, the Mediators who assisted in settlement (Chiantelli and Wanger), any mediator used on a going forward basis, and/or the Defendants relating to the inspections and repairs, or reports or other information generated by or provided to them, shall be considered confidential, subject to the mediation privilege, if applicable, and not be used for any purpose other than solely in connection with this Action and shall not be used in or admissible in any other proceeding, except that information pertinent to a particular unit may be used by a tenant in opposition to an unlawful detainer action or to enforce the tenns of the Settlement in this Action.

As a condition prior to their performing work and as part of the Court's orders approving this Settlement, the Inspector, the Ombudsman, the pest control inspector and the mediator shall execute confidentiality agreements in the form and content attached hereto as Exhibit T with Class Counsel, Defendants' Counsel, Plaintiffs, Defendants and the Class

(executed by Class Counsel on their behalf) agreeing, among other things, that all work product or other information generated by, for or relating in any way to the Inspectors, pest control personnel, the Ombudsman, and/or by, for or relating to any repairs performed under this Settlement by anyone, including any of the Defendants, shall be confidential, not be used for any purpose other than solely in connection with this Action and shall not be used in or admissible in any other proceeding, except that information pertinent to a particular unit may be used by a tenant in opposition to an unlawful detainer action or to enforce the terms of the Settlement in this Action.

D. No Right to Appeal.

Neither the Representative Plaintiffs nor Defendants shall have any right to appeal any order or judgment finally approving this Joint Stipulation so long as the final approval and Judgment by the Court is consistent with all the terms of this Joint Stipulation.

SECTION 4: CLASS NOTICE AND OPT OUT

A. Information Regarding Class Members

Within sixty (60) calendar days following the date of entry of the Court's Order Granting Preliminary Approval, Defendants, through JD Home Rentals, shall provide the Settlement Administrator only with the following information for each Former Tenant Class Member whom JD Home Rentals has been able to locate based on its review of its data reasonably available in JD Home Rentals' electronic records or from the information obtained by JD Home Rentals from hard copy records prior to execution of this Joint Stipulation: first and last names, last-known address, social security number, and driver's license number. By the same deadline above, for Current Tenant Class Members, only the name and current address need be provided since, by definition, their current address is correct. Neither JD Home Rentals nor Defendants shall be responsible in the event a person is omitted from or not included on a list. In the event of an omission, said person or persons will not be part of the Class.

-1/1

2 11:

.5

20.

B. Distribution of Class Notice

Within sixty (60) calendar days of receipt of the above-referenced information, the Settlement Administrator will send by first class mail the Class Notice to all Class Members. In addition to sending the Class Notice by first class mail, the Newspaper Notice shall be published in English and Spanish in The Fresno Bee and Vida En La Valle, respectively, at least one time per week for four weeks or as otherwise ordered by the Court. Furthermore, the Class Notice shall be available on a website established by the Settlement Administrator beginning no later than the date that the Settlement Administrator first mails the Class Notice as referenced above.

The Settlement Administrator will use reasonable best efforts to locate and send the Class Notice to the most recent address of each Class Member. The Settlement Administrator shall be responsible for taking reasonable steps, consistent with its agreed job parameters and any court orders, to trace the address of any Class Member for whom a Class Notice is returned by the post office as undeliverable. These reasonable steps shall include, at a minimum: tracking of all undelivered mail; performing additional address searches using additional address databases or equivalent or other available means for all mail returned without a forwarding address; and promptly re-mailing to Class Members for whom new addresses are found. Any returned envelopes with forwarding addresses will be utilized by the Settlement Administrator to trace Class Members.

The Settlement Administrator shall provide updates to Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel at least every two weeks of (1) the number of undeliverable notices, if any; (2) the number of opt-outs, if any; and (3) the number and content of objections received, if any.

It will be conclusively presumed that, if an envelope has not been returned within thirty (30) calendar days of the date of mailing, the Class Member received the Class Notice.

Within fifteen (15) business days after the close of the Opt-Out Deadline, the Settlement Administrator will provide to Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel a declaration including a statement of due diligence and proof of mailing of the Class Notice to the Class Members, publication of the Newspaper Notice, a statement as to the number of opt-outs received and a

-11

22.

statement of the number of objections received. Class Counsel shall provide this information to the Court in the motion for final approval of this Joint Stipulation.

Nothing in this Settlement shall grant Class Counsel any permission to review any Class List provided to the Settlement Administrator. The Class List shall be kept confidential by the Settlement Administrator and not disclosed to anyone absent a further order of the Court after hearing. The Settlement Administrator shall maintain the Class List for a period of ten (10) years. The Settlement Administrator will provide Defendants and Defendants' Counsel with written verification that all persons set forth on the Class List were provided notice as ordered by the Court. The verification will include as an attachment the Class List.

C. Opt-out Provisions.

The Class Notice shall provide that Class Members who wish to opt-out of the Settlement must send a written notice to the Settlement Administrator requesting to opt-out of the Settlement Class on or before the applicable Opt-Out Deadline. The Parties agree to request an Opt-Out Deadline that is sixty (60) calendar days after the first mailing of the Class Notice. Such written notice to opt-out (1) must contain the name, address, social security number of the person seeking to opt-out, and home telephone number, if any; (2) must be returned to the Settlement Administrator at the specific address referenced in the Class Notice; (3) and must be postmarked (if mailed) or received (if otherwise delivered) by the Settlement Administrator on or before the applicable Opt-Out Deadline.

Any Class Member who properly requests to opt out will not be entitled to participate in the Settlement and will not be bound by the Joint Stipulation or have any right to object, appeal, or comment thereon.

Class Members who fail to submit a valid and timely request to opt-out shall be bound by all terms of the Joint Stipulation, including the releases, and any Final Judgment entered in the Action if the Joint Stipulation is finally approved by the Court.

Prior to the Opt-Out Deadline, any Class Member who has elected to opt-out may withdraw that election by notifying the Settlement Administrator in writing that he or she wishes to be a Class Member.

3 4 5

///

Ш

The Settlement Administrator shall maintain records, including copies of the submitted materials, of all withdrawn opt-outs and all opt-outs and objections.

Within ten (10) business days following the Opt Out Deadline, the Settlement
Administrator shall provide Defendants' Counsel with a complete list of all Class Members
who have timely requested to opt-out of the Class, as well as a copy of all documents received.

D. Defendants' Nullification Rights.

In the event that more than thirty-five (35) Class Members timely request to opt-out, each Defendant will have the option, in his/its sole discretion, to nullify this Joint Stipulation. If any Defendant so elects, it will notify Class Counsel and the Court of its election within twenty (20) business days after actual receipt of the complete list of all person who timely request to opt-out.

SECTION 5: INSPECTION AND RENT FREEZE TERMS RELATING TO CURRENT TENANT SETTLEMENT CLASS

A. Introduction

This Section relates to the Current Tenant Settlement Class. Pursuant to the terms of this Joint Stipulation, the Current Tenant Settlement Class will have the option of an inspection of the unit a tenant occupies or a Rent Freeze for a period of eight months after the Final Approval Hearing. In addition, for a period of two years after the Effective Date of the Settlement or expiration of the applicable budget set forth below, the Current Tenant Settlement Class and others will have access to an Ombudsman to receive complaints about repair and maintenance matters, as more particularly set forth below. Furthermore, a pest control inspector will perform a single pest control inspection and assessment and treatment of each unit occupied by the Current Tenant Settlement Class as provided further below. Finally, for a period of 12 months after the Effective Date of the Settlement, JD Home Rentals will not terminate any tenancy except for good cause as discussed below.

B. Inspection/Repair Process for Units

1. Units Subject to Inspection.

Defendants will prepare a list of all their Fresno County units ("Properties List"). This list will set forth the address for each unit in Fresno County that is not vacant or not in the eviction process and the number of leased bedrooms for each unit. Units located in Fresno County and owned or managed, in whole or in part, including through a partnership or corporation, by any of the Defendants shall be included on the list. The list will be provided solely to the Settlement Administrator, who shall keep said list in strict confidence and not disclose it to anyone. Defendants shall provide to the Court and Class Counsel a certification under penalty of perjury that all units located in Fresno County and owned or managed, in whole or in part, by any of the Defendants are included on the confidential list. The list does not include personal residences occupied by any of the Defendants.

The list will be provided to the Settlement Administrator within thirty (30) calendar days of the Effective Date of the Settlement. The certification set forth above will also be provided within thirty (30) calendar days of the Effective Date of the Settlement.

This list will exclude the units currently occupied by the Representative Plaintiffs.

Through their counsel, the Representative Plaintiffs have communicated to Defendants'

Counsel any repairs that the Representative Plaintiffs believe are needed prior to execution of this Joint Stipulation. The repairs have been performed and the Representative Plaintiffs have approved the work prior to the execution of the Joint Stipulation.

2. Notice to Current Tenant Settlement Class Members

As part of the Settlement, the Parties, with the assistance of the Mediator, have also agreed to certain provisions regarding a Current Tenant Settlement Class Member's decision to request an inspection. Specifically, the Settlement includes a provision under which Current Tenant Settlement Class Members have the right, after the Effective Date of the Settlement, to request an inspection of their unit by an Inspector who will determine whether, and what, repairs are needed for the unit, Said Inspector will be a qualified, independent inspector who is not a regular employee of any of the Defendants and who has been agreed to by the parties to

this Joint Stipulation in advance of the signing of this Joint Stipulation. Normal maintenance repair requests and response will continue to be made available to Current Settlement Class members whether or not they request an inspection. The normal maintenance repair requests and responses are not part of the terms of this Settlement, however.

Within thirty (30) calendar days of receipt of the Properties List and the list of Current Tenant Settlement Class Members, the Settlement Administrator will mail the Inspection Notice to all Current Tenant Settlement Class Members. If a copy of the Inspection Notice is not returned by a Current Tenant Settlement Class Member within forty-five (45) calendar days of its mailing ("Inspection Notice Period"), the unit will not be inspected under this Settlement.

The determination of whether or not to request an inspection shall be made by the Current Tenant Settlement Class Member personally, or in consultation with co-habitants, family members or close personal friends, or by seeking advice from the Settlement Administrator, Class Counsel or counsel of their own choosing other than Class Counsel, After such consultation, the Current Tenant Settlement Class Member must personally conclude in good faith that there may be the types of problem conditions described in the Inspection Notice before requesting an inspection. The Inspection Notice to be provided to the Current Tenant Settlement Class Member who requests an inspection state under oath that he or she made such an independent determination.

During the Inspection Notice Period, Current Tenant Settlement Class Members may contact Class Counsel, but Class Counsel, including Kaye, McLane, Bednarski & Litt; Bet Tzedek Legal Services; Tenants Together, Greenstein and McDonald; Michelle Marie Kezirian, and all of their agents and employees, agree not to initiate contact with (but may respond to contact by) Current Tenant Settlement Class Members from the date of execution of this Joint Stipulation up until the end of the Inspection Notice Period without approval of the Court for good cause shown or agreement of the Parties and their counsel.

Class Counsel will not knowingly canvass, organize, mail or conduct other direct outreach at any of the units or with Current Tenant Settlement Class Members covered by this Settlement from the date of execution of this Joint Stipulation up until the end of the Inspection

25

26

27

28

Notice Period, but instead will rely on the Inspection Notice to inform tenants of their rights under the Settlement. Notwithstanding the foregoing, this provision does not include any unsolicited contact with any Current Tenant Settlement Class Member who, on their own initiative, seeks assistance for any reason at a regular clinic conducted no more than once per month by Tenants Together as a regular, ongoing activity by Tenants Together independently of Defendents or JD Home Rentals at a regular location in the City or County of Fresno, California during the Inspection Notice Period. Tenants Together may operate said regular tenant clinic and to engage in its normal outreach for such clinics and other organizing activities, which consists generally of the following: distribution of organizational brochure referrals to and from Tenants Together Statewide Hotline, emails to Tenants Together members and supporters, flyer distribution at nonprofit and community partner locations, tabling at community events, referrals from legal services and other non-profit service providers, advertisement in the Community Alliance and other media outlets, letters to the editor, billboards, bus signs, television and radio public service announcements and stories in media outlets (all hereinafter referred to as "Outreach Materials or Activities"); provided, however, from the date of execution of this Joint Stipulation and up until the end of the Inspection Notice Period, none of Tenants Together's Outreach Materials or Activities will refer to or mention ID Home Rentals, any of the Defendants, this Settlement or this Action except as set forth below:

- A. Within thirty (30) calendar days of the Preliminary Approval Hearing Order, Plaintiffs and their counsel may hold a press conference to announce the settlement, but will confine their comments to the contents of the Press Release attached as Exhibit K. In connection with that press conference, Plaintiffs and their counsel may distribute a single Press Release, and contact press regarding it or respond to press inquiries concerning it, but will confine their comments accompanying that distribution to the contents of the Press Release.
- B. Within thirty (30) calendar days of the Preliminary Approval Hearing Order, the Parties and their counsel may distribute a single Press Release concerning the above-referenced press conference, and respond to press inquiries regarding it, but will confine their

- comments accompanying that distribution to be consistent with the contents of the Press Release.
- C. The Parties and their counsel may respond to press or other public inquiries, and answer their questions; in doing so, their responses shall be consistent with the contents and limitations of the Press Release (Exhibit K).
- D. Tenants Together's email outreach materials may only refer to or mention JD Home Rentals, any of the Defendants, the Settlement or this Action once in any given promotional email communication to supporters so long as the communication is not targeted at JD Home Rentals' tenants or knowingly distributed to JD Home Rentals' tenants. Any such references shall be limited to language contained in the Press Release.
- B. Tenants Together's physical documents that are distributed at Outreach Activities (as defined above) within Fresno County shall not refer to or mention JD Home Rentals, any of the Defendants, the Settlement or this Action.
- F. Tenants Together's physical documents that are distributed at Outreach Activities (as defined above) outside of Fresno County may refer to or mention ID Homes, any of the Defendants, the Settlement or this Action once in any given Activity so long as the communication is not targeted at ID Home Rentals' tenants or knowingly distributed to ID Home Rental tenants. Any such references shall be limited to language contained in the Press Release.
- G. During the above-referenced period, Tenants Together's Outreach Materials or
 Activities will not include advertisement in the Community Alliance or other media
 outlets, letters to the editor, billboards, bus signs, television and radio public service
 announcements and stories in media outlets that mention JD Home Rentals, any of the
 Defendants, the Settlement, or this Action.
- H. Nothing in this Joint Stipulation does or shall prevent Bet Tzedek Legal Services from operating tenant clinics outside the City and County of Fresno, or from mentioning or referring to this case or this settlement in any of its Outreach Materials under the same

.5 რ

7 8

23.

III

standards as those applicable to Tenants Together in Sections D-G above.

Except as provided herein, JD Home Rentals and the Named Plaintiffs' and Class Counsel will restrict their public statements to the press regarding the Action or the Settlement to the contents of the Press Release during the period from the date of the Preliminary Approval Hearing Order to the end of the Inspection Notice Period, and will not initiate statements to the press beyond the Press Release; provided, however, that during said period JD Home Rentals may respond to inquiries from the press or other social media sources and make comments beyond the Press Release; provided further, however, if JD Home Rentals makes comments to the press or other social media sources during said period, the Plaintiffs and their Counsel may respond and will not be limited in their response to the contents of the Press Release or this Joint Stipulation. Nothing in this Agreement is intended to limit any communications by Defendants or any Class Member with any governmental agency.

To the extent a tenant initiates contact with Class Counsel, Class Counsel's advice to a Current Tenant Settlement Class Member about how to proceed with the request for inspection shall be consistent with the guidelines and standards approved and ordered by the Court and set forth in the Inspection Notice to be sent to Current Tenant Settlement Class Members regarding their right to seek an inspection, which essentially summarizes conditions identified by the relevant California codes.

For those Current Tenant Settlement Class Members who do not want their unit inspected, the notice will include information about a telephone number to call for any repairs if they believe they have any needed repairs. For those Current Tenant Class Settlement Members who do not return the Notice, they will receive the Rent Freeze.

Nothing in this Settlement shall grant Class Counsel any permission to review any class list provided to the Settlement Administrator. The class list shall be kept confidential by the Settlement Administrator and not disclosed to anyone absent a further order of the Court after hearing.

3

3. The Inspector

The inspector will be Beam & Company, Inc. (hereinafter referred to as "Inspector"), which has been selected to perform inspections pursuant to the Checklist, subject to Court approval. The Inspector will endeavor to provide sufficient inspection staff to be able to likely complete all inspections within 18 months of commencement of the Inspection Schedule. The costs of the Inspector will be borne by Defendants.

4. Creation of Inspection List and Initial Inspection Schedule

Within thirty (30) calendar days after the final date for return of the Inspection Notice, the Settlement Administrator will prepare and provide to Defendants only a list of all returned notices, setting forth the names and addresses of the Current Tenant Class Members ("Inspection List"). Defendants shall not retaliate in any form against a tenant for requesting an inspection; however, notwithstanding the foregoing, nothing herein shall be construed as limiting in any way the exercise by Defendants of their rights under any lease or agreement or any law pertaining to the hiring of property or of their right to do any acts permitted under the law for any lawful cause.

Within thirty (30) calendar days after receipt of the Inspection List by Defendants, through JD Home Rentals, the Inspector or Inspectors will meet, develop and provide to the Settlement Administrator an initial schedule for the conduct of the inspections, including proposed dates and times for the inspections ("Initial Inspection Schedule"). To the extent consistent with existing law, the Settlement Administrator shall mail a notice to the tenants at least 14 calendar days before the date of inspection advising them of the date and time of the inspection in a form attached hereto as Exhibit B. Said notice will be in English, Spanish, Hmong and Lao. The notice will advise the tenant that, if they desire not to have their unit inspected at that date and time, they must advise the Settlement Administrator in writing by no later than seven calendar days prior to the date of the inspection, and must provide three or more dates and times (within normal business hours, Monday through Friday) that would be suitable for an inspection. Absent such timely notice from the tenant or if the tenant either refuses or declines to permit the inspection or otherwise does not make the unit available for

inspection by being personally present at the date and time set by the Inspector, said unit shall not be inspected.

The inspections shall begin no later than thirty (30) calendar days from the time of development of the Initial Inspection Schedule by Defendants and the Inspector of Inspectors provided for herein.

5. Inspection/Repair Process for Units

The inspections shall begin no later than thirty (30) calendar days from the time of development of the Initial Inspection Schedule by Defendants and the Inspector,

The Inspector will inspect units as set forth below and, to the extent needed or required. Defendants will repair those units, subject to their right to remove any unit from the rental market in lieu of repairs if the estimated cost of the repairs exceeds 36 months' rent for the subject unit.

In the event a unit is removed from the market in lieu of repairs. Defendants agree to pay as relocation costs to the affected tenants the following sums based on the number of leased bedrooms in a unit: \$1,000 for a one-bedroom unit; \$1,500 for a two-bedroom unit; and \$2,000 for a three-bedroom or more unit. This amount is per unit and not per tenant. Unless it presents a safety hazard for tenants to remain in the unit, the tenant will have 90 days' notice before s/he has to move out of the unit; if it does present a safety hazard, the tenant will be immediately relocated to another JD Home Rentals unit (which the tenant can have the option to remain in). In addition to the relocation amounts set forth above, for those situations where tenants cannot remain in a unit while repairs are being made to address a safety hazard and thus must be relocated to a different unit. Defendants will provide the further sum for relocation expenses for each type of unit in the following amount: \$400 for a one-bedroom unit; \$475 for a twobedroom unit; and \$550 for a three-bedroom or more unit. These additional sums are per unit and not per tenant.

While the tenant is residing in the new unit and up until the original unit is available again for occupancy, the tenant shall pay all costs and charges; including rent, that the tenant last paid while occupying the original unit unless the rent for the relocated unit is less than the

23

25

26

23

25

26

27

28

rent for the unit to be repaired, in which case the tenant shall pay the rent for the relocated unit. If a tenant with children occupants must be relocated due to removal of a unit from the rental market or due to a safety hazard. JD Home Rentals will make a reasonable effort to seek to relocate the tenant to a vacant JD Homes Rental unit of the same type within the same school district, provided such a unit is available. The tenant will be provided the same relocation costs for the move to the new unit as set forth above. If the tenant decides to return to the original unit when it is available again for occupancy, JD Home Rentals will provide the tenant with the same relocation costs as set forth above for the return move. If the tenant does not return to the original unit when it is available again for occupancy, the tenant shall execute a new lease agreement for the new unit and shall be responsible for paying all rent and charges that the tenant is responsible for under the new lease agreement.

A unit is defined by a single door (i.e., a single occupancy area, such as an apartment within a complex, single family residence, etc.). For purposes of this Settlement, "unit" means a separate single leased unit. For example, if an apartment complex has five two-bedroom apartments within the apartment complex, each two-bedroom apartment is a "unit."

6. Checklist and Inspection/Repair Process.

The Checklist will be used for the inspections. The Inspector shall diligently and thoroughly complete the Checklist for each of the Inspected Units. The Inspector shall not require any repairs that are not consistent with all applicable building and safety codes for the particular unit. Defendants may challenge any Extended Repairs (as defined herein) as set forth below.

Defendants may have a representative present during the inspections to observe and answer questions and to ask his or her own questions to clarify any of the inspection items or requested repairs, respond to questions or provide information. The Defendants' representative who will be present during the inspections shall sign a statement that they understand their function is solely as described above. The inspector(s) shall have the right to determine that the particular Defendants' representative is interforing with the inspection and to advise Defendants that the individual is not to participate in future inspections. The inspector will be

advised that he or she has this right.

The Inspector shall provide a copy of the Checklists for the completed inspections to the mediator (if used at the election of Defendants) and the Settlement Administrator at the end of each week during which inspections were performed. The mediator (if used) will examine the Checklists to ensure that they are completed consistent with the terms of the Joint Stipulation. Within seven (7) calendar days after being advised by the mediator that the Checklists are completed consistent with the terms of the Joint Stipulation, the Settlement Administrator shall mail the received Checklists to JD Home Rentals and Defendants' Counsel. If a mediator is not used for these purposes, the Settlement Administrator shall mail the received Checklists to JD Home Rentals and Defendants' Counsel within seven (7) calendar days of receipt of them.

After receipt of each completed Checklist, JD Home Rentals shall promptly prepare a brief written repair action plan for any repairs called for by the Checklist, which shall include a proposed date for completion of any repairs. Each month, JD Home Rentals will provide the Settlement Administrator a spreadsheet that lists the units under repair or repaired to date and the projected or actual completion date of the repairs. Each month the Settlement Administrator will compare that spreadsheet against the completed Checklists it has received to determine if all units are accounted for on the spreadsheet. In the event any unit is not accounted for, the Settlement Administrator will advise Defendants' Counsel.

The repairs shall be completed diligently in accordance with the specific physical and structural needs, all applicable building and safety codes for the particular unit and the circumstances called for by the repairs described by the Inspector in the Checklist. After completing the repairs, JD Home Rentals will provide the Current Tenant Settlement Class. Members (or, if they are no longer residing in the unit, the then current residents) with a notice in the form attached hereto as Exhibit D. This notice will be in English, Spanish, Hmong and Lao.

On a quarterly basis after the inspections have commenced, the inspector will provide a list to the Settlement Administrator of inspections that have been completed and ID Home

Rentals will provide the Settlement Administrator with a list of the units for which repairs have been completed or for which no repairs were required. Using that information, the Settlement Administrator shall prepare a report in the form attached hereto as Exhibit E and provide said report to Defendants' Counsel and Class Counsel.

The Settlement Administrator shall advise Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel when all inspections and repairs as set forth herein are completed.

7. Extended Repairs

The Inspector will be provided access to the remaining portions of the premises or entire complex as the Inspector deems necessary to perform the inspection for the specific Inspected Unit, subject to any notices being given to tenants or others that may be required by law. If during the course of the inspections of any Inspected Unit within a complex having twoto-15 units or over-15 units, the Inspector determines that the repair of a specific Inspected Unit requires a repair that extends beyond that specific Inspected Unit (i.e., to another unit or the complex as a whole), the Inspector shall prepare a written report setting forth the specific repair and the reasons therefor. As used herein, such repairs noted by the Inspector that extend beyond the specific Inspected Unit being inspected shall be referred to as "Extended Repairs." The Inspector shall prepare a report on Exhibit F setting forth the specific repairs required and all reasons therefor, a copy of which shall be provided to the mediator (if used at the election of Defendants) and Defendants' counsel. The mediator will examine the report to ensure it is prepared consistent with the terms of the Joint Stipulation. If the report is prepared consistent with the terms of the Joint Stipulation, the mediator shall so advise Defendants' counsel, who shall then forward a copy of the report to the Settlement Administrator. This report shall be known as the "Extended Repair Form." If a mediator is not used, the Inspector shall forward a copy of the report directly to the Settlement Administrator.

Defendants may challenge an Extended Repairs determination. The challenge procedure is set forth below. If Defendants do not challenge that determination, JD Home Rentals will make the repairs subject to its right to remove a unit from the rental market as set forth herein.

24

25

26

27

The Inspector shall provide the Extended Repair Form as set forth above. Within seven (7) calendar days of receipt of the Extended Repair Form, the Settlement Administrator shall mail that form to JD Home Reutals and Defendants' Counsel. The mailing shall include a notice in the form of Exhibit G notifying JD Home Reutals of the deadline to challenge an Extended Repair Form as set forth below. The deadline shall be thirty (30) calendar days from the date of this mailing to JD Home Rentals and Defendants' Counsel. The Settlement Administrator will also notify designated Class Counsel by email of the date of mailing of this form, without providing the form to Class Counsel. After receipt of the Extended Repair Form, JD Home Rentals, without counsel, may first challenge an Extended Repair Form by discussing the matter initially with the Inspector. If as a result of the discussion, the Inspector withdraws the Extended Repair Form, the Inspector shall prepare a brief report setting forth the initial recommendation, the challenge, the resolution and a brief summary of the reasons therefor. A copy of the report shall be provided to the Settlement Administrator and counsel for Class and Defendants.

In lieu of or in addition to initially discussing the Extended Repair Form with the Inspector, JD Home Rentals may also challenge an Extended Repair Form by completing a written challenge form (the "Challenge Form") attached hereto as Exhibit H, which shall concisely but with specificity set forth the position of JD Home Rentals on the need for or advisability of the repairs noted in that Checklist, or any other pertinent or relevant positions on the determination. A challenge may be made on any basis, including, but not limited to, the need for, reasonable alternatives to, advisability of, and economic cost-effectiveness of the recommended repairs. By the deadline, JD Home Rentals will mail the Challenge Form to the Settlement Administrator and the Designated Class Counsel. A challenge will be considered timely made if the mailing is postmarked by the deadline. In the event JD Home Rentals did not receive an Extended Repair Form in due course after mailing by the Settlement Administrator, the deadline to challenge shall begin on the date of actual receipt of the form by JD Home Rentals. After mailing the Challenge Form, JD Home Rentals, the Inspector and Class counsel shall seek informally to resolve the challenge within seven business days. If JD Home Rentals,

27

28

the Inspector and Class Counsel are able to resolve the challenge, the Inspector shall prepare a brief report setting forth the resolution and a brief summary of the reasons therefor, a copy of which shall be provided to JD Home Rental's and Class Counsel within seven business days after such agreement. If JD Home Rentals, the Inspector and Class Counsel cannot informally resolve the challenge within the seven-day time period set forth in the above paragraph, the matter will be deemed to be at an impasse by the Inspector. The Inspector shall issue a Notice of Impasse in the form attached hereto as Exhibit I, which shall be sent to the Settlement Administrator. Within seven (7) calendar days of receipt of the Notice of Impasse, the Settlement Administrator will mail Exhibit I attached hereto to JD Home Rentals, Defendants' Counsel and Class Counsel.

If JD Home Rentals determines to further challenge any Extended Repairs Form, it shall, within thirty (30) calendar days of mailing of the Notice of Impasse, file with the Court or Special Master, if appointed, a motion challenging the Extended Repairs for decision by the Court or Special Master. The motion shall be served on the Inspector and Class Counsel. JD Home Rentals has the burden to prove that the repair is not reasonably necessary or that another repair will resolve the issue. In addition to the moving papers and the Extended Repair Form, the parties in any such review proceeding shall have the right to submit no more than two (2) declarations, each of no more than three (3) pages, supporting their position. If JD Home Rentals submits an expert declaration, the Inspector may be permitted to review that expert's declaration and, if the Inspector agrees to do so in his or her sole discretion, provide a written response under oath to that declaration. The funding by JD Home Rentals for such work shall be limited to two hours of time compensated at the inspector's regular hourly rate. If the Inspector declines to provide a written response, the Inspector shall prepare a brief report as to the reason or reasons. If JD Home Rentals submits an expert or expert declarations and the Class oppose such declaration or declarations using a counter declaration or declarations by an expert or experts, the Class, if JD Home Rentals does not prevail in the challenge, may seek payment from ID Home Reutals for the amount the Class actually paid their expert or experts up to the amount that JD Home Rental's actually paid to its opposing expert or experts who

countered the expert or experts offered by the Class. The Court or Special Master, in its discretion in response to a request by any party, may allow oral testimony at the hearing on this matter. If an expert is permitted to testify on behalf of JD Home Rentals, then the Inspector may also testify on behalf of the tenant, the cost of which shall be borne by JD Home Rentals up to a maximum of two hours of time compensated at the inspector's regular hourly rate, plus any travel time. JD Home Rentals or the tenant may offer such evidence as is relevant and material to the dispute. Conformity to legal rules of evidence shall not be necessary. The Court or Special Master shall determine the admissibility, relevance and materiality of the evidence and may exclude evidence deemed by the Court or Special Master to be cumulative or irrelevant. The Court or Special Master shall take into account applicable principles of legal privilege, such as those involving the confidentiality of communications between a lawyer and client. The Extended Repair Form will not be subject to a hearsay objection based on the fact that it was prepared out of court or is not sworn; however, the Court or Special Master will have discretion to strike portions of the Extended Repair Form pursuant to the standards set forth above.

The attorneys' fees paid to Class Counsel in connection with this Settlement include monies allocated as attorneys' fees payable for up to five (5) Extended Repair challenges made by JD Home Rentals under this Section. No attorneys' fees shall be sought or awarded to Class counsel for any and all attorneys' fees incurred relating in any way to up to five (5) challenges made by JD Home Rentals under this Section, and Defendants shall not be entitled to claim any right to a refund of any attorney's fees on the ground that they did not exercise up to five (5) Extended Repair challenges. In the event that JD Home Rentals initiates more than five (5) challenges under this Section, Class Counsel (or any Designated counsel) may seek recovery of their attorneys' fees as permitted by law (other than under Civil Code Section 1717), with the hourly rate for said fees capped at \$350 per hour. Class Counsel (or Designated counsel) shall have up to six months from the date of the decision on the challenge to file a motion for attorney's fees. The decision of the Court will be final and non-appealable.

In the event that Class Counsel seek recovery of fees pursuant to the immediately above paragraph and relies on the provisions of Code of Civil Procedure Section 1021.5, ID Home Rentals will not oppose such motion on the basis that Class Counsel have not shown that the relief did not confer a significant benefit on the general public or a large class of persons. By so agreeing, ID Home Rentals is not making any admissions that the relief conferred a significant benefit on the general public or large class of persons, but rather is making this agreement solely for purposes of this settlement only and reserves the right to oppose the motion on all other bases, including all other bases under Code of Civil Procedure Section 1021.5. It is further agreed that the term "Class Counsel" as used above refers both to Class Counsel of record and any counsel not of record that Class Counsel of record designates.

8. Tenant Challenge

A tenant shall have no right to challenge any repairs called or not called for in a

A tenant shall have no right to challenge any repairs called or not called for in a Checklist, or any work relating thereto. Rather, the tenant, if not satisfied with the repairs made pursuant to the inspections, may contact the Ombudsman within thirty (30) calendar days of the completion of the subject repairs, setting forth concisely and specifically the reasons for the dissatisfaction with the repairs. The Ombudsman will handle this complaint as set forth below. In addition, nothing in this Agreement precludes the tenant from contacting any government agency if s/he deems it appropriate to do so.

C. The Ombudsman.

The Parties have selected Russell Cook, Esq. as a tenant ombudsman to receive complaints about repair and maintenance matters, subject to Court approval. This person will be independently contracted for this role and will not be a full-time employee of any Party hereto. This individual will establish a hotline for communications to him or her, and will be bi-lingual in both Spanish and English or use the language resources as set forth below. Defendants are responsible for payment of the sums set forth below in this section relating to the Ombudsman.

The duties of the Ombudsman will be to receive and endeavor to resolve complaints from a tenant or tenants relative to repairs and maintenance of units managed by ID. Home

1 2 3

4 5

28,

28.

Rentals. The Ombudsman will not be designated as the initial intake person for receipt of repair or maintenance requests from tenants. ID Home Rentals will continue to receive requests for repair or maintenance in the first instance.

The Ombudsman will commence acting in that capacity only after the Effective Date of the Settlement. S/he shall serve for a two-year term or exhaustion of the agreed budget between the parties, whichever occurs first. The Ombudsman's budget shall be a total of \$60,000 for the two-year term, exclusive of telephone and interpretative services provided for in the following paragraphs.

During the Ombudsman's period of service, the Ombudsman will establish a telephone number that will be paid by JD Home Rentals up to an agreed monthly amount of \$150.

To the extent possible, the non-English speaking tenants will seek the assistance of adult family members or other third parties available to them to translate or interpret as needed in order to communicate with the Ombudsman. To the extent needed, the Ombudsman will have the authority up to a monthly dollar amount of \$750 to engage verbal interpretation services from an agreed upon interpreting service or services for purposes of assisting the Ombudsman's own communication with non-English speaking tenants. Because it is anticipated that usage volume may be heavier in the initial months, the Ombudsman will have the authority to use up to three months of interpreter service budget (\$2,250) in advance during the first year of his/her tenure.

In the event that the actual monthly expense amount for verbal interpretation services exceeds three months' advance usage (i.e., \$2,250 in advance), the Ombudsman may, for good cause shown, after meeting and conferring with Defendants' Counsel and Class Counsel, apply to the Court to increase the budgeted amount by an amount not to exceed 50% of the initial monthly budgeted amount of \$750. The Ombudsman will use his or her own counsel in seeking the increase, whose reasonable fees will be reimbursed by JD Home Rentals in an amount not to exceed \$300 per hour.

In the event that the Ombudsman requires additional verbal interpretive services whose costs will exceed the average sum of \$1,125 per month after seeking and receiving an increase

23.

from the Court as set forth above, the Ombudsman will first exhaust the monthly budget using the outside language services (e.g., Language Line) and then proceed to use JD Home Rentals representatives to provide said services to the extent such language services are available. Prior to providing the language services, each JD Home Rentals representative who performs said services will sign and date a document to be provided to the Ombudsman which states as follows:

I, ________, understand that I have been requested to provide verbal interpretive services to assist communications between the Ombudsman and current tenants. I agree that to the best of my ability I will in good faith seek to fully and accurately translate those communications from ________ into English and English into _______ In doing so, I understand that it is not my job or purpose to advance anyone's interests, including my employer's, and that I am not to disagree or dispute what the tenant says, even if I do disagree with it. I understand that, in providing translation, I am assisting the Ombudsman to ensure that what the tenant says is correctly and accurately communicated. I understand that, if I do not fully and accurately provide translation, I will not be requested to provide said services in the future."

The Ombudsman will have the discretion not to use or continue to use any particular JD Home Rentals person to perform said services if she/he determines, in his or her sole discretion, that the person is not performing satisfactorily.

If the Ombudsman determines at the end of one year of his or her service that his or her need for verbal interpretative services cannot be met using the budgeted amount for outside services and with the supplementation provided by a JD Home Rentals person, Defendants' Counsel and Class Counsel, after notice from the Ombudsman, will meet and confer, with the participation of the Ombudsman, in an effort to seek to negotiate a further budgeted amount. If Plaintiffs' counsel and Defendants' Counsel cannot agree within fifteen (15) calendar days of said notice on a further budgeted amount, the Ombudsman, using his own counsel and subject to the reimbursement of fees as set forth above, may apply to the Court for an increase in the

23.

budgeted amount. The Ombudsman will be required to show good cause for any increase. In determining whether good cause exists and in what amount to authorize for additional verbal interpretative services, the Court will consider the need for such additional services, whether there are less costly alternatives that would meet the need and the reasonableness of the added cost in relationship to the benefit conferred by provision of the added verbal interpretive services. In no event shall the budget for verbal interpretative services exceed a total sum of \$30,000.00.

The Settlement Administrator will issue a notice by mail to all then-existing signatory tenants advising them of the identity of the Ombudsman, the contact information and duties. (See Exhibit S.) This notice will be in English, Spanish, Hmong and Lao. All new tenants during the Ombudsman's period of service will receive the same notice directly from JD Home Rentals.

The Ombudsman will maintain a record of all complaints and disposition thereof. At three-month intervals over the two-year period, the Ombudsman will issue a brief report to both Plaintiffs' counsel and Defendants' counsel that identifies all pending complaints that have not been resolved as of the date of the report after exhaustion of all efforts by the Ombudsman. The form of this report must be agreed to by the parties.

The monetary sums set forth in this Section relating to the Ombudsman and related items shall be paid by Defendants.

SECTION 6: TERMS RELATING TO FORMER TENANT SETTLEMENT CLASS

For the Former Tenant Settlement Class Members, Defendants agree to provide the Former Tenant Class Members the choice of either a Voucher, as set forth further below, or Cash Alternative, as described below:

A. Voucher Program

1. Each written lease agreement will be a single tenancy group, regardless of the number of signatories, listed parties or other residents. In other words, if a unit was rented under a written lease agreement to one person from January 9, 2010 to January 9, 2011 and then a new tenant started February 1, 2011 to February 1, 2012, there would be two

б

 tenancy groups, each of which would be entitled to participate in the Voucher program. If there are multiple Former Tenants in a single tenancy group, the Voucher amount will be divided pro rata and separate Vouchers will be issued to each former tenant in his or her respective amount. If they so desire, the multiple Former Tenants may combine their respective Vouchers and use them for the purposes set forth below.

- 2. The Voucher amount for each single tenancy group will be as follows: \$250 for a one-bedroom unit; \$350 for two bedrooms and \$500 for three bedrooms or more in a rental unit.
- 3. The Voucher may be applied to the cost of a credit check at JD Home Rentals for a future tenancy within a period up to 24 months after mailing of the Voucher with the remainder applied toward the first month's rent for such a tenancy.
 - 4. The Voucher will be good for up to 24 months from the date of mailing.
- 5. The Youcher may be transferred one time by the Former Tenant Settlement Class Member (or, if applicable, the Current Tenants Who Moved) to a person who is not part of the single tenancy group for use in the same manner.
- The Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form will include places for a Former Tenant Settlement Class Member to provide information to determine their eligibility to participate, including the address of their leased place, the months of tenancy during the period January 9, 2010 to the filing of the Order Granting Preliminary Approval and number of bedrooms. Only those Former Tenant Settlement Class Members who return a Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form will be eligible to participate in the Voucher program.
- 7. If a Former Tenant Settlement Class Member seeks to use the Voucher to commence a new tenancy with JD Home Rentals during the above-referenced 24-month period, the former tenant will not be required to post a security deposit for the new tenancy created during the 24-month period. Any future tenancies thereafter may be charged a security deposit by JD Home Rentals. In its sole discretion, JD Home Rentals may elect to provide the Cash Alternative set forth below to any Former Tenant Settlement Class Member in lieu of providing a Voucher. Such individuals will be deemed to liave timely submitted their request for a Cash

18;

]]]

Alternative and need not file one as explained in the next section. If JD Home Rentals so elects, the Cash Alternative will be provided to the Former Tenant Settlement Class Members as set forth below.

8. In its sole discretion, Defendants may elect to provide the Cash
Alternative set forth below to any Former Tenant Settlement Class Member in lieu of providing
a Voucher. If a Defendant so elects, the Cash Alternative will be provided to the Former Tenant
Settlement Class Members pursuant to the terms for the Cash Alternative as set forth below.

B. Cash Alternative:

- Members who do not participate in the Voucher program by using or transferring it as set forth above, or for whom a Defendant exercises the election to offer the Cash Alternative to a Former Tenant Settlement Class Member in lieu of the Voucher. As set forth above, the Voucher program will be in existence for 24 months after the Voucher is mailed. The Voucher may be transferred one time during that 24-month timeframe. After the 24-month time frame, the Former Tenant Settlement Class Members will have forty-five (45) calendar days during a date certain time frame to return an unused or un-transferred Voucher to the Settlement Administrator and seek the Cash Alternative. The Class Notice shall advise the Former Tenant Settlement Class Members that they should retain their Voucher and calendar the time to file a claim for the Cash Alternative if they do not exercise the Voucher, and that they can obtain a substitute Voucher from the Settlement Administrator if they lose the Voucher. The date certain time frame will be set forth on the Voucher.
- 2. A portion of the Voucher to the Former Tenant Settlement Class

 Member, as well as the Class Notice (absent the bold and font size requirement) shall contain in
 type of at least 12 font size and in bold the following provisions relating to the Cash

 Alternative:

- a. the specific time frame during which the Cash Alternative may be claimed by the Former Tenants Settlement Class;
- b. that the Former Tenants Settlement Class shall not be receiving any further notice concerning their ability to claim the Cash Alternative;
- c. that in order to claim the Cash Alternative they must retain possession of the Voucher or, if they lose the Voucher and it is not redeemed by anyone else, they may contact the Settlement Administrator to obtain a substitute Voucher.
- d. that it will be the responsibility of Former Tenants to keep track of the dates when to make a claim for the Cash Alternative; and that if they do not make a claim within the time frame set forth in the Class Notice they will not be able to receive any portion of the Cash Alternative. As noted above, it is very important that they do so since they will not receive a reminder.
- 3. The amount of the Cash Alternative will be computed for each tenancy group and will be as follows:
- a. I bedroom and studio groups: Each tenancy group will get \$10 per occupancy month up to a maximum of \$250;
- b. 2 bedroom groups: Each tenancy group will get \$10 per month up to a maximum of \$350:
- c. 3 bedroom and up groups: Each tenancy group will get \$10 per month up to a maximum of \$500.
- d. In determining the number of months for each tenancy group, the Settlement Administrator will use the information provided by JD Home Rentals concerning the number of months of occupancy for a single tenancy group. Defendants will agree to fund only up to the total dollar amount of all the claims for the Cash Alternative, with the total funding capped at \$222,500. If the total of the claims for the Cash Alternative is less than \$222,500, Defendants pay the allocated amount for each claim as set forth above. If, however, the total of the claims for the Cash Alternative exceeds \$222,500, each claim shall be reduced on a prorated basis so that Defendants' total obligation to pay is capped at \$222,500.

C. <u>Claim Process for Former Tenant Settlement Class Members</u>: Within sixty (60) calendar days of the Effective Date of the Settlement, the Settlement Administrator will send by first class mail the Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form to all Former Tenant Settlement Class Members.

Only those Former Tenant Settlement Class Members who return a Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form to the Settlement Administrator within forty-five (45) calendar days after its mailing ("45-day Claim Period") will be eligible to participate in the Voucher or Cash Alternative terms discussed above. Any Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form (1) not postmarked by the end of the 45-day Claim Period, (2) not received by the Settlement Administrator by the fifth (5th) calendar day after the 45-day Claim Period (or, if timely postmarked but lost in the mail and delivered no later than 90 calendar days after the end of the 45-day Claim Period); (3) not received by other means by the Settlement Administrator by the end of the 45-day Claim Period (4) not signed by the Class Member under penalty of perjury; and/or (5) that does not otherwise comply with the claims process is not considered a valid Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form. Any Former Tenant Class Member who submits a Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form that is not considered timely and valid will not be entitled to participate in the Voucher or the Cash Alternative terms set forth above.

The Settlement Administrator will use reasonable best efforts to locate and send the Class Notice and Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form to the most recent address of said Former Tenant Settlement Class Member. The Settlement Administrator shall be responsible for taking reasonable steps, consistent with its agreed job parameters and any court orders, to trace the address of any Former Tenant Settlement Class Member for whom a Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form are returned by the post office as undeliverable. These reasonable steps shall include, at a minimum: tracking of all undelivered mail; performing additional address searches using additional address databases or equivalent means for all mail returned without a forwarding address; and promptly re-mailing to Class Members for whom new addresses are found. Any returned envelopes with forwarding addresses will be utilized by the Settlement Administrator to trace Class Members.

1 2 3

It will be conclusively presumed that, if an envelope has not been returned within thirty (30) calendar days of the date of mailing, the Class Member received the Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form.

The Settlement Administrator will mail the Vouchers no later than thirty (30) calendar days after the deadline for return of the Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form.

Nothing in this Settlement shall grant Class Counsel any permission to review any Class List provided to the Settlement Administrator. The Class List shall be kept confidential by the Settlement Administrator and not disclosed to anyone absent a further order of the Court after hearing.

SECTION 7: OTHER SETTLEMENT TERMS RELATING TO PEST CONTROL AND TERMINATION OF TENANCIES

A. Fumigation and Pest Remediation.

No later than 18 months after the Effective Date of the Settlement, a pest control inspector will perform a single pest control inspection and assessment of each occupied unit; provided, however, if a tenant refuses or otherwise fails to permit an inspection and assessment, the unit will not be inspected, assessed or treated under this Settlement. The pest control inspector will use its standard form. The pest control inspector will provide tenants with written literature regarding control of pests. The pest control inspector will document if a pest control infestation exists. If so, that pest control infestation will be treated by the pest control inspector without charge to the tenant for the initial and a second treatment. While this Joint Stipulation does not specifically obligate Defendants to pay for more than two treatments, nothing in this Joint Stipulation waives any class members' rights that Defendants perform further fumigations at their expense to which they are or may become obligated by law. As with other provisions, nothing in this Agreement prohibits or limits a tenants' right to seek governmental code enforcement, use JD Home Rentals' normal maintenance program or otherwise exercise his or her rights under law, except to the extent that any of those rights have otherwise been expressly released under this Settlement.

26.

1.//

The presence of bed bugs in a unit will be handled according to existing or future law.

ID Home Rentals reserves the right to charge the tenant for any further or subsequent treatments, which the Tenant may dispute. Any disputes about cause may be submitted to the Ombudsman for informal resolution. No further challenges will be permitted. Any such pest control charges will be considered a miscellaneous charge and the non-payment thereof may not be the basis for an unlawful detainer action.

Beginning with the Effective Date of the Settlement and continuing during the 18-month period set forth above, all vacant units that are rented by JD Home Rentals will be treated by a pest control service prior to occupancy by a tenant.

B. <u>Limitations on Tenancy's Terminations.</u>

ID Home Rentals will not terminate any tenancy except for good cause for a period of 12 months after the Effective Date of the Settlement. "Good Cause" shall be defined to include:

- A. Tenant has not timely paid the rent due.
- B. Tenant has violated a condition or covenant of the tenancy and has failed to cure the violation after having received written notice thereof from the owner.
- C. Tenant is committing waste upon the premises; is maintaining, committing or permitting the maintenance or commission of a nuisance upon the premises; or is using the premises for an unlawful purpose.
- D. Landlord is a natural person who seeks in good faith to recover possession of the rental unit for use and occupancy as a principal residence by himself or herself, or by his or her spouse, domestic partner, brother, sister, child, parent, grandparent or grandchild.
- E. Landlord seeks in good faith to displace tenant temporarily to make capital improvements that cannot be performed safely with the tenant in possession. Landlord shall allow tenant to return immediately upon completion of the improvements, which shall not be unreasonably delayed.
- F. Landlord is required by order of a governmental agency to remove the unit from housing use.

9

б

10 11

12

13

14 15

16 17

18 19

20

2I 22

23

24

25 26

27

28

G. If any property managed by JD Home Rentals is sold to an unrelated third-party who will occupy it.

H. Prior to lease termination under D-G, above, JD Home Rentals must serve on the tenant a 90-day notice to quit or any other notice that may be required by a governmental agency.

SECTION 8 - THE SETTLEMENT ADMINISTRATOR

A. <u>Duties of Settlement Administrator</u>.

The Parties have selected KCC Class Action Services as the Settlement Administrator to administer the Joint Stipulation and all orders of the Court, subject to Court approval. The duties of the Settlement Administrator shall include, without limitation: the printing and mailing of court-approved notices and claim forms to Class Members or others as directed by the Court or as otherwise set forth in the Joint Stipulation, to the extent fully approved; taking all steps as are reasonably necessary to ensure Class Members timely receive notices and claim forms, including conducting a National Change of Address search before mailing the Class Notice and associated claim forms; communicating with Class Members and others as required so as to receive corrections and/or additional information, or for any other reasons as deemed reasonably necessary by the Settlement Administrator in order to ensure that the highest percentage of Class Members receive notice of this Joint Stipulation, the utilization of sufficient methods to ensure the most up-to-date and accurate addresses for Class Members; conducting address searches on all returned, undelivered mail and re-mailing notices and claim forms to Class Members for whom addresses are found; the providing of toll-free, live operator telephone support to receive telephone calls from Class Members or others regarding the Joint. Stipulation; the maintenance of appropriate databases to fulfill its duties; the receipt and control of all returned notices, claim forms and other documents, requests for opt-out, and objections; all other duties referenced in this Joint Stipulation that are to be performed by the Settlement Administrator and any and all other duties as agreed to with Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel consistent with the terms of this Joint Stipulation,

B. Other Provisions.

All disputes, if any, relating to the Settlement Administrator's duties or performance thereof shall be resolved by the Court.

As part of this Settlement, it is agreed that all the costs incurred by the Settlement
Administrator, including those relating to the preparing, mailing and re-mailing and publishing
the Class Notice, the work relating to the opt outs, the work relating to the objections and other
work expressly set forth in the Joint Stipulation to be performed between the period of the
Order Granting Preliminary Approval and the Effective Date of the Settlement, shall be borne
by Defendants. During that period, the Settlement Administrator shall not perform any other
work during that time period unless and if agreed to by Defendants in writing.

It is anticipated that certain Administrative Expenses will be incurred and submitted to the Court for approval at the time of the Final Approval Hearing. If approved and consistent with the above provisions, Defendants shall pay said approved sums within 30 calendar days of the Effective Date of the Settlement. It is also anticipated that further Administrative Expenses will be incurred and submitted to the Court for review and approval after hearing (or, if stipulated to, pursuant to a stipulation) for the period after the Effective Date of Settlement. The further Administrative Expenses will be paid by Defendants within 30 calendar days of notice of the Court's order approving said expenses.

In the event it becomes necessary to replace the Settlement Administrator, Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel shall confer and select, if able, a replacement Settlement Administrator, subject to Court approval. If Counsel are unable to select a replacement Settlement Administrator, they shall notify the Court and file appropriate motions seeking an order by the Court appointing a replacement Settlement Administrator.

Within thirty (30) calendar days after the close of the Objection Deadline, the Settlement Administrator will provide to Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel a declaration including a statement of due diligence and proof of mailing of the Class Notice and Claim Forms to the Class Members (without including any names or addresses), proof of compliance with the publication of the Newspaper Notice, and a statement as to the number of opt-outs and

4.

- 13

20°

23.

objections received. Class Counsel shall provide this information to the Court in the motion for final approval of this Joint Stipulation.

SECTION 9 - OBJECTIONS TO JOINT STIPULATION

A. Objection Procedure.

The Parties agree that a Class Member who has standing may enter an appearance, personally or through an attorney, and may object to the Joint Stipulation by filing his or her objections with the Court and by also submitting objections to Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel. Any objection to the Settlement must be sent to the Settlement Administrator with a postmark no later than 60 calendar days after the date of the initial mailing of the Notice. The Class Notice shall advise Class Members to send copies of any objections to Class Counsel and Defendants' counsel. Any objections should clearly explain why the Class Member objects to the Settlement and state whether the Class Member (or someone on his or her behalf) intends to appear at the Final Approval Hearing.

No Class Member who files an objection shall be heard to argue his or her objection at the Final Approval Hearing, and no briefs or papers beyond the objection itself submitted by any such person shall be considered by the Court, unless written notice of intention to appear at the Final Approval Hearing, together with copies of all papers and briefs, shall have been filed with the Court and mailed to Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel. If those procedures have been complied with, the objector may appear and request to be heard personally at the Final Approval Hearing. It shall be within the discretion of the Court to determine whether it will allow oral argument on the objection. In any event, the Court will consider all timely filed objections even if they are not accompanied by such a written notice of intention to appear at the Final Approval Hearing.

All objections and written notices of intention to appear must be signed and must contain the Class Member's name, the address of counsel, if any, and the name of and the case number for the Action. Upon request, the objector must also provide the Parties any address information or other necessary information so as to identify the objector.

15.

If a Class Member objects to the Joint Stipulation, the Class Member will remain a member of the Class and if the Court approves the Joint Stipulation, the Class Member will be bound by the terms of the Joint Stipulation and Final Judgment in the same way and to the same extent as a Class Member who does not object. Any member of the Class who does not make and serve his or her written objections in the manner provided above, shall be deemed to have waived such objections and shall be foreclosed from making any objections, by appeal or otherwise, to the Joint Stipulation and/or Final Judgment. Any member of the Class who is satisfied with the Joint Stipulation need not appear at the Final Settlement Hearing.

SECTION 10 - SETTLEMENT OF REPRESENTATIVE PLAINTIFFS' INDIVIDUAL CLAIMS AND CLAIMS BY OTHER OCCUPANTS

The Representative Plaintiffs have made claims on their own behalf and on behalf of all Other Occupants in the units occupied or formerly occupied by the Representative Plaintiffs at any time up to the Effective Date of the Settlement. The claims include, without limitation, allegations of general and special damages, pain and suffering, emotional distress, rent rebates, and personal injuries. In connection with this Settlement, all of the claims by the Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants from the beginning of time up until the Effective Date of the Settlement will be resolved, subject to Court approval of this Settlement and Court approval of any and all necessary minor compromises.

Within thirty (30) calendar days of the latter of the Effective Date of the Settlement, receipt of all general releases from all Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants in the form attached hereto as Exhibit L, all necessary Court orders approving this Settlement, including all necessary minors' compromises and receipt by Defendants of all required information from the Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants concerning dates of birth, taxpayer identification numbers or any other information that may be required by law or by any insurer of any Defendant and all required communications from Medicare or other government agencies or representatives concerning any and all liens as discussed further below, Defendants will pay the total sum of Two Hundred Forty-Thousand Dollars (\$240,000.00) to Class Counsel, into an attorney trust account designated by Plaintiffs' counsel, for all the

Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants. These are not incentive award payments, but rather are compensation for alleged personal injuries or physical injuries as set forth further in the releases attached as Exhibit L. The total sum will be allocated as follows:

.4	↓ A.	<u>O</u>	ocupants at 3508 S. Elm Ave., #107, Fresno, CA	ALLOCATED SUM	
5	5	1.	Malaquias Esteves	\$40,186.00	
6	5	2.	Angelica Luengas	\$5,000.00	
7		3,	Jesucita Esteves	\$4,000.00	
8		4.	Pedro Santiago	\$2,500.00	
9		5.	Erika Esteves	\$4,000.00	
10		б.	Yesonia Esteves	\$4,000.00	
11		7.	Carlos Esteves	\$5,000.00	
12		8.	Mauricio Esteves	\$4,000.00	
13		9.	Jocenith Santiago	\$2,000.00	
14	B.	B. Occupants at 230 W. Geary St., Fresno, CA			
15		1.	Elvia Reyes	\$36,792.00	
16		2.	Hector Miranda Carbajal	\$5,000.00	
17		3.	Flector Miranda Reyes	\$3,000.00	
18		4.	Diamante Miranda	\$3,000.00	
19		5.	Miriam Miranda Reyes	\$5,000.00	
20		6.	Adrian Ventura Miranda	\$3,000.00	
21		7.	Esmeralda Ventura Miranda	\$3,000.00	
22		8.	Savannah Eivia Miranda	\$2,000.00	
.23		9.	Ruby Maday Oros Miranda	\$2,000.00	
24		10.	Zayliah Medina Miranda	\$2,000.00	
25	C.	C. Occupants at 2616 E. Washington St., Apt. 102, Fresno. CA			
26		1.	Catalina Mendoza	\$20,022.00	
27		2.	Autonio Martinez Vega	\$5,000.00	
28		3.	Rene Martinez	\$3,000.00	
11			•		

5: Emily Elizabeth Martinez 2 6. Cathy Ariana Martinez 3 D, Previous Occupant of 3622 E. Clay St., Apt. B. Fresno, CA 4 1. Neng Vu 5 2, Zang Moua б E. 7 #101, Fresno, CA 8 1. Willie Thompson 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 above. 16 Plaintiffs and Other Occupants. Α.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

4. Iccel Evelina Martinez \$3,000.00 \$3,000.00 \$2,000.00 \$28,000.00 \$5,000.00

Previous Occupant of 2211 W. Princeton Ave., Fresno, CA and 360 N. Roosevelt Ave.,

\$35,500.00

The Class Counsel will have the responsibility for seeking and obtaining all necessary orders from the Court approving all minor compromises. All minor compromises must be obtained prior to the Final Approval Hearing and any orders must be expressly conditioned on the Court finally approving this Joint Stipulation and the Effective Date of the Settlement having occurred. Any and all payments to a minor shall be made as specifically stated in the minor's compromise order or other orders relating to funds paid for the benefit of a minor listed

Class Counsel represents that they have all necessary and binding written consents from each of their clients (Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants) to enter into this Agreement and to the allocation of sums as set forth above between the Representative

Representative Plaintiffs agree and acknowledge that it is their sole and exclusive obligation to satisfy all liens, conditional payments, debts, rights of subrogation. and/or any other claims or actions asserted against them and/or the proceeds of this settlement. whether now known or unknown, including, but not limited, to any liens by any medical provider, or any Medicaid of Medicare liens resulting from the payment of expenses for hospital or other care and treatment of Plaintiffs and/or Other Occupants. Prior to payment of any settlement funds under this Section, the Representative Plaintiffs, Other Occupants and Class Counsel shall certify that there are no non-Medicare liens that relate to the payment of

any of the settlement funds set forth in this Section regarding which there is not an agreement for its satisfaction from the settlement proceeds. In addition, prior to payment of any settlement funds under this Section, the insurance carriers for Defendants will report the names of the Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants to the appropriate government agencies for the purpose of determining if there are any Medicare or other government liens. The payment of the settlement funds under this Section will not be made until final letters have been received from Medicare and other government agencies or representatives, which will state whether or not there are any Medicare or other liens to any government agency and the total amounts needed to satisfy the lien or liens applicable to each person. If there are any such liens, the amounts paid under this Section for a particular person shall first be used to pay such lien or liens by a check or checks issued to Medicare or other government agency, with any excess to be paid by check to the particular Representative Plaintiff and/or Other Occupant and delivered to Class Counsel with a notation of the deduction for the applicable lien.

- B. Representative Plaintiffs further agree to release Releases and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers from any liens, debts, rights of subrogation. and/or any other claims or actions asserted against them and/or the proceeds of this Settlement by anyone claiming by, through or under Representative Plaintiffs or Other Occupants, whether now known or unknown, including any Medicaid or Medicare liens resulting from the payment of expenses for hospital or other care and treatment of Representative Plaintiffs and/or Other Occupants.
- C. Representative Plaintiffs further agree to defend, indemnify and hold harmless Releasees and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers from any damages, demands for payment or reimbursement, liens, debts, rights of subrogation, and/or any other claims or actions asserted against them and the proceeds of this Settlement, by anyone claiming by, through or under Representative Plaintiffs or Other Occupants, whether now known or unknown, including any Medicaid or Medicare liens resulting from the payment of expenses for hospital or other care and treatment of Representative Plaintiffs and/or Other Occupants.

- D. Representative Plaintiffs specifically warrant that they are not aware of any Medicare or Medicaid benefits paid for the medical care and treatment rendered to treatment of Representative Plaintiffs and/or Other Occupants except as may be revealed as a result of the reporting and disclosure set forth above in Paragraph A. Representative Plaintiffs further warrant that any Medicare or Medicaid liens, whether now known or unknown, resulting from the payment of expenses for hospital or other care and treatment of injuries and damages claimed by Plaintiffs and/or Other Occupants, will be fully satisfied, if sufficient funds exist from the allocated payments in this Section, as set forth herein. If insufficient funds exist to fully satisfy a lien, the lien will be partially satisfied only, with no remaining proceeds payable to the particular Representative Plaintiff or Other Occupant from the settlement proceeds.
- E. Provision of All Information Necessary for Section 111 Reporting and Any Other Required Reporting: Representative Plaintiffs will provide Releasees and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers with complete, accurate, and up-to-date information regarding Representative Plaintiffs' and Other Occupants' Medicare and other government aid eligibility status. Representative Plaintiffs also will provide any and all information Releasees and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers require to facilitate and meet their reporting obligations under 42 U.S.C. §1395y(b)(8). Such information may include, but is not limited to: Representative Plaintiffs' full name, Social Security Number (SSN), Medicare Health Insurance Claim Number (HICN), gender, and date of birth or any other information that may be required by law or by any insurer of any Defendant.
- F. Representations and Warranties Regarding Medicare Eligibility and Conditional Payments: Representative Plaintiffs represent and warrant that they have provided Releasees and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers with complete, accurate, and up-to-date information regarding Representative Plaintiffs' and Other Occupants' Medicare and other government aid eligibility status. The parties agree that all representations and warranties made herein shall survive settlement.

G. Remedies for Breach and Protection of Medicare's Interests: The parties agree that, in the event of a breach of the representations and warranties made by Representative Plaintiffs in the paragraphs above, Releasees and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers shall be entitled to set off any remaining payments due under the terms of this Settlement, as well as to the full extent of damages and other relief available at law and equity.

H. The parties have attempted to resolve this matter in compliance with both state and federal law, and believe that the settlement terms adequately consider Medicare's interest and do not reflect any attempt to shift responsibility for payment of medical expenses covered under this settlement to Medicare pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 1395y(b). The parties acknowledge and understand that any present or future action or decision by CMS or Medicare, including actions regarding the Representative Plaintiffs' eligibility or entitlement to receive Medicare or Medicare payments, will not render this Release void or ineffective, or in any way affect the finality of this Settlement.

SECTION 11 - ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS

Class Counsel will submit an application for attorneys' fees and costs for preliminary and final approval by the Court as follows:

- a. \$1,050,000.00 for attorneys' fees and costs up through and including March 31, 2016. In seeking to support this claim for attorneys' fees, Class Counsel is permitted to claim any hourly rate they claim is reasonable and Defendants are permitted to comment on or challenge any such rates. Notwithstanding the foregoing, the amount awarded by the Court for attorneys' fees and costs for all work and expenses up to and including March 31, 2016 shall not exceed \$1,050,000;
- b. \$100,000.00 for attorneys' fees and costs for the period April 1, 2016 to the Effective Date of the Settlement, provided all such fees are actually incurred based on a rate of \$350 per hour, with proof in the form of time records submitted to the Defendants' Counsel prior to the Final Approval.

Hearing. For purposes of calculating this \$100,000 amount only, and pursuant to a separately negotiated portion of their agreement regarding this aspect of the fee claim only, the Parties, including Class Counsel, have agreed that no party or counsel will deviate (higher or lower) from the use of \$350 per hour for such fees. Any paralegal time related to the portion of the motion for preliminary and final approval of the attorneys' fees and costs shall be calculated at a rate lower than \$350 per hour as established by the Court. In no event shall the attorneys' fees and costs, including paralegals, awarded for this period of work and expenses exceed \$100,000.00; and

c. \$70,000.00 for all attorneys' fees and costs after the Effective Date of the Settlement relating in any way to this Action, the Settlement or the Judgment, provided all such fees are actually and reasonably incurred; excepting, however, attorneys' fees and costs incurred after the fifth Extended Repair Challenge as set forth in Section 5, the final amount of which shall either be agreed to by the parties or determined by Mediator Judge Wanger through an informal process he directs. (The costs of Judge Wanger if he is used shall be borne by Defendants.)

These figures were negotiated at arm's length with the assistance of Mediator Judge Wanger. In agreeing to the figure, Plaintiffs' counsel contends that they substantially discounted their normal rates. It is understood that, in filling their motion, Plaintiffs will explain that they believe a reasonable fee, in the absence of the agreement reached by the parties capping the fees and costs, would be substantially more than the \$1,150,000 agreed to cap on fees and costs, and will present to the Court what they believe would otherwise be a reasonable fee. Plaintiffs' purpose in presenting this information will be to ensure that the Court is able to determine that the agreed-to amount of fees and costs is reasonable. While the Court may determine that a higher fee award would be reasonable in the absence of the agreed to cap, in no event shall Plaintiffs request, or the Court order, more than \$1,150,000 for fees and costs

" ດ

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

1

through the Effective Date of the Settlement or more than a maximum of \$70,000 for all attorneys' fees and costs after the Effective Date of the Settlement relating in any way to this Action, the Settlement or the Judgment other than for Extended Repair Challenges, if any, beyond a fifth challenge.

The attorneys' fees and costs paid by Defendants pursuant to this Joint Stipulation shall not exceed, under any circumstances, the total sum of \$1,220,000, as set forth above, for any and all matters relating to this Action, the Settlement, including any steps prior thereto or subsequent to the entry of the Judgment; excepting, however, attorneys' fees that may be awarded under Section 5.B.7 concerning Extended Repair Challenges after the fifth such challenge. Any award of attorneys' fees by the Court must not exceed the aforementioned sum, under any circumstances, and the Judgment will extinguish any and all claims or potential claims for attorneys' fees, costs and expenses of and by the Class Counsel or any other counsel who may have served or who may claim to have served in any respect in connection with this Action or the Settlement. Class Counsel agree either to obtain and provide to Defendants' counsel no later than five (5) business days after the filing date of the Order Granting Preliminary Approval a written release from any other counsel who may have served or who may have claimed to serve in this Action that they are not seeking and do not seek any attorneys' fees, costs or expenses in connection with this Action or the Settlement. Alternatively, Class Counsel shall effect valid service (as set forth below) of this Joint Stipulation and the Order Granting Preliminary Approval upon any and all attorneys who may have served or who may have claimed to have served in this Action and to deliver by hand delivery and by registered mail to all such lawyers, no later than five (5) business days after entry of the Order Granting Preliminary Approval, the above-referenced documents, together with correspondence addressed at least to the senior partners of any and all firms that explain such documents; why they are being delivered and served and that the counsel must present any claim to the amounts set forth above (or portions thereof) for attorneys' fees, costs or expenses in a manner consistent with the Order Granting Preliminary Approval, which date shall not be later than at least fourteen (14) calendar days before the deadline for filing objections to the

.3·

14¹

Settlement; and that any such claims that the counsel may have will be extinguished by the Judgment.

Defendants agree not to oppose the application, so long as the application is consistent with the provisions of this Joint Stipulation. Notwithstanding the foregoing, Defendants reserve the right to advise the Court about their position concerning the hourly rate, hours and other factors used by Class Counsel in seeking approval of the attorneys' fees and costs. Class Counsel shall not seek in any way any additional fees or costs other than as set forth above and in connection with Extended Repair Challenges as set forth in this Joint Stipulation.

Subject to the provisions of this Joint Stipulation and approval by the Court, Defendants agree to transfer to or deliver a check to the Settlement Administrator for immediate distribution to an account specified by Class Counsel, within thirty (30) calendar days of the Effective Date of the Settlement, the amount of \$1,050,000 (or other sum approved by the Court) and a further amount up to \$100,000 as set forth above provided said fees and costs are actually and reasonably incurred as determined by the Court at the Final Approval Hearing.

The remaining amount of up to \$70,000 shall be paid by Defendants into an account specified by Class Counsel within 30 calendar days of agreement or order by Judge Wanger. Plaintiffs may seek such fees the earlier of 1) two years from Effective Date of the Settlement or 2) after the Effective Date of the Settlement and once their fees and costs total \$25,000, and again when they total an additional \$25,000 and again when they total an additional \$20,000. Judge Wanger's determination shall be binding and enforceable and may not be appealed. Plaintiffs may enforce a failure to pay these fees by filing an action in Fresno County Superior Court, to be related to this case; the prevailing party on this specific issue shall be entitled to an award of fees and costs pursuant to Civil Code § 1717.

Defendants are responsible for their own attorneys' fees and costs.

SECTION 12 – RELEASES

Upon the Effective Date of this Settlement, the Class, Class Members, Current Tenant. Settlement Class Members and Former Tenant Settlement Class Members, and each of them, fully and finally release and forever discharge Releasees, and each of them, and shall be

Period.

deemed to have, and by operation of the Judgment and any related order shall have expressly waived, released, discharged and relinquished the Released Claims defined below.

The Released Claims consist of all such claims from January 9, 2010 to the end of the Class

A. Definition of Released Claims.

"Released Claims" means claims, demands, rights, debts, obligations, costs, expenses, wages, restitution, disgorgement, benefits of any type, equitable relief, contract obligations, statutory relief penalties, attorneys' fees, costs, interest, actions, liabilities and causes of action that were or might have been asserted (whether in tort, contract or otherwise), for violation of any state or federal law for claims that are set forth or attempted to be set forth in the Complaint in the Action which are, could be or could have been the basis of claims by the Class relating in any way to restitution, disgorgement, equitable relief, injunctive relief or other monetary relief concerning: rent, rent overcharges, rent credits, deposits, disposition of deposits, collection of rent while permitting rental units to be maintained in untenantable or uninhabitable conditions; payment of rent or other monies for an untenantable or uninhabitable unit, expenses incurred to make repairs, and/or other lost money or property paid by a Class Member relating in any way to the condition or maintenance of the unit.

The Released Claims include, without limitation all of the following as it relates to restitution, disgorgement, equitable relief, injunctive relief or monetary relief and all of the following to the extent (and only to the extent) of the categories contained in the foregoing paragraph:

1. Any and all claims under Business & Professions Code Section 17200, et seq. as set forth in the First Cause of Action of the Complaint, including, but not limited to, the permitting of rental units to be maintained in untenantable conditions and continue to collect rent, in violation of the Civil Code, including Sections 1941, 1941.1, 1941.3 and 1942.4 and Health & Safety Code Sections 17980, et seq., engaging in a scheme that caused, permitted and maintained untenantable rental units, in violation of Civil Code Sections 1714, 1940.2, 1941, 1941.1, 1941.3, 1942.5, 1954 and the Health &

б

ŀI

Safety Code including Sections 17920.3 and 17920.10;

- 2. Any and all claims relating to lost money or property by the Class.

 Members relating to the payment of rent or deposits relating to any of the rental units rented or offered for rent by any of the Defendants in the City and/or County of Fresno, California:
- 3. Any and all claims for injunctive relief or other relief under Business & Professions Code Section 17203;
- 4. Any and all claims set forth or attempted to be set forth in the Second Cause of Action;
- 5. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Third Cause of Action to the extent the Third Cause of Action incorporates the First and Second Causes of Action.
- 6. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Complaint that JD Homes engaged in a pattern and practice of violating the basic housing rights of its tenants by refusing to make its rental properties habitable by refusing to comply with all applicable health and safety laws; and taking advantage of, harassing and retaliating against any tenants who exert their rights and request repairs, as alleged in Paragraph 8 of the Complaint;
- 7. Any and all claims relating in any way to any rent rebates or any other return of rent or other charges paid by any Class Member to Defendants relative to any properties rented or offered for rent during the Class Period;
- 8. Any and all claims that Defendants have failed to keep the properties habitable and fit for occupancy as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;
- 9. Any and all claims relating to untenantable rental property or properties not meeting the standards of California Civil Code Section 1941.1 and Health & Safety Code Sections 17920, 17920.3 and 17920.10 or other applicable law;
- 10. Any and all claims that Defendants have failed to abate untenantable living conditions after receiving notice of them from tenants and/or the City of Fresno,

28

1

2

3

4

as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;

12.

- 11. Any and all claims that Defendants have retaliated and/or harassed tenants, including Plaintiffs and others similarly situated, when they attempt to enforce their legal rights as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint; and
- Any other claim asserted or attempted to be asserted in the Complaint, including any and all claims for injunctive relief, restitution, disgorgement, retroactive rent rebate, rent reductions, rent abatement and attorneys' fees and costs for this Action. Notwithstanding any of the foregoing, the Released Claims do not include, and are not intended to release, damages claims for physical injury or personal bodily injury (including but not limited to illness; mental stress, emotional distress, anxiety, annoyance and discomfort), including such damages recoverable under any of the statutes listed in sub-paragraphs 1 and 9. The Released Claims do include statutory damages recoverable under any of the statutes listed in sub-paragraphs 1 and 9, but do not otherwise include statutory damages under any other statute.

B. Waiver of Civil Code Section 1542 as to Released Claims.

With respect to the Released Claims, the Class, Class Members, Current Tenant Settlement Class Members and Former Tenant Settlement Class Members each further waive all rights and benefits afforded by section 1542 of the Civil Code of the State of California. Section 1542 provides:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

The Class, Class Members, Current Tenant Settlement Class Members and Former Tenant Settlement Class Members agree not to sue or otherwise make a claim against any of the Releasees that is in any way related to, arises out of or is connected in any way with the Released Claims.

The Class Notice will include this section in its entirety.

SECTION 13 - DUTIES OF THE PARTIES PRIOR TO COURT APPROVAL

The Representative Plaintiffs shall promptly submit this Joint Stipulation to the Court for the Court's preliminary approval and determination as to the Joint Stipulation's fairness, adequacy, and reasonableness at the Preliminary Approval Hearing.

A. Stipulation for Preliminary Approval.

The Representative Plaintiffs shall apply to the Court for the entry of a preliminary order in the form attached hereto as Exhibit P seeking the following:

- a. The scheduling of the Final Approval Hearing on the question of whether this Joint Stipulation should be approved as fair, reasonable and adequate as to Class Members. The approval shall also include that the Class be conditionally certified for settlement purposes only. In the event that this Joint Stipulation is nullified or invalidated for any reason, including that the Court fails to give preliminary or final approval to this Joint Stipulation, the Court fails to order any of the other relief set forth in this Joint Stipulation, a failure of a condition precedent occurs, the Court disapproves of any term or condition of the Joint Stipulation, or if the Court modifies or amends any portion of the Joint Stipulation, the conditional certification shall be vacated, shall be null and void and shall be of no force or effect in the Action as to all Parties herein at the option of either party. The option shall expire upon the Effective Date of the Settlement.
- b. Approval as to form and content of the proposed Class Notice, the proposed Newspaper Notice and all claim forms;
 - c. A direction to mail the Class Notice as set forth therein;
 - d. A direction to publish the Class Notice;
- e. That the Class Members shall have sixty (60) calendar days from the date of the initial mailing of the Class Notice to opt-out of the terms of this Joint Stipulation as set forth therein;
- f. That the Class Members shall have sixty (60) calendar days from the date of the initial mailing of the Notice and Claim Form to file any objections to this Joint

Stipulation as set forth therein; and

g. Approval of the Settlement Administrator as set forth therein.

Class Counsel shall submit the motion for preliminary approval papers to Defendants' Counsel.

for their review no less than seven (7) days prior to the filing of such papers with the Court.

SECTION 14 - DUTIES OF THE PARTIES CONCERNING FINAL COURT APPROVAL

Following final approval of this Joint Stipulation by the Court at the Final Approval Heating, Class Counsel will submit a proposed final order and Judgment in the form attached as Exhibit Q or as modified by the Court, any modification of which must be consistent with the terms of this Joint Stipulation:

- a. Approving the Joint Stipulation, adjudging, among other things, the terms thereof to be fair, reasonable and adequate, and directing consummation of its terms and provisions;
- b. Approving Plaintiffs' counsel's application for an award of attorneys'
 fees and reimbursement of costs;
 - c. Approving settlement certification of the Class;
 - c. Approving any required payments under this Joint Stipulation;
- f. Entering final judgment that allows the Court to retain jurisdiction of the Action to enforce this Joint Stipulation and the Final Judgment;
- g. Including in the Judgment the provisions set forth in Section 3 of this Joint Stipulation; and,
- h. Including in the Judgment the Releases set forth in Section 12 of this Joint Stipulation.

SECTION 15 - CONTINUING JURISDICTION

The Court has, and shall continue to have, jurisdiction to make any orders as may be appropriate to effectuate, consummate, and enforce the terms of this Joint Stipulation and Judgment, including the Releases, and any orders it enters pursuant to it. Any dispute or question relating to or concerning the interpretation, validity, enforcement or application of this

Joint Stipulation shall be presented to the Court for resolution, and the Parties, Plaintiffs and the Class agree to submit to the personal and exclusive jurisdiction of the Court.

SECTION 16 - OTHER PROVISIONS

A. Enforcing/Voiding the Agreement.

If any material or substantial term set forth in the preceding sections is not met and satisfied or not ordered or included by the Court, this Joint Stipulation shall, at the option of the affected party, be ineffective, void and of no further force or effect and shall not be used nor be admissible in any subsequent proceedings in this Court or in any other forum or proceeding of any type. In the event of a failure of any condition precedent, a failure of the Court to give final approval to the Joint Stipulation at the Final Approval Hearing, a failure of the Court to issue any of the other relief set forth in this Joint Stipulation, any decision by the Court to disapprove any condition or term of the Joint Stipulation, any modification or amendment by the Court of any portion of the Joint Stipulation, this Joint Stipulation shall then be void and unenforceable as to all Parties herein at the option of either party. Each party may exercise his/its options under this Section to void this Joint Stipulation by giving notice, in writing, to the other and to the Court at any time prior to the Effective Date of this Settlement.

B. Mutual Full Cooperation.

The Parties agree to cooperate fully with each other to accomplish the terms of this Joint Stipulation, including but not limited to, executing such documents and taking such other action as may be reasonable and necessary to implement the terms and intent of this Joint Stipulation.

C. No Prior Assignments.

The Representative Plaintiffs and the Class Members represent, covenant, and warrant that they have not directly or indirectly, assigned, transferred, encumbered, or purported to assign, transfer, or encumber to any person or entity any of the Released Claims set forth in Section 12. Defendants shall have no obligation to pay or otherwise resolve any liens that are or may be asserted against any payments made hereunder. In the event that any such lien is asserted, it is the responsibility of the Class Member and/or the Representative Plaintiffs to pay,

3

4 5

ã 7

8 Q.

10

11 12

13

14

15

16.

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24 25

26

27

compromise or otherwise resolve the lien at no cost to Defendants.

D. Attorneys' Fees.

In the event that Defendants, the Representative Plaintiffs or any Class Member institutes any legal action, arbitration, or other proceeding against the other to enforce the provisions of this Joint Stipulation or Final Judgment or to declare rights and/or obligations under this Joint Stipulation or Final Judgment, the successful litigant shall be entitled to recover from the unsuccessful litigant reasonable attorneys' fees and costs, including expert witness fees, incurred in connection with any such action, arbitration or proceeding.

E. Notices.

Unless otherwise specifically provided herein, all notices, demands or other communications given hereunder shall be in writing and shall be deemed to have been duly given as of the third business day after mailing by first class mail or overnight mail, addressed as follows:

CLASS COUNSEL:	DEFENDANTS' COUNSEL:
Michelle Murie Kezirian, #189481 Attorney at Law	William C. Hahesy Law Offices of William C. Hahesy
2335 E. Colorado Blvd., Suite 115	225 W. Shaw Ave., Suite 105
Pasadena, CA 91107	Fresno, Ca. 93704

Either party may re-designate the Person to receive notices, requests, demands or other communications required or permitted by this Joint Stipulation by providing written notice to the other Party and the Court.

F. Construction.

The Parties agree that the terms and conditions of this Joint Stipulation are the result of lengthy, intensive arms-length negotiations between them, and that this Joint Stipulation shall not be construed in favor of or against any of the Parties.

G. Captions and Interpretations.

Section titles or captions contained herein are inserted as a matter of convenience and for reference, and in no way define, limit, extend or describe the scope of this Joint Stipulation or any provision hereof.

4 5

H. Modification.

This Joint Stipulation may not be changed, altered, or modified, except in writing and signed by Representative Plaintiff and Class Counsel, Defendants and Defendants' Counsel and approved by the Court. This Joint Stipulation may not be discharged except by performance in accordance with its terms or by a writing signed by Class Counsel, Defendants and Defendants' Counsel.

I. Integration Clause.

This Joint Stipulation contains the entire agreement between the Parties, Class Counsel, Defendants and the Class Members, with respect to the subject matter hereof. The parties acknowledge that no representations, inducements, promises or statements, oral or otherwise, have been made or relied on by any of the Parties or by anyone acting on behalf of the Parties which are not embodied or incorporated by reference herein, and further agree that no other covenant, representation, inducement, promise or statement not set forth in writing in this Joint Stipulation shall be valid or binding.

J. Binding on Assigns.

This Joint Stipulation shall be binding upon and inure to the benefit of Releasees, the Representative Plaintiffs and the Class Members, and their respective heirs, trustees, and executors, administrators, successors and assignees.

K. Class Counsel Signatories.

It is agreed that because the Class Members are so numerous, it is impossible or impractical to have each Class Member execute this Joint Stipulation. Upon entry of the Order Granting Preliminary Approval, Class Counsel shall be authorized by the Class Members, and by the Court, to take all appropriate action required or permitted to be taken by the Class pursuant to this Joint Stipulation to effectuate its terms, and is authorized to enter into any modification or amendment to this Joint Stipulation on behalf of the Class which they deem appropriate.

б

22)

L. Counterparts.

This Joint Stipulation may be executed in counterparts, including electronic or fax counterparts, and when at least one such counterpart has been signed and delivered, each counterpart shall be deemed an original, and, when taken together with other signed counterparts, shall constitute one Joint Stipulation, which shall be binding upon and effective as to Defendants and the Class Members.

M. Choice of Law and Forum.

Any action pertaining to the terms of this Joint Stipulation or Final Judgment shall be brought in the Fresno County Superior Court, State of California and decided under the law of the State of California.

N. Interim Stay of Proceedings.

The Parties agree to hold in abeyance all proceedings in the Action, except such proceedings necessary to implement and complete the Settlement, pending the Final Approval Hearing to be conducted by the Court.

O. Publicity.

Other than as necessary to implement the Settlement or as set forth herein, neither the Representative Plaintiffs nor Class Counsel shall initiate any publicity, disclosure or contact with the media, or respond to any inquiry from the media regarding the Settlement.

P. Privacy of Documents and Information.

At the request of Defendants, the Representative Plaintiff and Class Counsel agree that they will return to Defendants all documents and information provided to them by Defendants within thirty (30) days after Defendants' satisfaction of all of their obligations under this Joint Stipulation and that none of the documents and information provided them by Defendants shall be used for any purpose other than the prosecution of this Action or the enforcement of this Joint Stipulation. Alternatively, Defendants can require that the Class Counsel certify that all such documents have been securely destroyed.

Q. Invalidity of any Provision. rties request that, before declaring any

б

DATED:

The Parties request that, before declaring any provision of this Joint Stipulation invalid, the Court shall first attempt to construe all provisions valid to the fullest extent possible consistent with applicable precedents. In the event that the Court determines that a provision is invalid, the Court shall strike that provision only from the Stipulation.

R. Representative Plaintiffs' Waiver of Right to Opt Out and Object.

By signing below, the Representative Plaintiffs agree to be bound by the terms herein and further agree not to request to opt out from the Class and agree not to object to any terms of the Joint Stipulation.

DATED: 3 28 2018

DEFENDANTS

John Hoyannisian

Invalidity of any Provision. Q. 1 The Parties request that, before declaring any provision of this Joint Stipulation invalid, 2 the Court shall first attempt to construe all provisions valid to the fullest extent possible 3 consistent with applicable precedents. In the event that the Court determines that a provision is 4 invalid, the Court shall strike that provision only from the Stipulation. 5 R. Representative Plaintiffs' Waiver of Right to Opt Out and Ğ Object. 7 By signing below, the Representative Plaintiffs agree to be bound by the terms herein 8 and further agree not to request to opt out from the Class and agree not to object to any terms of 9 the Joint Stipulation. 10 11 12. REPRESENTATIVE PLAINTIFFS 13 DATED: 14 Neng Vu 15 DATED: 16 Willie Thompson 17 DATED: 18 Elvia Reyes 19 DATED: Catalina Mendoza 20 DATED: 21 Antonio Martinez Vega 22 DATED: 23 Malaquias Esteves 24 25 DEFENDANTS 26 27 DATED:

1	DATED:	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
1 2	., * . <u></u> .	David Hovannisian, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD Home Rentals
3	DATED:	•
4		Bryce Hovannisian, sued as an individual
5		and d/b/a JD Home Rentals
		DDIION I D California United Ballium
6		BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership
7	DATED:	Ву:
8	<i></i>	
9		
10		JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership
11		
12	DATED:	Ву:
13		
14 15	,	JCH Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership
16	DATED:	Ву:
17		
18		
19	<u>APPROVED</u>	AS TO FORM AND CONTENT:
20		
21	, ,	KAYE, McLANE, BEDNARSKI & LITT, LLP
22	DATED: 2/22/2019	By: Benet Start
23		Barrett S. Litt
24		Attorneys for Plaintiffs
25	,	MICHELLE MARIE KEZIRIAN, ATTORNEY
26		AT LAW
27		c00 H
28	DATED: 2 22/2019	By: Michelle Marie Kezirian, Attorney for Plaintiffs
20	. (whether wante resultant, afformed for Figurities
.,		<i>[5]</i>

	II.	
1	DATED:	TS 124 YT
2		David Hovannisian, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD Home Rentals
3	DATED:	
4		Bryce Hovannisian, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD Home Rentals
.5		•
6		BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership
7	to America	•
8	DATED:	Ву:
9		
10		JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California
11		limited liability partnership
12	DATED:	By: Jell lucer
13		
14		JCH Family Limited Partnership, a California
15		limited liability partnership
16	DATED:	By: Jan acan
17	ı	
18	APPROVED A	S TO FORM AND CONTENT:
19		
20	,	KAYE, McLANE, BEDNARSKI & LITT, LLP
21		
22	DATED:	By: Barrett S. Litt
23		Attorneys for Plaintiffs
24		
25		Michelle Marie Kezirian, Attorney at Law
26		
27	DATED:	Michelle Marie Kezirian, Attorney for Plaintiffs
28	,	Materiolie Mande Kozumi, Lucotney for Lightella
·	·	65

		(define
1	DATED:	David Hovannisian, sued as an individual
2		and d/b/a JD Home Rentals
3	DATED:	170
4		Bryce Hovannisian, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD Home Rentals
5		(Will of a 1 p Home Remain
. 6		BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability
		parinership)
7	DATED:	BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership By:
8		
9		
10		JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership
11	m . man	
12	DATED:	By:
13		
14 15		JCH Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership
16	DATED:	Ву:
17		
18		
19	APPROVED AS TO	FORM AND CONTENT:
20		KAYE, McLANE, BEDNARSKI & LITT, LLP
21		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
22	DATED:	By:
23		Barrett S. Litt Attorneys for Plaintiffs
24		Thomas a for a remaining
25		Michelle Marie Kezirian, Attorney at Law
26		
27	DATED:	The state of the s
28		Michelle Marie Kezirian, Attorney for Plaintiffs

	BET TZEDEK LEGAL SERVICES					
م. ناد	2	J. J. MK				
<u> </u>	[] The man and man an	By: Julius Thompson				
4		Julius C. Thompson				
)	Attorneys for Plaintiffs				
.5						
6	•	GREENSTEIN and McDONALD				
7	DATED ACGYRLLY 22,2019	By: Kannoth Grensten Mc				
8	DATED-TON MOVE 227 COT	Kenneth M. Greenstein				
.9)	Attorneys for Plaintiffs				
10						
11	<u>"</u>	TENANTS TOGETHER				
12	numeral de la	D. D. MK				
13.	DATED: Tology 22,2019	By: Dean Preston				
14		Attorneys for Plaintiffs				
15		•				
16		McCORMICK BARSTOW LLP				
17						
	DATED:	By:				
18		Attorneys for Defendants				
19		DAVID HOVANNISIAN, an individual				
20		and dba JD HOME RENTALS, BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, an individual and dba				
21		JD HOME RENTALS, BDHOV, LP, a				
22		California limited liability partnership				
23		KINCAID & ASSOCIATES, LLP				
24						
- 1	DATED:	By: Mark L. Kincaid				
25		Mark L. Kincaid Attorneys for Defendants				
26		DAVID HOVANNISIAN, an individual				
27		and dba ID HOME RENTALS, BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, an individual and dba				
28		JD HOME RENTALS, BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership				

		·
•	1	BET TZEDEK LEGAL SERVICES
	2	· •
	3 DATED:	By:
	4	Attorneys for Plaintiffs
:	5	·
(6	GREENSTEIN and McDONALD
7	· 11	•
8	DATED:	By: Kenneth M. Greenstein
.9		Attorneys for Plaintiffs
10	, (
11	1	TENANTS TOGETHER
12		
13	DATED:	Ву:
13 14		Dean Preston Attorneys for Plaintiffs
15		McCORMICK BARSTOW LLP
16	1	
17	DATED:	Ву:
18		Benjamin T. Nicholson Attorneys for Defendants
19	8 .	Attorneys for Defendants DAVID HOVANNISIAN, an individual and dba/D HOME RENTALS, BRYCE
20		and dba/ID HOME RENTALS, BRYCH HOVANNISIAN, an individual and dba
21	.	JD/HOME RENTALS, BDHOW, LP, a
22		California limited liability partnership
23		Kincaid & Associates, Llp
24	a1 d	N 4. 0.
25	DATED: 8/14/18	By:
26	•	Attorneys for Defendants
٠. ا		DAVID HOVANNISIAN, an individual and dba JD HOME RENTALS, BRYCE
27		HOVANNISIAN, an individual and dba
28		JD HOME RENTALS, BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership
1		66

1	LAW OFFICES OF WILLIAM C. HAHESY
2	
3	DATED: By: William C, Hahesy
4	Attorney for Defendants JOHN HOVANNISIAN, an individual and
6	dba JD HOME RENTALS, JHS Family Limited Partnership and JCH Family Limited Partnership
7	
8	NORTHRUP SCHLUETER PROFESSIONAL LAW CORPORATION
10	
11	DATED: World 10 2018 By: Linda Northrup
12	Aftorneys for Defendants /
13	JOHN HOVANNISIAN, an individual and disa JD HOME RENTALS, JHS Family
14	Limited Partnership and JCH Family Limited Partnership
15	Mission & Manager.
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	Y:VD Home (Tzwick)Volnt Süpulsikn/FINAL12018-01-04 Current doze
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	•
26	
27	
28	
	67
	JOINT STIPULATION OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

1	L	AW OFFICES OF WILLIAM C. HAHRSY
2	DATED: Fely 21, 249 B	y: Wele
3	DATED: POLITICAL B	William C. Hahery Attorney for Defendants
5		JOHN HOVANNISIAN, an individual and dba JD HOME RENTALS, JHS Family
6		Limited Partnership and JCH Family Limited Partnership
7	,	Interes a montanop
8	P1	ORTHRUP SCHLUETER PROFESSIONAL AW CORPORATION
10		
11	DATED: B	Linda Northrup
12		Attorneys for Defendants JOHN HOVANNISIAN, an individual and
13		dba JD HOME RENTALS, JHS Family Limited Partnership and JCH Family
14		Limited Partnership
15		
16		
17	·	
18 19		
20	Y:\UD Home (Tzedek)\Uoint Stipulation\FINAL\\2018-01-04 Current.d	DCX
21		
22		·
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		
	II	

EXHIBIT A

EXHIBIT A

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq. SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

TO:	[Current Tenant Name and address]
FROM:	, Settlement Administrator
DATE:	
RE:	Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al., Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062 ("Action")

Pursuant to a settlement of the above class action case, we have been appointed by the Court as the Settlement Administrator for this Action. In this lawsuit, Plaintiffs and Defendants have agreed to an inspection process for those units managed by JD Home Rentals The primary relief offered to current tenants through this settlement is the opportunity to request an independent inspection of their unit by a person who is not an employee or agent of any Defendant, but rather is an independent inspector appointed by the Court to determine whether and what repairs, if any, are needed, after which those repairs are to be done.

If you do or do not want your unit inspected, you may also request repairs using the normal procedure available to you through *ID* Home Rentals or by calling the following number: 559-265-4466.

You are not required to return this notice unless you want your rental unit to be inspected.

In making the decision as to whether or not you want your rental unit inspected, the following list identifies the primary conditions that you should consider in deciding if you want your unit inspected. A rental unit should have: effective weather proofing of the roof and exterior walls; doors, windows or walls that are not broken or open; legal and properly operating gas, electricity and lighting; running cold and hot water; operating sewage, lavatory and bathing facilities; plumbing that works and does not leak; has heat air conditioning or other appliances (where provided by the landlord) that work properly; adequate, clean and well maintained garbage receptacles; adequate foundation, walls, ceilings, floors, stairways and railings; rooms that are not damp; a private, secure mail area (for multi-family units); a usable telephone jack and inside telephone wiring; and no lead hazards. In addition, a consideration for what should lead a tenant to request an inspection is whether the common areas are clean, sanitary, and free from debris, filth, rubbish, and garbage.

The presence of any insects, rodents or vermin should not be a consideration for you to request an inspection. There will be a separate pest control inspection to inspect for infestation of insects, rodents, or vermin for every unit.

The tenant may consult someone to translate this notice into a language she or he understands, or to read and explain the notice if she or he does not read and write, or if she or he has a disability that prevents the tenant from independently being able to determine whether an inspection is appropriate under these standards.

A tenant who, in good faith, after reviewing the conditions in that tenant's unit, concludes that there may be conditions that justify an inspection (as described above) in his or her unit should request an inspection. A tenant who, after reviewing the conditions in that tenant's unit, concludes that there are not such conditions in his or her unit should not request an inspection.

The determination of whether to request an inspection or not should be made by the tenant personally, or in consultation with co-habitants, family members or close personal friends. The tenant must personally conclude in good faith that there may be the types of problem conditions described above before requesting an inspection. The claim form requires that the tenant state under oath that she or he made such an independent determination.

If you do not request an inspection, you will receive a rent freeze for 8 months after court approval of this settlement; a tenant who requests an inspection will not receive such a rent freeze.

Nothing in this settlement gives up any tenant's right to raise the conditions of the property as a defense in an unlawful detainer action, or to claim that any action of the landlord after a tenant requests an inspection under this settlement was in retaliation for requesting an inspection.

If you want your rental unit to be inspected for such conditions, please check the box below and date and sign this notice and return a copy to the address above. You will receive a separate notice later with the date and time of the inspection.

	If you have any questions about this notice you may contact the Settlement Administrator at (to be provided.)
	I want my rental unit inspected.
	Date:
	Name:
notice	I,, acknowledge under penalty of perjury that I received this and that I have signed it indicating that I want my rental unit inspected.
	Signature

Exhibit A

EXHIBIT B

EXHIBIT B

Vu, ct al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq. SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

TO:	[Current Tenant Name and address]
FROM:	, Settlement Administrator
DATE:	
RE:	Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al., Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062 ("Action")
	Inspection of (address)
	Date:
	Time:
the settleme unit will be	received a notice from you that you desire to have your rental unit inspected pursuant to the terms of ent in the above-referenced Action. Pursuant to that election, we are writing to advise you that your inspected on the date and at or about the time stated above in this notice. An adult from your household sent for the inspection.
any reason, dates and ti	ou desire not to have your unit inspected at that date and time, or that time does not work for you for you must advise us in writing by no later than and provide three other mes that you are available to have your unit inspected. It must be at a time when an adult from your can be present for the inspection.
at the above available fo your unit w	e do not receive notice from you seeking a different inspection date, we will appear for the inspection e time. If you either refuse or decline to permit the inspection or otherwise do not make the unit r inspection by having an adult from your household present at the above-referenced date and time, ill not be inspected pursuant to the settlement. (If you change the inspection time, the same rule will t changed time.)
If yo	ou need to change this date or time and provide the other dates and times, you may contact us as
(contact infe	ormation to be provided.)

Exhibit C

Confidential and Privileged - Subject to evidence code §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq.
Subject to confidentiality agreement
Not to be used for any purpose other than this action.

J. D. Homes Rental Inspection Checklist Property 10 #				ę.			
late of spection	-	Tenant Name			Unit#		
reet No.		Street Name	,	City		Zip	

	Inspected by:						
Name							
company	,						
Phone #							
Email							

Estimated D	ate of Construction:
Pre-1920	Pre-1980
Pre-1930	Pre-1990
Pre-1940	Pre-2000
Pre-1950	Pre-2010
Pre-1960	Other:
Pre-1970	

	J. D. Homes Rental Inspection Checklist						Property ID#:	
ist ist		Exterior	N/A	Yes	No	Servicable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
	1	Number of floors/stories in the unit:						
	2	Is there a garage?						
		The exterior of the property appears in good condition and appears to keep the property properly weatherproofed.				-	,	
		The exterior appears free of deteriorating, crumbling, or loose plaster.						
	5A	Does there appear to be weather protection from the exterior walls?						
	5B	Does there appear to be weather protection from the foundations?						
	5C	Does there appear to be weather protection from the windows?						
	5D	Does there appear to be weather protection from the exterior doors?						
	6A	Does there appear to be weather protection for exterior wall coverings, including lack of paint or weathering due to lack of paint?					·	
	6B	Does there appear to be any readily observable broken exterior wal coverings?	1					-
	6C	Does there appear to be any readily observable rotten exterior wall coverings?						
	6D	Does there appear to be any readily observable split exterior wall coverings?						
	6E	wall coverings?						
	6F	weather protection?						
	7	Do all existing gutters/downspouts appear to direct rainwater away from the structure?						
	8	Do all stairs with four (4) or more risers have rails on at least one side?						
	9	Do all balconies, porches, or landings that are thirty (30) inches or more off the ground have guardrails?						

.

		J. D. Homes Rental Inspection Checklist					Property ID)#:
int est		Exterior	N/A	Yes	No	Servicable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
ant Jest		Exterior Common Area	N/A	Yes.	No	Servicable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
	10	Does there appear to be adequate exterior lighting?			,			
	11	Do any security gates appear to function properly?			,			
	12	Do interior common areas appear to be in clean and sanitary conditions?						
nant quest		Premises	N/A	Yes	No	Servicable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
		Do areas under the control of the landlord appear to be free of junk, trash, debris or garbage that constitute a safety hazard?		}				
		Do areas under the control of the landlord appear to be free from weeds or excessive plant growth that constitute a fire, health, or safety hazard?						
	15	Do premises appear to be free from stagnant water?						
	16	Do accessory structures (sheds, garages, fences) appear to be in structurally sound condition?						
	17	Do the premises appear to be free from readily observable unrestricted wells, shafts, excavations, or other dangerous						
enant equest		Mailbox	N/A	Yes	No	Servicable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
	18	If an apartment, does the unit have a workable and locking mailbox?						
	19	If a single family home, does the unit have a mailbox or mail slot?		1				1
enant equest	,	Garbage Containers	N/A	Ye	s No	Servicable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
	20	Is the property served with an adequate number of rubbish and garbage containers?	<u> </u>					
	21	Do the rubbish and garbage containers appear to be leak free?						-

•

	J. D. Homes Rental Inspection Checklist					Property	ity ID#:	
t st	Exterior	N/A	Yes	No	Servicable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action	
T	General	N/A	Yes	No	Servicable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action	
\exists :	Does the unit appear to be free from readily observable structural hazards that affect health and safety?				_			

.

	J. D. Homes Rental Inspection Checklist			Int	Property I.D. #			
iant uest		Interior Structure	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
97	1	Approximate square-footage of the unit:						
31c	2	Number of bedrooms/sleeping rooms:				_		
Pre .	3	Number of rooms not used for sleeping: Office Laundry Other:		,		_		
		Do walls appear in sound condition and without substantial cracking?						
		Do walls appear free of peeling paint? Note: if not, and the repair requires certification, such certification will be provided to the neutral inspector.						
	6	Is there any readily visible mold present from a structural problem or defective condition not related to tenant housekeeping?						
	7	Do walls and cellings appear free from current leaks?						
	8	Do ceilings appear collapsed or collapsing?	,					
	9	Do floors appear to be structurally sound?						
Tenant Request		Kitchen	N/A	Ye	s No	Serviceable	Needs Repai	L Corrective Action
	10	Does there appear to be a proper kitchen sink?						
	11	Does the sink appear to be in good working condition?				-		
·	12	Is there hot and cold running water in the sink?					·	
	13	Do all readily observable water supply lines and drain lines appear to be free of leaks?						
	14.	Is the water pressure at an acceptable level?	-					

		4			1			
		J. D. Homes Rental Inspection Checklist		Inte	erior	Inspection Item	ıs	Property I.D. #
iant uest		Interior Structure	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
re	15	Is an oven or stove provided by the landlord for the unit?	1	- 1	1			
		If oven or stove were provided by landlord, do they appear to be in working order?						
re	17	is a refrigerator provided by the landlord for the unit?					}	
		If refrigerator was provided by landlord, does it appear to be in working order?						
		Are the water facilities capable of providing hot and cold running water (hot water at a temperature of not less than 100 degrees)?						
	20.	Does water appear to be free of rust, discoloration and odor free? Note: If "no", landlord will provide a certificate that water has been tested and is safe for use. This certification will satisfy any repair requirement.						
	21	Is there a kitchen in the unit?						
enant quest		Laundry	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
Pre	22	Is a washing machine provided by the landlord for the unit?						
	23	If provided by landlord, does washing machine appear to be in an operable condition?						
Pre	24	Is a laundry dryer provided by the landlord for the unit?						
	25.	If provided by landlord, does laundry dryer appear to be vented to the outside?						
enant equest		Bathroom 1	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repai	L Corrective Action
	26	working condition to serve the unit?				·		
	27	mechanical ventilation?	ŕ					
	28	Does the bathroom or water closet appear to afford						

.

		J. D. Homes Rental Inspection Checklist		Int	erior	Inspection Item	s	Property I.D. #
ant uest		Interior Structure	N/A	Yes	es No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
	29	Do all sinks, showers, and bathtubs drain properly?						
		Do all sink, shower and tub drains/stoppers close fully?				·		
		Do all readily observable water supply lines and drain lines appear to be free of leaks?						·
		Do bathroom plumbing fixtures (shower, faucets, and toilets) have adequate water pressure?						
		Do shower and faucets have hot and cold running water?						
		Are the water facilities capable of providing hot and cold running water (hot water at a temperature of not less than 100 degrees)?						
	35	Does water appear to be free of rust, discoloration and odor free? Note: If "no", landlord will provide a certificate that water has been tested and is safe for use. This certification will satisfy any repair requirement.					,	
enant equest		Bathroom 2	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	TOTOCTURE CONTROL
	36	Does bathroom have a lavatory, bathtub or shower in working condition to serve the unit?						
	37	Is the bathroom or water closet properly ventilated with either an openable window to the outside or mechanical						
	38	Does the bathroom or water closet appear to afford adequate privacy?						
	39	Do all sinks, showers, and bathtubs drain properly?						
	40	The same and the same same same same same same same sam						,
	41	appear to be free of leaks?	S					
	42	Do bathroom plumbing fixtures (shower, faucets, and toilets) have adequate water pressure?						
	43	Do shower and faucets have hot and cold running water?						

		J. D. Homes Rental Inspection Checklist		Int	erior	Inspection Item	s	Property I.D. #
rant Juest		Interior Structure	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
		Are the water facilities capable of providing hot and cold running water (hot water at a temperature of not less than 100 degrees)?						
	45	Does water appear to be free of rust, discoloration and odor free? Note: If "no", landlord will provide a certificate that water has been tested and safe for use. This certification will satisfy any repair requirement.						
nant quest		Bathroom 3	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action .
	46	Does bathroom have a lavatory, bathtub or shower in working condition to serve the unit?						
	47	Is the bathroom or water closet properly ventilated with either an openable window to the outside or mechanical						
	48	Does the bathroom or water closet appear to afford adequate privacy?						
	49	Do all sinks, showers and bathtubs drain properly?						
	50	Do all sinks, showers and tub drains/stoppers close fully?						
	51	Do all readily observable water supply lines and drain lines appear to be free of leaks?						
	-52	Do all bathroom plumbing fixtures (shower, faucets, and toilets) have adequate water pressure?						
	53	Do shower and faucets have hot and cold running water?						
	54	Are the water facilities capable of providing hot and cold running water (hot water at a temperature of not less than 100 degrees)?		,				
	55	Does water appear to be free of rust, discoloration and odor free? Note: If "no", landlord will provide a certificate that water has been tested and is safe for use. This certification will satisfy any repair requirement.						

,

J

	J. D. Homes Rental Inspection Checklist			Int	erior	Inspection Item	s	Property I.D. #
int iest		Interior Structure	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
ant ıest		Fire Safety and Carbon Monoxide	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
·	56	If the unit has fossil fuel heater/appliance or attached garage, is there a Carbon Monoxide detector or alarm in the unit, in good condition, tested and operable?						
		Are smoke detectors located properly – one in every sleeping area?						
	58	Are all smoke detectors tested and operable?						
	59	Are fire extinguisher(s), if required, lawfully located and currently charged?						
nant quest		Gas Lines	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
	60	Is there a smell of natural gas odor in the unit?					,	
enant equest		Electrical Wiring and Equipment	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	L Corroctivo Action L
	61	Does the electrical system appear to be in good working order?	•					
	62	Do all habitable rooms have at least one receptacle and one switched light, and if not, two receptacles?						
	63	Do switches, outlets and electrical fixtures appear to be in good working order and safe for residential use?						
Tenant Request		Heating System and A/C	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	1 Corrective Action 1
	64	Is the heater in good operable condition and capable of delivering a reasonable level of heat (68 degrees)?						
Pre	65	Is an air conditioner provided by the landlord?					>	
	66	If provided by landlord, is the air conditioner in operable condition?						
Pre	67	Is a water cooler provided by the landlord for the unit?					-	
,	68	If provided by landlord, is the water cooler in operable condition?						

	J. D. Homes Rental Inspection Checklist			Inte	erior	Inspection Item	s	Property I.D. #
nant juest		Interior Structure	NA	/es	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
	69	Does water cooler, if any, have any visible leaks?		-				
inant quest		Plumbing	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
	70	Is there any visible evidence of raw sewage?						
	71	Are there any noticeable odors of sewer gases?						
enant equest		Insect and Rodent Infestation	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
	12	Does the unit appear to be free from insect (cockroach and bedbug) infestation?						·
		Does the unit appear to be free from rodent (mice, rats) infestation?						
equest		Windows, Ventilation, Natural Light	N/A	Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
	74	Do all rooms that are meant for sleeping have at least one exterior operable window or exterior door?	,					
	75	Are all windows in good condition and not broken/cracked?						
•	76	Are exterior windows lockable, and locking device is operable in a safe manner, if required by Civil Code section 1941.3(a)(2)?						
	77	Do habitable rooms, in which security window bars are installed, have a safety quick-release mechanism in accordance with state law in operable condition?						
	78	habitable rooms of the unit?						
	79	Do all habitable rooms have natural light from windows to the outside?					5	
Tenant Request		Doors	N/A	Ye	s No	Serviceable	Needs Repai	" L. Corrective Action
	80	Do all exterior entry doors to the common area of the building open and close properly?						

.

	J. D. Homes Rental Inspection-Checklist			Int	erior	Inspection Iten	Property I.D. #	
nant luest		Interior Structure		Yes	No	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
		Do main swinging entry doors to the unit have working deadbolt locks?						
		Do all individual unit/apartment entry doors open and close properly?						
inant quest	Basement		N/A	Yes	Νo	Serviceable	Needs Repair	Corrective Action
>re	83	is there a basement?						
Pre	84	Is the basement being used as a sleeping area?						



EXHIBIT D

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq. SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

TQ:	[Current Tenant Name and address]
FROM:	JD Home Rentals
DATE:	
RE:	Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al., Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062 ("Action")

We are hereby notifying you that the repair or repairs to your unit pursuant to the inspection have been completed. If you are not satisfied with the repairs, you may contact the Ombudsman within 30 calendar days of the date of this notice, setting forth concisely and specifically the reasons for your dissatisfaction with the repairs. The name and contact information for the Ombudsman is as follows:

(TO ADD)

EXHIBIT E

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq. SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

10:	Plaintit	fs' Counsel and JD Hom	es Counsel		
FROM:		, Settlem	ent Administrator		
DATE:					
RE:	Quarter	ly Report:Qua	rter		
NUMBER OF UNITS INSI TO DAT	PECTED	NUMBER OF UNITS SUBJECT TO EXTENDE REPAIR	NUMBER OF TOT. COMPLETED TO NOT NEEDING REPAIRS	DATE OR REF	UMBER OF EXTENDED PAIR UNITS COMPLETED
(Inspector's	s Data)		(JD Homes D	ata)	
					:
	·				·
					}
	}				

EXHIBIT F

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED
SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. 2nd 1152, et seq.
SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT
NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

Extended Repair Form

TO:		, Settlement Administrator
FROM:		, Inspector
DATE:		
RE;		(Unit - Identifier Number or Address)

The above-referenced inspector hereby submits this Extended Repair Form setting forth the specific repairs required and all reasons therefor for repairs that extend beyond the above-referenced unit. The specific repairs and all reasons are set forth in Exhibit A attached hereto.

EXHIBIT G

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentais, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq. SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

TO:	JD Home Rentals
FROM:	, Settlement Administrator
DATE:	
RE:	Extended Repair Form
	Property Address:
cc;	Defendants' Counsel
	are hereby notified that the Settlement Administrator has received the attached pair Form for the above-referenced property.
Your	deadline to challenge the Extended Repair Form is
	allenge will be considered timely made if the mailing of the Challenge Form is
The C	hallenge Form must be mailed to the following address: (Insert)

EXHIBIT H

EXHIBIT H

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED
SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq.
SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT
NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

Extended Repair Challenge Form

TO:	Inspector
FROM:	JD Home Rentals
DATE:	
RE:	(Unit - Identifier Number or Address)
1 D]	Home Rentals hereby challenges the Extended Repair Form received from the Inspector
on	. The reasons for the challenge are attached hereto as Exhibit A.

EXHIBIT I

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED
SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq.
SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT
NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

Inspector's Notice of Impasse

TO:	, Settlement Administrator
FROM:	, Inspector
DATE:	·
RE:	Extended Repair Form Re Unit (Identifier Number or Address)

The Inspector and JD Home Rentals have reached an impasse covering the above-referenced Extended Repair Form.

EXHIBIT J

EXHIBIT J

Yu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED
SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq.
SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT
NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

Settlement Administrator's Notice of Deadline to File Court Challenge

TO:	JD Home Rentals							
FROM:	···	_, Settlement Administrator						
DATE:		-						
RE:	Extended Repair Form Re Unit (Identified Number or Address)							
cc:	Defendants' Counsel Plaintiffs' Counsel							
The	deadline for JD Home Rentals to fil	e a motion with the Court challenging the						
Extended Redate.)	epair Form is	(insert 30 business days after mailing						

EXHIBIT K

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062.

Press Release

Plaintiffs announced today a settlement of the class action lawsuit Vu v. Hovannisian, Superior Court for the County of Fresno, Case No. 14 CE CG 00062, in which Plaintiffs alleged uninhabitable living conditions and deficient maintenance of residential properties against JD Home Rentals and others.

The case was filed on January 9, 2014, and the parties mediated the matter before Retired Federal Judge Oliver Wanger for over 18 months. According to the Plaintiffs, the settlement will resolve the above case against the Defendants, including JD Home Rentals, regarding living conditions alleged in the lawsuit, provide a means of confirming and addressing tenants' complaints regarding their units, and help prevent further disputes between the tenants and the landlord.

Dean Preston of Tenants Together, California's statewide organization for renters' rights and co-counsel in the lawsuit, said "The Defendants in this lawsuit are among the Central Valley's largest residential property managers and/or owners. We believe this is a major settlement of what, to our knowledge, is the largest habitability case ever filed in California. We have achieved through this lawsuit a major breakthrough for thousands of low income tenants in the City and County of Fresno: proactive inspections of a huge portfolio of rental housing to make sure tenants are living in safe, decent, and well maintained homes and, for many tenants, a guaranteed rent freeze for a number of months."

The terms of the settlement, which must be finally approved by a judge, include:

 The right of all tenants who believe there are designated problems in their rental units to have an inspection of their unit by a third party inspector or, for those who do not request an inspection, a guaranteed rent freeze for eight months after approval of the settlement.

- Agreement by the Defendants to make all repairs required by the inspector, that are consistent with the terms of the settlement, along with an enforceable dispute resolution system.
- Establishment of an ombudsman for two years to receive and process tenant complaints.
- Compensation to former tenants through a rent voucher or cash alternative program.
- Agreement that, for one year after the settlement, tenancies may only be terminated by Defendants for good cause

The parties have agreed that _	will admin	ister the settlement, and
tenants with questions about th	e settlement may contact	by calling
or going to the website		

"Our goal all along has been to work with JD Homes to protect the health and safety of the residents of these properties," noted lead counsel Michelle Marie Kezirian who filed the case while at Bet Tzedek Legal Services.

While Defendants dispute the allegations in the lawsuit, they joined plaintiffs' counsel in announcing the news in a joint media release. A spokesperson for JD Homes commented: "We have denied and continue to deny the allegations made in this burdensome and protracted case by the plaintiffs. The settlement will permit us to continue to focus on providing affordable housing in this county without the time-consuming distraction and expense of litigation. This settlement simply serves to reinforce our continuing commitment to the community in providing affordable housing."

Plaintiffs were represented by Michelle Marie Kezirian, Attorney at Law, attorneys from Bet Tzedek Legal Services, Greenstein and McDonald, Kaye, McLane, Bednarski & Litt, LLP, and Tenants Together.

EXHIBIT L

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 08062

GENERAL RELEASE BY REPRESENTATIVE PLAINTIFF/OTHER OCCUPANTS

(Insert name of each Representative Plaintiff/Other Occupant (who are adults) on separate release form)

Pursuant to the terms of the Joint Stipulation and in further consideration therefor, (insert name), on his/her own behalf, hereby fully and finally releases and forever discharges Releasees (as defined below), and each of them, and hereby expressly waives, releases, discharges and relinquishes the following Representative Released Claims (as defined below) against Releasees. This release is on behalf of (insert name of Representative Plaintiff/Other Occupant) only (and any minors for whom they are a parent or guardian) (collectively in this document referred to as the "Releasing Parties"), and not on behalf of the Class. Subject to approval by the Court of the minors' compromises, the following minor or minors are parties to this General Release as "Other Occupants":

(TO BE INSERTED)

Releasees

Defendants DAVID B. HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; JOHN HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, individually and doing business as JD HOME RENTALS; LINDA R. HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; JJD MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATES d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; JD INVESTMENTS; J&V PROPERTIES, INC., a California corporation; BDHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; JDHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; LEHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; WRHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; JHS FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership; JCH FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership; DBH FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership, owners of the properties on the Properties List (as defined herein); and each of them, and each of their fictitious business names, dbas, current and former parent companies, affiliates, subsidiaries, divisions, trusts, limited partnerships, entities, successors, predecessors, related companies, joint ventures or partnerships, and each of their present and former employees, contractors, vendors, all persons, entities or others performing or engaged to perform any work or service relating to any of the units on the Properties List (as defined herein), Lindsay Hovannisian, John Hovannisian, Jr., John David Hovannisian, Whitney Hovannisian, officers, directors, stockholders, spouses, agents, servants, advisors, representatives, attorneys, consultants, insurers, trustees, general and limited partners, predecessors, successors, and assigns and all their heirs, executors, successors, assignees or transferees of the foregoing.

Representative Released Claims

"Representative Released Claims" means claims, demands, rights, debts, obligations, costs, expenses, wages, restitution, disgorgement, benefits of any type, equitable relief, contract obligations, statutory relief penalties, attorneys' fees, costs, interest, actions, liabilities and causes of action that were or might have been asserted (whether in tort, contract or otherwise), for violation of any state or federal law for claims that are set forth or attempted to be set forth in the Complaint in the Action which are, could be or could have been the basis of claims by the Class relating in any way to restitution, disgorgement, equitable relief, injunctive relief or other monetary relief concerning: rent, rent overcharges, rent credits, deposits, disposition of deposits, collection of rent while permitting rental units to be maintained in untenantable or uninhabitable conditions, payment of rent or other monies for an untenantable or uninhabitable unit, expenses incurred to make repairs, and/or other lost money or property paid by (insert name(s)) relating in any way to the condition or maintenance of the unit.

"Representative Released Claims" further means any and all claims, injuries, economic loss, noneconomic loss, personal injuries, emotional distress, stress, mental stress, anxiety, annoyance, discomfort, all statutory damages of any type that may be waived or released, expenses, wages, pensions, demands, damages, debts, suits, liabilities, accounts, obligations, indemnity, contributions, rights, costs, expenses (including any and all attorneys' fees, expenses and court costs), agreements, promises, liens, contractual rights, legal rights, losses, penalties, costs, actions, and causes of action that (insert name) and/or any of the Releasing Parties now have, own or hold, or at any time heretofore ever had, owned or held, or could. shall or may hereafter have, own or hold, of whatever kind or nature, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, contingent or fixed, which may exist or might be claimed to exist from the beginning of time until the Effective Date of the Settlement, which is defined in the Joint Stipulation of Settlement which is attached hereto as Exhibit A and incorporated herein, including, but not limited to, all claims that are asserted, have been asserted or could be asserted against Releasees up to and including the Effective Date of the Settlement, or any other additional right, remedy or relief, whether at law, in equity or otherwise, and the consequences thereof, now and in the future, of any type whatsoever, whether specifically mentioned or not.

The Representative Released Claims include, without limitation all of the following:

- 1. Any and all claims under Business & Professions Code Section 17200, et seq. as set forth in the First Cause of Action of the Complaint, including, but not limited to, the permitting of rental units to be maintained in untenable conditions and continue to collect rent, in violation of the Civil Code, including Sections 1941, 1941.1, 1941.3 and 1942.4 and Health & Safety Code Sections 17980, et seq., engaging in a scheme that caused, permitted and maintained untenable rental units, in violation of Civil Code Sections 1714, 1940.2, 1941, 1941.1, 1941.3, 1942.5, 1954 and the Health & Safety Code Sections, including Sections 17920.3 and 17920.10;
- 2. Any and all claims relating to lost money or property by (insert name(s)) relating to the payment of rent or deposits relating to any of the rental units rented or offered for rent by any of the Defendants in the City and/or County of Fresno, California;

- 3. Any and all claims for injunctive relief or other relief under Business & Professions Code Section 17203:
- 4. Any and all claims set forth or attempted to be set forth in the Second Cause of Action;
- 5. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Third Cause of Action to the extent the Third Cause of Action incorporates the First and Second Causes of Action.
- 6. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Complaint that ID Homes engaged in a pattern and practice of violating the basic housing rights of its tenants by refusing to make its rental properties habitable by refusing to comply with all applicable health and safety laws; and taking advantage of, harassing and retaliating against (insert name(s)) for exerting their rights and request repairs, as alleged in Paragraph 8 of the Complaint;
- 7. Any and all claims relating in any way to any rent rebates or any other return of rent or other charges paid by (insert name(s)) to Defendants relative to any properties rented or offered for rent during the period January 9, 2010 to the end of the Class Period;
- 8. Any and all claims that Defendants have failed to keep the properties habitable and fit for occupancy as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;
- 9. Any and all claims relating to untenantable rental property or properties not meeting the standards of California Civil Code Section 1941.1 and Health & Safety Code Sections 17920, 17920.3 and 179920.10 or other applicable law;
- 10. Any and all claims that Defendants have failed to abate untenantable living conditions after receiving notice of them from tenants and/or the City of Fresno, as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;
- 11. Any and all claims that Defendants have retaliated and/or harassed tenants, including Plaintiffs and others similarly situated, when they attempt to enforce their legal rights as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;
- 12. Any other claim asserted or attempted to be asserted in the Complaint, including any and all claims for injunctive relief, restitution, disgorgement, retroactive rent rebate, rent reductions, rent abatement and attorneys' fees and costs for this Action;
- 13. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Complaint filed in this Action:
- 14. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Third Cause of Action in the Complaint in this Action;

- 15. Any and all claims for physical injuries, personal injuries, respiratory problems, allergies, infections, bites, insomnia, depression, anxiety, emotional distress, fear, frustration, humiliation, hopelessness, discomfort, lost income, mental distress, emotional distress, annoyance, discomfort, property damage;
 - 16. Any and all equitable claims of any type or nature;
- 17. Any and all claims for attorneys' fees and costs in connection with or related to the Action;
- 18. Any and all claims for damages of any type, including compensatory and punitive damages; and
 - 19. Any and all claims for interest of any type.

(<u>insert name(s)</u>) agree not to sue or otherwise make a claim against any of the Releasees that is in any way related to, arises out of or is connected in any way with the Representative Released Claims.

In agreeing to this Release, (<u>insert name(s)</u>) acts on his/her own behalf and on behalf of any and all of his/her heirs, executors, beneficiaries, legal representatives, transferees, agents, assigns, predecessors, successors and attorneys.

(insert name(s)), on his/her own behalf, further waives all rights and benefits afforded by Section 1542 of the Civil Code of the State of California, which states as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

(insert name(s)), on his/her own behalf, expressly waives any and all rights under Section 1542 to the extent Section 1542 may have any application at all to the Releases set forth herein. (insert name(s)) further understands and acknowledges the significance and consequences of the foregoing specific waiver of said Section 1542, waives the provisions of Section 1542 upon the advice of legal counsel, and accepts full responsibility for any injury, damage, or loss which may hereinafter arise in respect of such releases, although unknown or unanticipated at the time of execution of this agreement.

(insert name(s)), on his/her own behalf, further agrees, promises and covenants that neither he/she, nor any person, organization or entity acting on his/her behalf, will file, charge, claim, sue or permit to be filed, charged or claimed, an action or proceeding of any type for damages or other relief (including injunctive, declaratory, monetary or other) against Releasees for any of the Representative Released Claims.

(insert name(s)) further represents and agrees that, other than this Action, (insert name(s)) has not filed or caused to be filed any other complaints, charges, applications, claims or grievances against Defendants and/or Releasees with any local, state or federal agency, court or other body; that he/she will not file or cause to be filed any such complaint, charge, application, claim or grievance at any time hereafter regarding any of the Representative Released Claims; and that if any complaint, charge, application, claim or grievance against Defendants or Releasees is filed on behalf of or with respect to (insert name(s)), he/she will request such agency, court or other body to withdraw from the matter with prejudice.

Willie Thompson further represents and agrees that, other than this Action and a small claims case titled Willie Thompson v. JD Home Rentals and John Hovannisian, Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 15 CESC 00423, which resulted in a judgment in favor of the defendants and which also resulted in dismissal of David Hovannisian. Willie Thompson has not filed or caused to be filed any other complaints, charges, applications, claims or grievances at any time regarding any of the Representative Released Claims; and that if any complaint, charge, application, claim or grievance against Defendants or Releasees is filed on behalf of or with respect to Willie Thompson, he will request such agency, court or other body to withdraw from the matter with prejudice.

DATED:		
	·	(Signature)

EXHIBIT M

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED
SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq.
SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT
NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

SUPERIOR COURT OF CAL	IFORNIA, COUNTY OF FRESNO
NENG VU, et al.,	Case No. 14 CE CG 90062
Plaintiffs. v.	NOTICE OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT AND NOTICE OF FINAL APPROVAL HEARING
JD HOME RENTALS, et al.,	("CLASS NOTICE")
Defendants.	
READ THIS CLASS NOTICE CAREFULLY BECAUSE	THIS SETTLEMENT WILL AFFECT YOUR LEGAL RIGHTS
On, the Superior Court of the State approval of a settlement (the "Settlement") in the Class action is al., Case No. 14 CE CG 00062 (the "Action").	e of California, in and for the County of Fresno, granted preliminary awsuit of Plaintiffs Neng Vu, et al. v. Defendants JD Home Rentals, e
individual and d/b/a JD Home Rentals; Bryce Hovannisian, an in liability partnership; JHS Family Limited Partnership, a Califo	tenants during January 9, 2010 to, in Fresno City or County sian, an individual and d/b/a JD Home Rentals; David Hovannisian, ar dividual and d/b/a JD Home Rentals; BDHOV, LP, a California limited ornia limited liability partnership; JCH Family Limited Partnership, a with the ownership or management of residential properties in the City fendants are involved.
independent inspection of their residential unit, and required repa	meral, that current tenants will have the choice between receiving an airs, or an eight-month rent freeze, but not both. All current tenants will control inspection. Finally, for a period of 12 months, Defendants will
Former tenants will receive a rent credit voucher that we not used, provided the former tenants comply with all claims' re-	vill be valid for two years or a cash alternative rebate if the voucher is quirements.
This Class Notice is available in Hmong and Lao, by ([Same sentence to be included in Hmong and Lao,]	contacting the Settlement Administrator at [telephone number insert].
	<u>OUESTIONS</u>
	ving this Class Notice because records indicate that you are a member be the Action and Settlement to you and inform you of your rights and
2. Who is in the Class? The Class consists of current following paragraphs.	nt and former tenants of the Defendants as further explained in the
	ows: All individuals who, as of
of were not tenants (i.e., leas	ws: All individuals who, on or after January 9, 2010, had been, but, as se signatories and/or adult occupants listed on a lease) in a residential tha partnership or corporation, by any of the Defendants, including ID or County of Fresno, California.
alleges that Defendants routinely maintained their residential dangerous conditions under general standards of maintaining resi	individual and class action claims against Defendants. The Complaint units in generally uninhabitable, untenantable, substandard and/or dential units and under all applicable California statutes and laws. The its; failed to make repairs, required or permitted tenants to make repairs units. Defendants have denied these allegations.
Complete details of all the allegations are on file www. or by contacting the Settlement Administration	with the Fresno County Superior Court, and are available at tor at
unit a tenant occupies or a rent freeze for a period of eight mony years after the Settlement becomes effective or expiration of the a access to an Ombudsman to receive complaints about repairs a perform a single pest control inspection and assessment of each	ass Members will have the option of an independent inspection of the the after the Final Approval Hearing. In addition, for a period of two igreed budget, the Current Tenant Settlement Class Members will have and maintenance matters. Furthermore, a pest control inspector will unit occupied by the Current Tenant Settlement Class. Finally, for a that occurs, JD Home Rentals has agreed not to terminate any tenancy

Some current tenants who do not opt out may move out before the settlement actually takes effect and benefits them. This will include those who request an inspection but move before they receive it. Those current tenants will then be considered former tenants, and will be provided the same Voucher and Cash Alternative opportunity available to former tenants. However, current tenants who do not request an inspection and thus receive the immediate benefit of the rent freeze, and then move, will not qualify for the Voucher or Cash Alternative opportunity, Again, see the Joint Stipulation available in court and on the website for details.

Former Tenant Settlement Class Members will be entitled to a rental credit voucher in the event that they move to a Defendant owned or managed unit within two years of mailing of the voucher; or, if the voucher is not used, a cash amount if applied for after the voucher expires.

Voucher. Each lease agreement is one tenancy group regardless of the number of persons in the group. Vouchers will be divided pro rata where there is more than one member of a tenancy group (which may be combined if they agree among themselves). The Voucher is good for two years from mailing to you and may be transferred one time to a third party. The Voucher may be used as a credit towards the cost of a credit check, with the remainder applied towards the first month's rent. Any former tenant exercising the voucher will not have to post a security deposit. The value of the Voucher depends on the size of the unit formerly rented (and is the same as the maximum available for the Cash Alternative if the Voucher is not used): \$250 for a one-bedroom unit; \$350 for two bedrooms and \$500 for three bedrooms or more in a rental unit. Defendants' records regarding who is a former tenant will control that determination.

Cash Alternative. Former tenant class members who do not use or transfer the Voucher may, after the two year period expires, submit within 45 days the expired Voucher to the Settlement Administrator and seek the Cash Alternative, which will be paid up to the same amounts as the Voucher's value (except that it will be based on \$10 per month of prior tenancy up until the maximum value of the Voucher (e.g., a \$250 youcher would reimburse \$250 for 25 months of prior tenancy, a \$350 Voucher that amount for up to 35 months of prior tenancy, etc.). The Cash Alternative value for all former tenants is capped in the aggregate at \$222,500; if the Cash Alternative claims exceed that amount, they will be divided pro rata.

Defendants have the right to disqualify any former tenant from exercising the voucher, in which case they will automatically be considered to have applied for the Cash Alternative when it is available.

CURRENT TENANT SETTLEMENT CLASS MEMBERS WHO VACATE UNITS

Current Tenant Settlement Class Members who move out of a rental unit owned or managed by Defendants between and the Effective Date of the Settlement (which will be at least 60 days after ______) will be provided the same opportunity as Former Tenant Settlement Class Members to receive the Voucher or Cash Alternative discussed above. After the Effective Date of the Settlement, these class members will be mailed a Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form, which they must send to the Settlement Administrator as directed in that form if they wish to participate in the Voucher or Cash Alternative available to Former Tenant Settlement Class Members.

Current Tenant Settlement Class Members who did not opt out, who were current tenants at the time of the Effective Date of the Settlement, and who requested an inspection, but moved out of their unit before receiving their requested inspection, shall have the right to participate in the Cash Alternative upon the same terms as Former Tenant Settlement Class Members, including the timing of the payment. After vacating the unit, these class members will be mailed a Former Tenant Settlement Class Claim Form, which they must return to the Settlement Administrator within forty-five (45) calendar days of the mailing if they wish to participate in the Cash Alternative available to Former Tenant Settlement Class Members.

Current Tenant Settlement Class Members who did not opt out, who were current tenants at the time of the Effective Date of the Settlement, but who did not request an inspection, and therefore received the immediate benefit of the rent freeze available to such persons (or some portion thereof), shall not have the right to participate in the Voucher or Cash Alternative program.

- 5. <u>I am a Current Tenant. What do I have to do to receive the inspection or rent freeze?</u> After final settlement approval, current tenants will receive from the Settlement Administrator a form allowing them to request an inspection. The basis to request an inspection will be explained in the form. You will have the option of receiving an inspection of your unit by an independent inspector or, for those who do not request an inspection, a rent freeze that will extend for eight (8) months after the Final Approval Hearing. You will have forty-five (45) calendar days from mailing of that form to request the inspection. It is estimated that that form will not be sent until approximately four to five months after the Final Approval Hearing (and possibly longer if there is some type of appeal). You will have to review that form and timely return it or you will not receive an independent inspection, but will receive the rent freeze.
- 6. <u>I am a Former Tenant. What do I have to do to receive the Voucher or Cash Alternative?</u> Former Tenant Settlement Class Members will receive a claim form after the Court finally approves this Settlement (which could take considerable time if there is an appeal). You will have to return the claim form within forty-five (45) calendar days of its mailing or you will not be entitled to receive the Voucher or the Cash Alternative.

The Voucher will be good for up to 24 months from the date of its mailing to you. At the end of the 24-month period, if the Voucher has not been redeemed or transferred by you, you will have forty-five (45) calendar days during the period set forth in the Voucher to return an unused or untransferred Voucher to the Settlement Administrator and seek the Cash Alternative discussed above.

You alone are responsible to keep a copy of your voucher, and the date by which any later claim for a Cash Alternative must be made. It is important that you keep track of the Voucher and the Cash Alternative filing date. A replacement voucher can be obtained by contacting the Settlement Administrator at _____ if you lose your Voucher.

7. 3	The atto	rneys,	their r	ecommend	lation an	<u>d their</u>	requ	est for	atto	rney	<u>y's fees</u> . The at	tomeys	for the Class	have l	been	appoint	ted
by the cou	irt end a	re expe	rience	d in class ac	tions and	housi	ig, Th	еу гесс	mm	end	he settlement	as reasc	mable based	on the	relie	of obtain	æd
and the ris	k of obt	alning	less re	lief, They v	vill apply	to the	court	for fee	s and	d cos	its not to exce	ed \$1,1:	50,000 (in ad	dition	to so	ome fut	<u>lre</u>
monitoria	g legal	costs	up to	\$70,000	after th	ne Eff	ective	Date	σf	the	Settlement),	which	application	will	be	posted	21
www:													- "				

B. How do I opt out if I do not want to be part of the Settlement? You can opt out of the Settlement by notifying the Settlement Administrator in writing of your intent to opt out. You must state your name, address, home or cellular telephone number, and your intention to opt out. It must be received or post-marked no later than ______. Opt out writings must be postmarked and mailed by first class mail, postage prepaid, or delivered, directly to the Settlement Administrator at the following address:

(INSERT)

Any Class Member who properly requests to opt out will not be entitled to receive any portion of the Settlement and will not be bound by the Settlement or have any right to object, appeal or comment thereon. Class Members who do not submit a valid and timely request to opt out shall be bound by all terms of the Settlement if the Settlement is finally approved by the Court.

9. Can I object to the Settlement? The Court will hold a Final Approval Hearing on at in Department of the Superior Court of the State of California in and for the County of Fresno, located at B.F. Sisk Courthouse, 1130 "O" Street, Fresno, California 93721, in Courtroom As a Class Member, you may object to the Settlement. You have the right to object to the Settlement, and you also have the right to object to Class Counsel's request for attorney's fees and costs. To object, you must submit a written statement to the Settlement Administrator postmarked or delivered by

Any objections should clearly explain the Class Member's objection and state whether the Class Member (or someone on his or her behalf) intends to appear at the Final Approval Hearing. If a Class Member submits a timely and complete objection and written notice of intention to appear, the Class Member may (but is not required to) appear personally or through an attorney, at his or her own expense, at the Final Approval Hearing. All timely objections will be considered whether the objector appears or not.

Class Members who unsuccessfully object to the proposed settlement remain class members, and are bound by the Settlement' terms (if finally approved) to the same extent as a Class Member who does not object.

No objecting Class Member shall be personally heard, and no briefs or papers beyond the objection itself submitted by any such person shall be considered by the Court, unless written notice of intention to appear at the Final Approval Hearing, together with copies of all papers and briefs shall have been filed with the Court and mailed to Class Counsel and Defendants' Counsel with a postmark no later than

All objections and written notices of intention to appear must be signed and must contain the Class Member's name, the address of counsel, if any, and the name of and the case number for the Action. Upon request, the objector must also provide the Parties any address information or other necessary information so as to identify the objector.

Any Class member of the who does not object as provided above shall be deemed to have waived such objections and shall be foreclosed from making any objections by appeal or otherwise.

Class Counsel:

Barrett S. Litt Kaye, McLane, Bednarski & Litt, LLP 975 East Green Street Pasadena, CA 91106 Telephone: 626-844-7660

Michelle Marie Kezirian Attorney at Law 2335 E. Colorado Blvd., Suite 115 Pasadena, CA 91107 Telephone: 626-817-6341

Kenneth M. Greenstein Greenstein and McDonald 300 Montgomery St., Suite 621 San Francisco, CA 94104 Telephone: 415-773-1240

Dean Preston Tenants Together 474 Valencia St., Suite 156 San Francisco, CA 94103 Telephone: 415-495-8100

Defendants' Counsel:

William C. Hahesy Law Offices of William C. Hahesy 225 W. Shaw Ave., Suite 105 Fresno, CA 93704

Benjamin T. Nicholson McCormick, Barstow, Sheppard, Wayte & Carruth LLP 7647 N. Fresno St. Fresno, CA 93720

Linda Northrup Northrup Schlueter, A Professional Law Corporation 31365 Oak Crest Drive, Suite 250 Westlake Village, CA 91361

Mark L. Kincaid Kincaid & Associates 1851 E. 1st St., Suite 900 Santa Ana, CA 92705

10. What is the effect of Final Approval of the Settlement? If the Court grants final approval of the Settlement, all Class Members (Current Tenant and Former Tenant Settlement Class Members), are bound by the terms of the Settlement, including the releases set forth in the Joint Stipulation of Settlement. The full releases as contained in the Joint Stipulation of Settlement are set forth in Exhibit 1 attached hereto. By remaining a part of this Class, you are also so agreeing and specifically waive all rights and benefits afforded by section 1542 of the Civil Code of the State of California for the items set forth in the release and nothing else, which provides: A general release does not extend to claims which the creditor does not know or suspect to exist in his or her favor at the time of executing the release, which if known by him or her must have materially affected his or her settlement with the debtor.

11. What if I have further questions about the Settlement or Action? You may contact Class Counsel at the address listed in Question 9 without having to pay for any attorneys' fees. You also have the right to speak with an attorney of your choosing at your own expense. You may also contact the Settlement Administrator with questions about this Settlement at the address listed in Question 8. Please do not contact Defendants' Counsel.

This Class Notice provides you with a summary of some of the terms and conditions of the Settlement. You have the right to view the entire Settlement set forth in the Joint Stipulation of Settlement, as well as the Complaint, which is on file with the Superior Court of the State of California, in and for the County of Fresno, located at B.F. Sisk Courthouse 1130 "O" Street, Fresno, California 93721, and which may be viewed on the website of the Settlement Administrator at www.

You may also obtain a copy from the Settlement Administrator, whose contact information is listed in Question 8. If you need assistance, the Settlement Administrator will assist you in translating the Joint Stipulation of Settlement from English to the language of your preference.

DO NOT CONTACT THE COURT. THE COURT CANNOT PROVIDE YOU WITH LEGAL ADVICE OR ANY OPINION AS TO THIS SETTLEMENT OR LAWSUIT.

EXHIBIT 1

The release language in the Joint Stipulation of Settlement is as follows:

Upon the Effective Date of this Settlement, the Class, Class Members, Charent Tenant Settlement Class Members and Former Tenant Settlement Class Members, and each of them, fully and finally release and forever discharge Releases, and each of them, and shall be deemed to have, and by operation of t Judgment and any related order shall have expressly weived, released, discharged and relinquished the Released Claims defined below. The Released Claims cons. of all such claims from January 9, 2010 to the end of the Class Period.

"Released Claims" means claims, demands, rights, debts, obligations, costs, expenses, wages, restitution, disgorgement, benefits of any type, equitable relief, contract obligations, statutory relief penalties, attorneys' face, costs, interest, actions, liabilities and causes of action that were or might have been assent (whether in tart, contract or otherwise), for violation of any state or federal law for claims that are set forth or attempted to be set forth in the Complaint in the Action which are, could be or could have been the basis of claims by the Class relating in any way to restitution, disgorgement, equitable relief, injunctive relief or otherwise, rent, rent overcharges, rent credits, deposits, disposition of deposits, collection of rent while permitting rental units to be maintained untenentable or uninhabitable conditions, payment of rent or other monies for an untenantable or uninhabitable unit, expenses incurred to make repairs, and/or others money or property paid by a Class Member relating in any way to the condition or maintenance of the unit.

The Released Claims include, without limitation all of the following as it relates to restitution, disgorgement, equitable relief, injunctive relief or monetar relief and all of the following to the extent (and only the extent) of the categories contained in the foregoing paragraph:

- Any and all claims under Business & Professions Code Section 17200, et seq. as set forth in the First Cause of Action of the Complain including, but not limited to, the permitting of rental units to be maintained in untenable conditions and continue to collect rent, in violation of the Civil Code including Sections 1941, 1941.1, 1941.3 and 1942.4 and Health & Safety Code Sections 17980, et seq., engaging in a scheme that caused, permitted and maintaine untenable rental units, in violation of Civil Code Sections 1714, 1940.2, 1941.1, 1941.3, 1942.5, 1954 and the Health & Safety Code including Sections 17920. and 17920.10:
- 2. Any and all claims relating to lost money or property by the Class Members relating to the payment of rent or deposits relating to any of the rental units rented or offered for rent by any of the Defendants in the City and/or County of Fresno, California;
 - Any and all claims for injunctive relief or other relief under Business & Professions Code Section 17203;
 - 4. Any and all claims set forth or altempted to be set forth in the Second Cause of Action;
- 5. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Third Cause of Action to the extent the Third Cause of Action incorporates the Firs and Second Causes of Action.
- 6. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Complaint that JD Homes engaged in a pattern and practice of violating the basic housing rights of its tenants by refusing to make its rental properties habitable by refusing to comply with all applicable health and safety laws; and taking advantage of, harassing and retallating against any tenants who exert their rights and request repairs, as alleged in Paragraph 8 of the Complaint:
- 7. Any and all claims relating in any way to any rent rebates or any other return of rent or other charges paid by any Class Member to Defendants relative to any properties rented or offered for rent during the Class Period;
 - 8. Any and all claims that Defendants have inited to keep the properties habitable and fit for occupancy as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;
- 9. Any and all claims relating to untenantable rental property or properties not meeting the standards of California Civil Code Section 1941.1 and Health & Safety Code Sections 17920, 17920.3 and 17920.10 or other applicable law;
- 10. Any and all claims that Defendants have failed to abute untenantable living conditions after receiving notice of them from tenants and/or the City of Fresno, as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;
- 11. Any end all claims that Defendants have retalisted and/or harassed tenants, including Plaintiffs and others similarly situated, when they attempt to enforce their legal rights as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint; and
- 12. Any other claim asserted or attempted to be asserted in the Complaint, including any and all claims for injunctive relief, restitution, disgorgement, retroactive rent reductions, rent abatement and attorneys' fees and costs for this Action.

Notwithstanding any of the foregoing, the Released Claims do not include, and are not intended to release, demoges claims for physical injury or personal injury (including but not limited to illness, mental stress, emotional distress, anxiety, announce and discomfort), including such demages recoverable under any of the statutes listed in sub-paragraphs 1 and 9. The Released Claims do include statutory damages recoverable under any of the statutes listed in sub-paragraphs 1 and 9, but do not otherwise include statutory damages under any other statute.

With respect to the Released Claims, the Class Members, Current Tenant Settlement Class Members and Former Tenant Settlement Class Members each further waive all rights and benefits afforded by section 1542 of the Civil Code of the State of California. Section 1542 provides:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

The Class Members, Current Tenant Settlement Class Members and Former Tenant Settlement Class Member agree not to sue or otherwise make a claim against any of the Releasees that is in any way related to, arises out of or is connected in any way with the Released Claims.

EXHIBIT N

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED
SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq.
SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT
NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

FORMER TENANT SETTLEMENT CLASS MEMBER CLAIM FORM

Name/Addre	ss Changes (if any):		
First Name	Last Nan	ne	
Address			
City	State	Zip	
() Area Code	Telephone Number	·	
	V 1	u, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al.	
Case No. 14C	ECG00062. You are a For	case of Vu, et al. v. JD Home Renta. rmer Tenant Settlement Class Memb	ls, et al., Fresno County Superior Counter and are entitled to receive a Voucher
	Instructions to Rec	eive Voucher – Read and Follow	all Instructions:
		ve is the address where you want youx to the mailing address above.	ur Voucher mailed. Make any changes
Accord	ling to JD Home Rentals'	records,	
during	A. The address of the the period January 9, 2010		apied as a tenant of JD Home Rentals
	B. The number of lea	ased bedrooms in the unit you occup	pied is
This Claim Fo	rm must be signed in orde	er to receive the Voucher.	
		relosed envelope by	or otherwise deliver it to

[TO BE INSERTED]

If mailed, the timeline of a Claim Form is considered based on the postmark by the U.S. Postal Service. It the Claim Form is delivered by any other means, such as personal delivery, messenger, or Federal Express, the Claim Form is considered submitted when actually received by the Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Settlement Administrator. If your completed Claim Form is lost in the mail or for any reason is not received at the above address, your Claim Form will not be considered unless you have a U.S. Mail return receipt showing that the Claim Form was received at the above address. If you want confirmation that your Claim Form was received, you must send it by certified mail with return receipt requested.

Any Claim Form (1) not postmarked by	; (2) not received by the Settlement
Administrator by the fifth (5th) calendar day after _	; (3) not received by other means by the
Settlement Administrator by	; (4) not signed by the Class Member under penalty of perjury;
and/or (5) that does not otherwise comply with the	claims process is not considered a valid Claim Form and you
will not receive a Voucher.	•

IMPORTANT INFORMATION: You alone are responsible to keep a copy of your Voucher, and keep track of the date by which any later claim for a Cash Alternative must be made. It is important that you keep track of the Voucher claim date and the Cash Alternative claim date. A replacement Voucher can be obtained by contacting the Settlement Administrator at if you lose your Voucher. All of this information is further explained below.

General Information

A. Voucher Program

The terms for the Voucher are summarized here and more specifically set forth in the Settlement, which is available for review at www:

- 1. Each written lease agreement will be a single tenancy group, regardless of the number of signatories, listed parties or other residents. In other words, if a unit was rented under a written lease agreement to one person from January 9, 2010 to January 9, 2011 and then a new tenant started February 1, 2011 to February 1, 2012, there would be two tenancy groups, each of which would be entitled to participate in the Voucher program. If there are multiple Former Tenants in a single tenancy group, the Voucher amount will be divided pro rata and separate Vouchers will be issued to each former tenant in his or her respective amount. If they so desire, the multiple Former Tenants may combine their respective Vouchers and use them for the purposes set forth below.
- 2. The Voucher amount for each single tenancy group will be as follows: \$250 for a one-bedroom unit; \$350 for two bedrooms and \$500 for three bedrooms or more in a rental unit.
- 3. The Voucher may be applied to the cost of a credit check at JD Home Rentals for a future tenancy within a period up to 24 months after mailing of the Voucher with the remainder applied toward the first month's rent for such a tenancy.
 - 4. The Voucher will be good for up to 24 months from the date of mailing.
- 5. The Voucher may be transferred one time by the Former Tenant Settlement Class Member (or, if applicable, the Current Tenants Who Moved) to a person who is not part of the single tenancy group for use

in the same manner.

 \subset

- 6. If a Former Tenant Settlement Class Member seeks to use the Voucher to commence a new tenancy with JD Home Rentals during the above-referenced 24-month period, the former tenant will not be required to post a security deposit for the new tenancy created during the 24-month period. Any future tenancies thereafter may be charged a security deposit by JD Home Rentals.
- 7. In its sole discretion, Defendants may elect to provide the Cash Alternative set forth below to any Former Tenant Settlement Class Member in lieu of providing a Voucher. If a Defendant so elects, the Cash Alternative will be provided to the Former Tenant Settlement Class Members pursuant to the terms for the Cash Alternative as set forth below.

B. Cash Alternative:

- The Cash Alternative relates to those Former Tenant Settlement Class Members who do not participate in the Voucher program by using or transferring it as set forth above, or for whom a Defendant exercises the election to offer the Cash Alternative to a Former Tenant Settlement Class Member in lieu of the Voucher. As set forth above, the Voucher program will be in existence for 24 months after the Voucher is mailed. The Voucher may be transferred one time during that 24-month timeframe. After the 24-month time frame, the Former Tenant Settlement Class Members will have forty-five (45) calendar days during a date certain time frame to return an unused or un-transferred Voucher to the Settlement Administrator and seek the Cash Alternative.
- 3. The amount of the Cash Alternative will be computed for each tenancy group and will be as follows: I bedroom and studio groups: Each tenancy group will get \$10 per occupancy month up to a maximum of \$250; 2 bedroom groups: Each tenancy group will get \$10 per month up to a maximum of \$350; 3 bedroom and up groups: Each tenancy group will get \$10 per month up to a maximum of \$500.

In determining the number of months for each tenancy group, the Settlement Administrator will use the information provided by JD Home Rentals concerning the number of months of occupancy for a single tenancy group. Defendants will agree to fund only up to the total dollar amount of all the claims for the Cash Alternative, with the total funding capped at \$222,500, If the total of the claims for the Cash Alternative is less than \$222,500, Defendants pay the allocated amount for each claim as set forth above. If, however, the total of the claims for the Cash Alternative exceeds \$222,500, each claim shall be reduced on a prorated basis so that Defendants' total obligation to pay is capped at \$222,500.

Signature

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the correct.	e State of California that the foregoing is true and
Signature:	Date: (mm/dd/yyyy):
Name:	·



EXHIBIT O

(Newspaper Notice)

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

Neng Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Class Action Settlement

A proposed class action settlement has been reached in the lawsuit Neng Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Case No. 14 CECG 00062. The lawsuit makes a number of claims, including the Defendants maintained their rental units in generally substandard conditions, which allegedly caused the rental units to suffer from a number of conditions. The lawsuit further claims that tenants were required to pay rent for such untenantable units, incur expenses for making their own repairs and otherwise suffer other monetary damages. Defendants have denied the claims. Nonetheless, Defendants and the Class Representatives have agreed to settle the dispute to avoid the uncertainty and costs of further litigation and trial.

Who is a Class Member?

There are two groups of Class Members: current tenants and former tenants. The Current Tenants, who are referred to as Current Tenant Settlement Class Members, are defined as follows:
"All individuals who, as of are current tenants (i.e. lease signatories and/or adult occupants listed on a lease) in a residential property owned or managed, in whole or in part, including through a partnership or corporation, by any of the Defendants, including JD Home Rentals and/or any of the owners of the units, in the City or County of Fresno, California."
The Former Tenants, who are referred to as Former Tenant Settlement Class Members, are defined as:
"All individuals who, on or after January 9, 2010, had been, but were not as of tenants (i.e. lease signatories and/or adult occupants listed on a lease) in a residential property owned or managed, in whole or in party, including through a partnership or corporation, by any of the Defendants, including JD Home Rentals and/or any of the owners of the units, in the City or County of Fresno, California."
What are my Legal Rights?
This Notice is only a summary. You may obtain more complete information by visiting wwwcom and viewing the full Class Notice, by writing to the address at the bottom of this notice, or by calling the Settlement Administrator at
In general, the Current Tenant Settlement Class Members will have the option of an independent inspection of the unit that a tenant occupies or rent freeze for a period of eight months after In addition, for a period of two years after the settlement becomes effective or expiration of an agreed budget, the Current Tenant Settlement Class Members will have access to an ombudsman to receive complaints about repairs and maintenance

matters. Furthermore, a pest control inspector will perform a single pest control inspection and assessment of each unit occupied by the current tenants. Finally, for a period of 12 months after final approval of the Settlement, if that occurs, JD Home Rentals agrees not to terminate any tenancies except for certain good cause.

If the Settlement is finally approved, you will receive a further notice as a current tenant that will give you a right to select either an independent inspection or the rent freeze.

The Former Tenant Settlement Class Members will be entitled to a rental credit voucher that may be used if they move to a unit owned or managed by Defendant in the City or County of Fresno, California within two years of final approval or, if the voucher is not used or transferred, a cash amount once the voucher expires. The dollar amount of the voucher depends on the size of the unit that the former tenant occupied: \$250 for a one-bedroom unit; \$350 for a two-bedroom unit; and \$500 for three bedrooms or more in a rental unit.

If the Settlement is finally approved, you will subsequently receive a claim form which will give you the opportunity to make a claim for the voucher.

Unless you take steps to exclude yourself from the Settlement, you will be bound by the Settlement (including all releases) and all of the Court's orders if the Court approves the Settlement. This means you will not be able to make any claim that is covered by the Settlement against Defendants or any other Releasees in the future.

If you wish to exclude yourself from this Settlement, you must submit a letter to the Settlement Administrator at the address below postmarked by If you send that letter you will not be entitled to any benefits of the Settlement. If you do not send that
letter, you will be part of the Settlement. Please visit the settlement website at www.settlement.com for more information.
If you wish to object to the Settlement, you must do so by submitting your objections to the Settlement Administrator at the address below postmarked by Please visit the settlement website at wwwcom for more information.
The Final Approval Hearing will be held on, at The Court will, among other things, decide whether the Settlement is
fair, reasonable, adequate and should be approved. The Court will also determine attorneys' fees, costs and expenses and other matters. You may attend the hearing, but you do not have to do so.
This is only a summary regarding this Settlement. For detailed information, including the full text of the Settlement and the Class Notice, please visit wwwcom, call or write to

EXHIBIT P

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

(Order Granting Preliminary Approval)

1 EXHIBIT P 2 3 5 6 SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA 7 COUNTY OF FRESNO 8 NENG VU; WILLIE THOMPSON; ELVIA Case No. 14 CECG 00062 REYES; CATALINA MENDOZA; ANTONIO MARTINEZ; and MALAQUIAS ESTEVEZ CLASS ACTION 10 individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated. 11 [PROPOSED] ORDER CONDITIONALLY CERTIFYING Plaintiffs. 12 CLASS FOR SETTLEMENT PURPOSES ONLY, PRELIMINARILY APPROVING 13 V. CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT. APPROVING NOTICE OF CLASS JOHN HOVANNISIAN, an individual and ACTION SETTLEMENT, AND d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS: DAVID SETTING HEARING FOR FINAL 15 HOVANNISIAN, an individual d/b/a JD APPROVAL HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN 16 an individual, and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability 17 partnership; JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership; JCH 18 Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership and DOES 1-100, inclusive, 19 Defendants. 20 21 this Court, by and through Judge 22 considered Representative Plaintiffs' Motion for Order Conditionally Certifying a Settlement 23 Class, Preliminarily Approving the Joint Stipulation of Settlement ("Joint Stipulation"). 24 Approving Notice of Class Action Settlement, and Setting the Final Approval Hearing, and the 25 papers submitted in support thereof. Michelle Marie Kezirian, Attorney at Law. 2335 E. 26 Colorado Boulevard, Suite 115, Pasadena CA 91107; Dean Preston of Tenants Together, 995 27 Market Street, Suite 1202, San Francisco, CA 94103; Barrett Stephen Litt of Kaye, McLane, 28

Bednarski & Litt, LLP, 975 East Green Street, Pasadena, CA 91106; Kenneth M. Greenstein of Greenstein and McDonald, 300 Montgomery Street, Suite 621, San Francisco, CA 91404; and Julius C. Thompson of Bet Tzedek Legal Services, 3250 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1300, Los Angeles, CA 90010 appeared as Class Counsel for the Representative Plaintiffs and the Settlement Class. Benjamin T. Nicholson of McCormick Barstow, LLP, 7647 North Fresno Street, P.O. Box 28912, Fresno, CA 93729-8912; William C. Hahesy of Law Offices of William C. Hahesy, 225 W. Shaw Avenue, Suite 105, Fresno, CA 93704; Mark L. Kincaid of Kincaid & Associates, LLP, 1851 East First Street, Suite 900, Santa Ana, CA 92705; and Linda Northrup of Northrup Schlueter Professional Law Corporation, 31365 Oak Crest Drive, Suite 250, Westlake Village, CA 91361 appeared on behalf of JOHN HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; DAVID HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, and JCH Family Limited Partnership, a

Having considered the Joint Stipulation, as well as the documents filed in support thereof, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT:

- This Order incorporates by reference the definitions in the Joint Stipulation and all terms defined therein shall have the same meaning in this Order.
- 2. The Court finds that the Class, as defined in the Joint Stipulation, meets all the requirements for class certification of a settlement Class. The Court hereby conditionally certifies the Class for settlement purposes only. In the event the Final Judgment is overturned, reversed, not affirmed in its entirety or never becomes final, the Effective Date of the Joint Stipulation does not occur or the Joint Stipulation is nullified or invalidated for any reason, the fact that the Parties were willing to stipulate to Class certification only as part of the Joint Stipulation shall have no bearing on, nor be admissible in connection with, any issue in this Action or in any other action.

	1	
1	3,	Representative Plaintiffs, Neng Vu; Willie Thompson; Elvia Reyes; Catalina
2	Mendoza;	Antonio Martinez; and Malaquias Estevez, are hereby appointed and designated, for
3	all purpose	s, as the Representative Plaintiffs and the representative of the Class for settlement
4	purposes.	
5	4.	The following attorneys are hereby appointed and designated as counsel for the
6	Representa	tive Plaintiffs and the Class for settlement purposes ("Class Counsel"):
7	,	Michelle Marie Kezirian
8		Attorney at Law 2335 E. Colorado Boulevard, Suite 115
9.		Pasadena, CA 91107
10	e	T: 626-817-6341 F: 626-628-2151
11		Dean Preston
12		Tenants Together 995 Market Street, Suite 1202
13		San Francisco, CA 94103
14		T: 415-495-8100 F: 415-495-8020
15		Barrett Stephen Litt
16		Kaye, McLane, Bednarski & Litt, LLP 975 East Green Street
17		Pasadena, CA 91106
18		T: (626) 844-7660 F: (626) 844-7670
19		Kenneth M. Greenstein
20		Greenstein and McDonald
21		300 Montgomery Street, Suite 621 San Francisco, CA 91404
22		T: 415-773-1240 F: 415-773-1244
23		Julius C. Thompson
24		Bet Tzedek Legal Services
25		3250 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 1300 Los Angeles, CA 90010
26 27		T: 323-939-0506 F: 213-471-4568

28

beginning as soon as practicable after the first mailing of the Notice to the Class. The Notice to be published in the newspaper shall be the Newspaper Notice attached hereto as Exhibit C and incorporated herein, which Newspaper Notice is approved.

- 12. The Notice attached hereto as Exhibit B shall also be available on a website established by the Settlement Administrator beginning no later than the date that the Settlement Administrator first mails the Class Notice as referenced above.
 - 13. The Class Period shall be January 9, 2010 through ______,
- 14. The Court finds that the Class conditionally certified for settlement purposes consists of the following group of individuals:

CURRENT TENANT SETTLEMENT CLASS

The "Current Tenant Settlement Class" is defined as all individuals who, at the time of the Order Granting Preliminary Approval of this Joint Stipulation of Settlement, are current tenants (i.e., lease signatories and/or adult occupants listed on a lease) in a residential property owned or managed, in whole or in part, including through a partnership or corporation, by any of the Defendants, including JD Home Rentals and/or any of the owners of the units listed on the Properties List (as defined herein), in the City or County of Fresno, California.

The Current Tenant Settlement Class Members are all those who meet the definition of the Current Tenant Settlement Class and do not opt out of the Settlement.

FORMER TENANT SETTLEMENT CLASS

The Former Tenant Settlement Class is defined as all individuals who, on or after January 9, 2010, had been, but were not as of the time of the Order Granting Preliminary Approval of this Joint Stipulation of Settlement, tenants (i.e., lease signatories and/or adult occupants listed on a lease) in a residential property owned or managed, in whole or in part, including through a partnership or corporation, by any of the Defendants, including JD Home Rentals and/or any of the owners of the units listed on the Properties List (as defined herein), in the City or County of Fresno, California.

The Former Tenant Settlement Class Members are all those who meet the definition of the Former Tenant Settlement Class and do not opt out of the Settlement.

28 da

Current Tenants who move such that they no longer qualify as current tenants between the filing date of the Order Granting Preliminary Approval of the Settlement and the Effective Date of the Settlement shall not be considered Former Tenant Settlement Class Members for purposes of sending class notice and being provided the option to opt out as Former Tenant Settlement Class Members. They will have received notice as and still be considered as Current Tenant Settlement Class Members.

Current tenants who did not opt out, who were current tenants at the time of the Effective Date of the Settlement, and who requested an inspection, but moved out of their unit before receiving their requested inspection, shall have the right to participate in the Cash Alternative program upon the same terms as Former Tenant Settlement Class Members.

Current tenants who did not opt out, who were current tenants at the time of the Effective Date of the Settlement, but who did not request an inspection, and therefore received the immediate benefit of the rent freeze available to such persons (or some portion thereof), shall not have the right to participate in the Voucher or Cash Alternative program.

- 15. The Court sets the following further dates for purposes of this Action:
- a. <u>Class Data</u>: Defendants shall provide the information set forth in Section 4.A. of the Joint Stipulation to the Settlement Administrator within sixty (60) calendar days from the filing date of this Order Granting Preliminary Approval.
- b. <u>First Mailing of Class Notice to Class</u>: Within sixty (60) calendar days of the receipt of the above-referenced data.
- First Publication of the Newspaper Notice to Class: The first publication of the Newspaper Notice in The Fresno Bee and Vida En El Valle shall occur no later than seven (7) calendar days from the first mailing of the Notice to the Class.
- d. <u>Follow-up Mailing of Notice Where First Mailing is Returned</u>: To be completed as needed, but no later than thirty (30) calendar days after the first mailing set forth in paragraph 13.b. above.
- e. <u>Deadline to Opt-Out of Settlement Class</u>: Sixty (60) calendar days of the date of the first mailing of the Class Notice.

ł								
ı	such documents; explains why they are being delivered and served and advises the recipients							
2	that counsel must present any claim to the amounts set forth in the Joint Stipulation relative to							
3	attorneys' fees, costs or expenses (or any portions thereof) by no later than fourteen (14)							
4	calendar days for the deadline for filing objections to the Settlement. Class Counsel shall							
5	further advise the attorneys that any claims for attorneys' fees, costs or expenses will be							
6	extinguished by the Judgment.							
7:	tre to so obbeded							
8	IT IS SO ORDERED.							
9	DATED:							
10	Judge of the Fresno County Superior Court							
11								
12								
13								
14								
15								
16								
17								
18								
19								
20								
21								
22								
23								
24								
25								
26								
27								
28	- PRELIMINARY APPROVAL ORDER							
	P_Q							

EXHIBIT Q

Vu. et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

(Final Judgment)

EXHIBIT R

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED
SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq.
SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT
NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

VOUCHER

Pursuant to the terms of the Settlement approved by the Fresno County Superior Court, this Voucher is issued to:

1.	Name:
2.	Date of Mailing of Voucher:
3.	Amount of Voucher:
4.	Use of Voucher:
Rentals for a fi mailing of Vou rent for such a	a. This Voucher may be applied to the cost of a credit check at JD Home sture tenancy by no later than (24 months after scher). The remainder of the Voucher may be applied toward the first month's tenancy by no later than (24 months after mailing of Voucher).
mailing of Vo	b. This Voucher will expire on (24 months after acher).
(date of mailing your tenancy go transfer it may no later than	This Voucher may be transferred one time by you between (24 months after mailing) to a person who was not part of roup while you were a tenant at JD Home Rentals. The person to whom you use the Voucher in the same manner as set forth above. Any such use must occur (24 months after date of mailing). The transferree is not entitled emative set forth below.
return the Vouc	i. If you do not use the Voucher or transfer it as set forth above, you may her to the Settlement Administrator between and and seek the Cash Alternative set forth below. The address for the Settlement (INSERT).
	You will not be receiving any further notice concerning your ability to

the Voucher or, if you lose the Voucher and it is not redeemed by anyone else for use in connection with a future tenancy, you may contact the Settlement Administrator to obtain

a substitute Voucher.

In order to claim the Cash Alternative you must retain possession of

g. It will be your responsibility to keep track of the dates when you may make a claim for the Cash Alternative. If you do not make a claim within the time frame set forth above, you will not be able to receive any portion of the Cash Alternative.

EXHIBIT S

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED
SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq.
SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT
NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

Notice re: Ombudsman

	settlement of the above-referenced case, the Court has out repair and maintenance matters. The Ombudsman
is	, whose contact information is as follows: (TC
INSERT).	
tenants relative to repairs and maintenance of units ma	ive and endeavor to resolve complaints from a tenant or naged by JD Home Rentals. The Ombudsman will not be pair or maintenance requests from JD Home Rentals. JD airs or maintenance in the first instance.
The Ombudsman will serve until the earlier Ombudsman budget.	of or the exhaustion of the

EXHIBITT

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Rentals, et al.
Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 80062

CONFIDENTIAL AND PRIVILEGED
SUBJECT TO EVIDENCE CODE §§ 1115, et seq. and 1152, et seq.
SUBJECT TO CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT
NOT TO BE USED FOR ANY PURPOSE OTHER THAN THIS ACTION

CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT

THIS AGREEMENT is made this _____ day of _____, and is effective

nbou	the				-		occurs			an	
		 	•	 		 			·		
							parties				

WHEREAS, Representative Plaintiffs and Defendants are parties to a Joint Stipulation of Settlement in an action known as NENG VU, et al., individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated v. JOHN HOVANNISIAN, an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; DAVID HOVANNISIAN, an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership; JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership and DOES 1-100, Case No. 14 CE CG 00062, pending in the Superior Court for the State of California, Fresno County ("Action"). The Joint Stipulation of Settlement is attached hereto as Exhibit A. The definitions used therein are incorporated herein.

WHEREAS, Class Counsel is representing the Representative Plaintiffs and the putative Class Members in the above-referenced Action;

WHEREAS, Defendants' Counsel is representing Defendants in the above-referenced action:

WHEREAS, the Fresno County Superior Court has preliminarily approved the Joint Stipulation of Settlement in the above-referenced Action and the settlement is pending final approval by the Court;

WHEREAS, as part of the Joint Stipulation of Settlement, Representative Plaintiffs and Class Counsel, on the one hand, and Defendants and Defendants' Counsel, on the other hand all agree that as a condition to and as part of the Court finally approving the Settlement, the above-referenced individuals must execute a Confidentiality Agreement in this form and content agreeing as set forth below;

WHEREAS, the Parties thus desire into this Confidentiality Agreement, subject to its final approval by the Court;

WHEREAS, the Parties hereby desire to enter into this Agreement on the terms and conditions set forth below:

NOW THEREFORE, the parties hereto, intending to be legally bound, agree as follows:

- 1. For purposes of this Agreement, "Covered Information" shall mean all work product or other information generated by, for or relating in any way to Action, including the Joint Stipulation of Settlement and/or by, for or relating to any inspections, repairs or other work performed under the Joint Stipulation of Settlement or Judgment by anyone, including any Defendants, as well as all information which has been or will be disclosed by one party, or one of its affiliates to the other, whether set forth orally or in writing.
- 2. Covered Information shall not be used or disclosed for any purpose other than for the purposes set forth in this Agreement. The Parties hereby agree to hold in strictest confidence any and all Covered Information and further that the Covered Information shall not be used for any purpose than solely in connection with this Action and shall not be used in or admissible in any other proceeding, except that information pertinent to a particular unit may be used by a tenant in opposition to an unlawful detainer action or to enforce the settlement in this action.
- 3. Covered Information will not be disclosed to any person other than a party hereto and to employees and agents that have a need to know such information to effectuate the purpose of this Agreement and work requested to be performed by a party and that such employees and agents shall be informed of this Confidentiality Agreement and shall be bound by at least as restrictive terms as those contained in this Agreement.
- 4. The execution and performance of this Agreement does not obligate the parties to enter into any other agreement or to perform any obligations other than as specified herein.
- 5. The receiving party agrees that the disclosure of Covered Information to any third party without the express written consent of the disclosing party may cause irreparable harm to the disclosing party, and that any breach or threatened breach of this Agreement by the receiving party will entitle the disclosing party to seek injunctive relief, in addition to any other legal remedies available to it, in any court of competent jurisdiction.
- 6. No failure or delay by the disclosing party in exercising any right, power, or privilege hereunder shall operate as a waiver thereof, nor shall any single or partial exercise thereof preclude any other or future exercise thereof or the exercise of any other right, power or privilege hereunder.
- 7. This Agreement shall be governed by the laws of the State of California without reference to its conflict of laws rules. This agreement may not be amended or in any manner modified except by a written instrument signed by authorized representatives of both Parties. If any provision of this Agreement is found to be unenforceable, the remainder shall be enforced as fully as possible and the unenforceable provision shall be deemed modified to the limited extent required to permit its enforcement in a manner most closely representing the intention of the Parties as expressed herein.

- 8. This Agreement shall be binding on each party's successors and assigns.
- 9. This Agreement may be executed in two or more counterparts, each of which shall be deemed an original, but all of which shall constitute the same agreement.

SIGNATURES TO BE ADDED

AMENDMENT TO JOINT STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT

AMENDMENT TO JOINT STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT

AMENDMENT TO JOINT STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT

This Amendment to Joint Stipulation of Settlement ("Amendment to Joint Stipulation") is made and entered into by and between Defendants JOHN HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; DAVID HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership; JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership; and JCH Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership and DOES 1 - 100 ("Defendants"), on the one hand, and Plaintiffs NENG VU; WILLIE THOMPSON; ELVIA REYES; CATALINA MENDOZA; ANTONIO MARTINEZ; and MALAQUIAS ESTEVEZ (the "Representative Plaintiffs"), on the other hand, on behalf of themselves and on behalf of all putative class members (as defined in the Joint Stipulation of Settlement ("Joint Stipulation"), in the action pending in the Superior Court of the State of California, Fresno County (the "Court"), Case No. 14 CE CG 00062 (the "Action") and subject to the terms and conditions hereof and the Joint Stipulation. This Amendment to Joint Stipulation, along with the Joint Stipulation, are subject to approval of the Court and are made for the sole purpose of attempting to consummate settlement of this Action on a class-wide basis subject to the following terms and conditions. By entering into this Amendment to Joint Stipulation, Defendants do not make any admissions, including that the Action is properly certified as a class action. As detailed in the Joint Stipulation, in the event the Court does not enter an order granting preliminary and final approval of the Joint Stipulation, the Amendment to Joint Stipulation, the Joint Stipulation or the conditions precedent are not met for any reason, this Amendment to Joint Stipulation and Joint Stipulation shall be void and shall be of no force or effect whatsoever.

Section 10 of the Joint Stipulation is hereby amended as follows:

SECTION 10 - SETTLEMENT OF REPRESENTATIVE PLAINTIFFS' INDIVIDUAL CLAIMS AND CLAIMS BY OTHER OCCUPANTS

The Representative Plaintiffs have made claims on their own behalf and on behalf of all Other Occupants in the units occupied or formerly occupied by the Representative Plaintiffs at any time up to the ending dates of the general releases as set forth in Exhibit L. The claims include, without limitation, allegations of general and special damages, pain and suffering, emotional distress, rent rebates, and personal injuries. In connection with this Settlement, all of the claims by the Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants from the beginning of time up until the ending dates of the general releases as set forth in Exhibit L will be resolved, subject to Court approval of this Settlement and Court approval of any and all necessary minor compromises.

Within thirty (30) calendar days of the latter of the Effective Date of the Settlement, receipt of all general releases from all Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants in the form attached hereto as Exhibit L, all necessary Court orders approving this Settlement, including all necessary minors' compromises and receipt by Defendants of all required information from the Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants concerning dates of birth, taxpayer identification numbers or any other information that may be required by law or by any insurer of any Defendant and all required communications from Medicare or other government agencies or representatives concerning any and all liens as discussed further below, Defendants will pay the total sum of Two Hundred Forty-Thousand Dollars (\$240,000.00) to Class Counsel, into an attorney trust account designated by Plaintiffs' counsel, for all the Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants. These are not incentive award payments, but rather are compensation for alleged personal injuries or physical injuries as set forth further in the releases attached as Exhibit L. The total sum will be allocated as follows:

A.	<u>Oc</u>	cupants at 3508 S. Elm Ave., #107, Fresno, CA	ALLOCATED SUM
	1.	Malaquias Esteves	\$40,186.00
	2.	Angelica Luengas	\$5,000.00
	3.	Jesucita Esteves	\$4,000.00
	4.	Pedro Santiago	\$2,500.00
	5,	Erika Esteves	\$4,000.00
	6.	Yesenia Esteves	\$4,000.00
	7.	Carlos Esteves	\$5,000.00
	B.	Mauricio Esteves	\$4,000,00
	9.	Jocenith Santiago	\$2,000.00
B.	Occ	upants at 230 W. Geary St., Fresno, CA	
	t.	Elvia Reyes	\$36,792.00
	2.	Hector Miranda Carbajal	\$5,000.00
	3.	Hector Miranda Reyes	\$3,000.00
	4.	Diamante Miranda	\$3,000.00
	5.	Miriam Miranda Reyes	\$5,000.00
	6.	Adrian Ventura Miranda	\$3,000.00
	7.	Esmeralda Ventura Miranda	\$3,000.00
	8.	Savannah Elvía Miranda	\$2,000.00
	9.	Ruby Maday Oros Miranda	\$2,000.00
	10.	Zayliah Medina Miranda	\$2,000.00
C.	Occu	pants at 2616 E. Washington St., Apt. 102, Fresno	, CA
	1.	Catalina Mendoza	\$20,022.00
	2.	Antonio Martinez Vega	\$5,000.00
	3,	Rene Martinez	\$3,000.00
	4.	Iccel Evelina Martinez	\$3,000.00
	5.	Emily Elizabeth Martinez	\$3,000.00
	6.	Cathy Ariana Martinez	\$2,000.00

D. Previous Occupant of 3622 E. Clay St., Apt. B. Fresno, CA

1. Neng Vu

\$28,000.00

2. Zang Moua

\$5,000.00

E. <u>Previous Occupant of 2211 W. Princeton Ave., Fresno, CA and 360 N. Roosevelt</u> Ave., #101, Fresno, CA

1. Willie Thompson

\$35,500.00

The Class Counsel will have the responsibility for seeking and obtaining all necessary orders from the Court approving all minor compromises. All minor compromises must be obtained prior to the Final Approval Hearing and any orders must be expressly conditioned on the Court finally approving this Joint Stipulation and the Effective Date of the Settlement having occurred. Any and all payments to a minor shall be made as specifically stated in the minor's compromise order or other orders relating to funds paid for the benefit of a minor listed above.

Class Counsel represents that they have all necessary and binding written consents from each of their clients (Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants) to enter into this Agreement and to the allocation of sums as set forth above between the Representative Plaintiffs and Other Occupants.

A. Representative Plaintiffs agree and acknowledge that it is their sole and exclusive obligation to satisfy all liens, conditional payments, debts, rights of subrogation, and/or any other claims or actions asserted against them and/or the proceeds of this settlement, whether now known or unknown, including, but not limited, to any liens by any medical provider, or any Medicaid or Medicare liens resulting from the payment of expenses for hospital or other care and treatment of Plaintiffs and/or Other Occupants. Prior to payment of any settlement funds under this Section, the Representative Plaintiffs, Other Occupants and Class Counsel shall certify that there are no non-Medicare liens that relate to the payment of any of the settlement funds set forth in this Section regarding which there is not an agreement for its satisfaction from the settlement proceeds. In addition, prior to payment of any settlement funds under this Section, the insurance carriers for Defendants will report the names of the Representative Plaintiffs and Other

Occupants to the appropriate government agencies for the purpose of determining if there are any Medicare or other government liens. The payment of the settlement funds under this Section will not be made until final letters have been received from Medicare and other government agencies or representatives, which will state whether or not there are any Medicare or other liens to any government agency and the total amounts needed to satisfy the lien or liens applicable to each person. If there are any such liens, the amounts paid under this Section for a particular person shall first be used to pay such lien or liens by a check or checks issued to Medicare or other government agency, with any excess to be paid by check to the particular Representative Plaintiff and/or Other Occupant and delivered to Class Counsel with a notation of the deduction for the applicable lien.

- B. Representative Plaintiffs further agree to release Releasees and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers from any liens, debts, rights of subrogation, and/or any other claims or actions asserted against them and/or the proceeds of this Settlement by anyone claiming by, through or under Representative Plaintiffs or Occupants, whether now known or unknown, including any Medicaid or Medicare liens resulting from the payment of expenses for hospital or other care and treatment of Representative Plaintiffs and/or Other Occupants.
- C. Representative Plaintiffs further agree to defend, indemnify and hold harmless Releasees and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers from any damages, demands for payment or reimbursement, liens, debts, rights of subrogation, and/or any other claims or actions asserted against them and the proceeds of this Settlement, by anyone claiming by, through or under Representative Plaintiffs or Other Occupants, whether now known or unknown, including any Medicaid or Medicare liens resulting from the payment of expenses for hospital or other care and treatment of Representative Plaintiffs and/or Other Occupants.
- D. Representative Plaintiffs specifically warrant that they are not aware of any Medicare or Medicaid benefits paid for the medical care and treatment rendered to treatment of Representative Plaintiffs and/or Other Occupants except as may be revealed as a result of the reporting and disclosure set forth above in Paragraph A. Representative

Plaintiffs further warrant that any Medicare or Medicaid liens, whether now known or unknown, resulting from the payment of expenses for hospital or other care and treatment of injuries and damages claimed by Plaintiffs and/or Other Occupants, will be fully satisfied, if sufficient funds exist from the allocated payments in this Section, as set forth herein. If insufficient funds exist to fully satisfy a lien, the lien will be partially satisfied only, with no remaining proceeds payable to the particular Representative Plaintiff or Other Occupant from the settlement proceeds.

- E. Provision of All Information Necessary for Section 111 Reporting and Any Other Required Reporting: Representative Plaintiffs will provide Releasees and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers with complete, accurate, and upto-date information regarding Representative Plaintiffs' and Other Occupants' Medicare and other government aid eligibility status. Representative Plaintiffs also will provide any and all information Releasees and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers require to facilitate and meet their reporting obligations under 42 U.S.C. §1395y(b)(8). Such information may include, but is not limited to: Representative Plaintiffs' full name, Social Security Number (SSN), Medicare Health Insurance Claim Number (HICN), gender, and date of birth or any other information that may be required by law or by any insurer of any Defendant.
- F. Representations and Warranties Regarding Medicare Eligibility and Conditional Payments: Representative Plaintiffs represent and warrant that they have provided Releasees and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers with complete, accurate, and up-to-date information regarding Representative Plaintiffs' and Other Occupants' Medicare and other government aid eligibility status. The parties agree that all representations and warranties made herein shall survive settlement.
- G. Remedies for Breach and Protection of Medicare's Interests: The parties agree that, in the event of a breach of the representations and warranties made by Representative Plaintiffs in the paragraphs above, Releasees and their agents, representatives, attorneys and insurance carriers shall be entitled to set off any remaining payments due under the terms of this Settlement, as well as to the full extent of damages

and other relief available at law and equity.

H. The parties have attempted to resolve this matter in compliance with both state and federal law, and believe that the settlement terms adequately consider Medicare's interest and do not reflect any attempt to shift responsibility for payment of medical expenses covered under this settlement to Medicare pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 1395y(b). The parties acknowledge and understand that any present or future action or decision by CMS or Medicare, including actions regarding the Representative Plaintiffs' eligibility or entitlement to receive Medicare or Medicare payments, will not render this Release void or ineffective, or in any way affect the finality of this Settlement.

Exhibit L to the Joint Stipulation is hereby amended as follows:

EXHIBIT L

Vu, et al. v. JD Home Reutals, et al. Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 14 CECG 00062

GENERAL RELEASE BY REPRESENTATIVE PLAINTIFF/OTHER OCCUPANTS

(Insert name of each Representative Plaintiff/Other Occupant (who are adults) on separate release form)

Pursuant to the terms of the Joint Stipulation and in further consideration therefor, (insert name), on his/her own behalf, hereby fully and finally releases and forever discharges Releasees (as defined below), and each of them, and hereby expressly waives, releases, discharges and relinquishes the following Representative Released Claims (as defined below) against Releasees. This release is on behalf of (insert name of Representative Plaintiff/Other Occupant) only (and any minors for whom they are a parent or guardian) (collectively in this document referred to as the "Releasing Parties"), and not on behalf of the Class. Subject to approval by the Court of the minors' compromises, the following minor or minors are parties to this General Release as "Other Occupants":

(TO BE INSERTED)

Releasees

Defendants DAVID B. HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; JOHN HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; BRYCE HOVANNISIAN, individually and doing business as JD HOME RENTALS; LINDA R. HOVANNISIAN, individually and d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; JJD MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATES d/b/a JD HOME RENTALS; JD INVESTMENTS; J&V

PROPERTIES, INC., a California corporation; BDHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; JDHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; LEHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; WRHOV, LP, a California limited partnership; JHS FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership; JCH FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership; DBH FAMILY LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, a California limited partnership, owners of the properties on the Properties List (as defined herein); and each of them, and each of their fictitious business names, dbas, current and former parent companies, affiliates, subsidiaries, divisions, trusts, limited partnerships, entities, successors, predecessors, related companies, joint ventures or partnerships, and each of their present and former employees, contractors, vendors, all persons, entities or others performing or engaged to perform any work or service relating to any of the units on the Properties List (as defined herein), Lindsay Hovannisian, John Hovannisian, Jr., John David Hovannisian, Whitney Hovannisian, officers, directors, stockholders, spouses, agents, servants, advisors, representatives, attorneys, consultants, insurers, trustees, general and limited partners, predecessors, successors, and assigns and all their heirs, executors, successors, assignees or transferees of the foregoing.

Representative Released Claims

"Representative Released Claims" means claims, demands, rights, debts, obligations, costs, expenses, wages, restitution, disgorgement, benefits of any type, equitable relief, contract obligations, statutory relief penalties, attorneys' fees, costs, interest, actions, liabilities and causes of action that were or might have been asserted (whether in tort, contract or otherwise), for violation of any state or federal law for claims that are set forth or attempted to be set forth in the Complaint in the Action which are, could be or could have been the basis of claims by the Class relating in any way to restitution, disgorgement, equitable relief, injunctive relief or other monetary relief concerning: rent, rent overcharges, rent credits, deposits, disposition of deposits, collection of rent while permitting rental units to be maintained in untenantable or uninhabitable conditions, payment of rent or other monies for an untenantable or uninhabitable unit, expenses incurred to make repairs, and/or other lost money or property paid by (insert name(s)) relating in any way to the condition or maintenance of the unit.

"Representative Released Claims" further means any and all claims, injuries, economic loss, noneconomic loss, personal injuries, emotional distress, stress, mental stress, anxiety, annoyance, discomfort, all statutory damages of any type that may be waived or released, expenses, wages, pensions, demands, damages, debts, suits, liabilities, accounts, obligations, indemnity, contributions, rights, costs, expenses (including any and all attorneys' fees, expenses and court costs), agreements, promises, liens, contractual rights, legal rights, losses, penalties, costs, actions, and causes of action that (insert name) and/or any of the Releasing Parties now have, own or hold, or at any time heretofore ever had, owned or held, or could, shall or may hereafter have, own or hold, of whatever kind or nature, whether known or unknown, suspected or unsuspected, contingent or fixed, which may exist or might be claimed to exist from the beginning of time until the Effective Date of the Settlement (except as expressly limited to the earlier period as set forth in the next paragraph below), which is defined in the Joint Stipulation of Settlement which is attached hereto as Exhibit A and incorporated herein, including, but not limited to, all claims that are asserted, have been asserted or could be asserted against Releasees up to and including the Effective Date of the Settlement (except as expressly limited to the earlier period as set forth in the next paragraph below), or any other additional right, remedy or relief, whether at law, in equity or otherwise, and the consequences thereof, now and in the future, of any type whatsoever, whether specifically mentioned or not.

Notwithstanding the immediately preceding paragraph, for claims for personal injury or physical injury damages only (and not for any of the other claims referenced in this release), the release of claims for personal injury or physical injury damages is from the beginning of time up to and including the date of filing in the Court by the Plaintiffs' Counsel of the motion for preliminary approval of the Settlement as set forth in Section 13 of the Joint Stipulation of Settlement.

The Representative Released Claims include, without limitation all of the following:

- 1. Any and all claims under Business & Professions Code Section 17200, et seq. as set forth in the First Cause of Action of the Complaint, including, but not limited to, the permitting of rental units to be maintained in untenable conditions and continue to collect rent, in violation of the Civil Code, including Sections 1941, 1941.1, 1941.3 and 1942.4 and Health & Safety Code Sections 17980, et seq., engaging in a scheme that caused, permitted and maintained untenable rental units, in violation of Civil Code Sections 1714, 1940.2, 1941, 1941.1, 1941.3, 1942.5, 1954 and the Health & Safety Code Sections, including Sections 17920.3 and 17920.10;
- 2. Any and all claims relating to lost money or property by (<u>insert name(s)</u>) relating to the payment of rent or deposits relating to any of the rental units rented or offered for rent by any of the Defendants in the City and/or County of Fresno, California;
- 3. Any and all claims for injunctive relief or other relief under Business & Professions Code Section 17203:
- 4. Any and all claims set forth or attempted to be set forth in the Second Cause of Action:
- 5. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Third Cause of Action to the extent the Third Cause of Action incorporates the First and Second Causes of Action.
- 6. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Complaint that JD Homes engaged in a pattern and practice of violating the basic housing rights of its tenants by refusing to make its rental properties habitable by refusing to comply with all applicable health and safety laws; and taking advantage of, harassing and retaliating against (insert name(s)) for exerting their rights and request repairs, as alleged in Paragraph 8 of the Complaint;
- 7. Any and all claims relating in any way to any rent rebates or any other return of rent or other charges paid by (insert name(s)) to Defendants relative to any properties rented or offered for rent during the period January 9, 2010 to the end of the Class Period;
- 8. Any and all claims that Defendants have failed to keep the properties habitable and fit for occupancy as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;

- 9. Any and all claims relating to untenantable rental property or properties not meeting the standards of California Civil Code Section 1941.1 and Health & Safety Code Sections 17920, 17920.3 and 179920.10 or other applicable law;
- 10. Any and all claims that Defendants have failed to abate untenantable living conditions after receiving notice of them from tenants and/or the City of Fresno, as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;
- 11. Any and all claims that Defendants have retaliated and/or harassed tenants, including Plaintiffs and others similarly situated, when they attempt to enforce their legal rights as alleged in Paragraph 30 of the Complaint;
- 12. Any other claim asserted or attempted to be asserted in the Complaint, including any and all claims for injunctive relief, restitution, disgorgement, retroactive rent rebate, rent reductions, rent abatement and attorneys' fees and costs for this Action;
- 13. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Complaint filed in this Action;
- 14. Any and all claims alleged or attempted to be alleged in the Third Cause of Action in the Complaint in this Action;
- 15. Any and all claims for physical injuries, personal injuries, respiratory problems, allergies, infections, bites, insomnia, depression, anxiety, emotional distress, fear, frustration, humiliation, hopelessness, discomfort, lost income, mental distress, emotional distress, annoyance, discomfort, property damage;
 - 16. Any and all equitable claims of any type or nature;
- 17. Any and all claims for attorneys' fees and costs in connection with or related to the Action:
- 18. Any and all claims for damages of any type, including compensatory and punitive damages; and
 - 19. Any and all claims for interest of any type.

(insert name(s)) agree not to sue or otherwise make a claim against any of the Releasees that is in any way related to, arises out of or is connected in any way with the Representative Released Claims.

In agreeing to this Release, (insert name(s)) acts on his/her own behalf and on behalf of any and all of his/her heirs, executors, beneficiaries, legal representatives, transferces, agents, assigns, predecessors, successors and attorneys.

(insert name(s)), on his/her own behalf, further waives all rights and benefits afforded by Section 1542 of the Civil Code of the State of California, which states as follows:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS WHICH THE CREDITOR DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, WHICH IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER MUST HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR.

(insert name(s)), on his/her own behalf, expressly waives any and all rights under Section 1542 to the extent Section 1542 may have any application at all to the Releases set forth herein. (insert name(s)) further understands and acknowledges the significance and consequences of the foregoing specific waiver of said Section 1542, waives the provisions of Section 1542 upon the advice of legal counsel, and accepts full responsibility for any injury, damage, or loss which may hereinafter arise in respect of such releases, although unknown or unanticipated at the time of execution of this agreement.

(insert name(s)), on his/her own behalf, further agrees, promises and covenants that neither he/she, nor any person, organization or entity acting on his/her behalf, will file, charge, claim, sue or permit to be filed, charged or claimed, an action or proceeding of any type for damages or other relief (including injunctive, declaratory, monetary or other) against Releasees for any of the Representative Released Claims.

(insert name(s)) further represents and agrees that, other than this Action, (insert name(s)) has not filed or caused to be filed any other complaints, charges, applications, claims or grievances against Defendants and/or Releasees with any local, state or federal agency, court or other body; that he/she will not file or cause to be filed any such complaint, charge, application, claim or grievance at any time hereafter regarding any of the Representative Released Claims; and that if any complaint, charge, application, claim or grievance against Defendants or Releasees is filed on behalf of or with respect to (insert name(s)), he/she will request such agency, court or other body to withdraw from the matter with prejudice.

Willie Thompson further represents and agrees that, other than this Action and a small claims case titled Willie Thompson v. JD Home Rentals and John Hovannisian, Fresno County Superior Court Action No. 15 CESC 00423, which resulted in a judgment in favor of the defendants and which also resulted in dismissal of David Hovannisian. Willie Thompson has not filed or caused to be filed any other complaints, charges, applications, claims or grievances at any time regarding any of the Representative Released Claims; and that if any complaint, charge, application, claim or grievance against Defendants or Releasees is filed on behalf of or with respect to Willie Thompson, he will request such agency, court or other body to withdraw from the matter with prejudice.

REPRESENTATIVE PLAINTIFFS

DATED: 3-62021

Neng Vu

Signed by Zang Mous as Special

Administrator for Estate of Neng Vu

DATED: 1-1-20	Willie Thompson
DATED:	Elvia Reyes
DATED:	Catalina Mendoza
DATED:	Antonio Martinez Vega
DATED:	Malaquias Esteves
	EFENDANTS
DATED: 3 12-19	Grin Hoyannisian
DATED: 3-14-/9	David Hovannisian, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD Home Rentals
DATED: 3'-14-19	Bryce flovannisian, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD Home
	Rentals BDHOV, I.P. a California limited liability
DATED: 3-14-14	By: Divernition
- 0 N 10	JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership
DATED: 3 /3 19	John Borgnaistan

DATED:	
	Willie Thompson
DATED: tle 2 20	Elvia Rever
	Elvia Reyes
DATED:	Catalina Mendoza
DATED:	Antonio Martinez Vega
DATED:	Antomo Martinez Vega
	Malaquias Esteves
D)	EFENDANTS
DATED: 3 12 19	And House
	John Hovamusian
DATED: 3-14-19	David Hovannisian, sued as an
	individual and d/b/a JD Home
2	Rontals
DATED: _3-14-19	Bryce florantisian, sued as an
	individual and d/b/a JD Home
	Rentals
	BDHOV_LP, a California limited liability
	partnership
DATED: 3-14-14	Ву:
	David Horsemistan
	·
	JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership
DATED: 3 12 19	By: And Ullim
	John Boranaistan

DATED:	Willie Thompson
II. 6	wine inompson
DATED:	Elvía Reyes
DATED: 06-03-2020 06-03-2020 DATED: Autonio	Catalina Mendoza Catalina Mendoza Autonio Martinez Vega
DATED:	Malaquias Esteves
ner	endants _a
DATED: 3 12-19	Achri Powarroisian
DATED: 3-14-19	UD)
DATED: 3-14-19	David Hovannisian, sucd as an individual and d/b/a JD Home Rentals
DATED.	Bryce flovannisian, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD Home Rentals
	BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership
DATED: 3-14-14	David Horamaila
	JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership
DATED: 3 12 19	By: John Governmister

DATED:	Willie Thompson
DATED:	Elvia Reyes
DATED:	Catalina Mendoza
DATED: 6-3-20	Antonio Martinez Vega Malaquias Esteves
DATED: 3 12 19	ENDANTS Human
DATED: 3-14-19	David Hovannisian, sued as an
DATED: 3-14-19	Bryce Phylannisian, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD Home Bryce Phylannisian, sued as an individual and d/b/a JD Home Rentals
DATED: 3-14-19	BDHOV, LP, a California limited liability partnership By: Divid Hovennia
DATED: 3 12 19	JHS Family Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership By:

DATED: 3 12 19

JCH Pamily Limited Partnership, a California limited liability partnership

Ву:

Amendment to R Stip FINAL

EXHIBIT B

EXHIBIT B

Adrian Ventura Miranda;

Carlos Esteves;

Cathy Ariana Martinez;

Emily Elizabeth Martinez;

Esmeralda Ventura Miranda;

Iccel Evelina Martinez;

Jocenith Santiago;

Mauricio Esteves;

Ruby Maday Oros Miranda;

Savannah Elvia Miranda; and

Zayliah Medina Miranda.

EXHIBIT C

SUPER	OR COURT OF CALIFORN - Civil Department	Entered by:	
TITLE OF CASE:	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
Neng Vu vs.	John Hovannisian		
LAW AND MOTION MINUTE ORDER			Case Number: 14CECG00062
Hearing Date:	April 29, 2021	Hearing Type:	Motion - Final Approval Class Settleme
Department:	503	Judge:	Kimberly A. Gaab
Court Clerk:	F. Braun	Reporter/Tape:	Florence Colby
Appearing Part	ies:		
Plaintiff:	·	Defendant:	
Counsel: Miche	lie Kezirian, Barrett Litt	Counsel: Wi	lliam C. Hahesy, Linda Northrup
[X] All parties a	ppear via CourtCall	<u> </u>	
[] Continued to	[] Set for at Dep	t for	
• •	points and authorities with/		latter is argued and submitted.
[] Upon filing of	points and authorities.		
[] Motion is gra	nted [] in part and denie	d in part. [] Motion is d	enied [] with/without prejudice.
[] Taken under	advisement		
[] Demurrer	[] overruled [] sustained	with days to [] answ	er [] amend
[X] Tentative ru	iling becomes the order of	f the court. No further o	rder is necessary.
[X] Pursuant to adopting the te	CRC 3.1312(a) and CCP s entative ruling serves as th	ection 1019.5(a), no furt ne order of the court.	her order is necessary. The minute orde
[X] Service by	the clerk will constitute no	otice of the order.	
[X] See attache	ed copy of the Tentative R	uling.	
[] Judgment de	ebtor swom and examine	d.	
[] Judgment de Bench warra	ebtor failed to appear. Int issued in the amount of \$	6 <u>.</u>	
Principal \$	ages [] Default [] Oth Interest \$ Costs \$_ emption [] granted [] deni	Attorney fees \$	Total \$
I I Monies held	OURT ORDERS:	1 released to judgment cre	ditor. [] returned to judgment debtor.
[]\$ to be re	leased to judgment creditor	and balance returned to ju	dgment debtor.

Tentative Ruling

Re: Vu v. Hovannasian

Superior Court Case No. 14CECG00062

Hearing Date: April 29, 2020 (Dept. 503)

Motion: Plaintiffs' Motion for Final Approval of Class Settlement

Tentative Ruling:

To grant plaintiffs' motion for final approval of the class settlement.

Explanation:

"The trial court has broad discretion to determine whether the settlement is fair. It should consider relevant factors, such as the strength of plaintiffs' case, the risk, expense, complexity and likely duration of further litigation, the risk of maintaining class action status through trial, the amount offered in settlement, the extent of discovery completed and the stage of the proceedings, the experience and views of counsel, the presence of a governmental participant, and the reaction of the class members to the proposed settlement." (Dunk v. Ford Motor Co. (1996) 48 Cal.App.4th 1794, 1801, citation omitted.)

In Kullar v. Foot Locker Retail (2008) 168 Cal.App.4th 116, the Court of Appeal stated, "[I]n the final analysis it is the court that bears the responsibility to ensure that the recovery represents a reasonable compromise, given the magnitude and apparent ment of the claims being released, discounted by the risks and expenses of attempting to establish and collect on those claims by pursuing litigation. The court has a fiduciary responsibility as guardians of the rights of the absentee class members when deciding whether to approve a settlement agreement." (Id. at p. 129, internal citations omitted.)

Here, it appears that the *Dunk* factors weigh in favor of granting the final approval of the settlement. First, the court has already determined that the amount of the settlement is fair and reasonable under the circumstances in its earlier order granting preliminary approval of the settlement. There does not appear to be any reason for the court to reconsider its decision now.

Second, the risks of going to trial or even in getting the class certified appear to be significant, since plaintiffs' claims vary widely and raise many individual issues regarding the problems with each housing unit and whether the problems were fixed adequately. Likewise, it would have been complicated and risky for plaintiffs to go to trial even if the class was certified, and it would have been very expensive to do so. Considering the relatively low amount of damages, the cost and risks of going to trial would have likely outweighed the rewards even if plaintiffs did prevail. Thus, these factors weigh in favor of approval of the settlement.

Third, there was extensive informal discovery conducted before the mediation and settlement. Thus, this factor also weighs in favor of approving the settlement.

1

Fourth, the court recognizes that the amount offered in settlement is not great compared to many other class actions. However, the primary type of relief plaintiffs seek is an injunction to require defendants to correct and repair untenantable housing conditions. They obtained this relief, so it appears that the settlement meets plaintiffs' primary litigation objectives, even if the overall amount recovered is not great.

Fifth, class counsel is experienced in the fields of housing, civil rights, and class actions. Counsel has concluded that the settlement is highly favorable in light of the challenges in the case and the type of relief sought. Thus, this factor also weighs in favor of granting approval of the settlement.

Finally, with regard to the reaction of the class, there were no objections submitted to the proposed settlement, and only nine members of the putative class opted out of the settlement. A large number of class notices were returned as undeliverable, but this is not surprising, given the fact that many of the class members have likely moved to other addresses. There is no indication that any of the class members have strong objections to the settlement, so this factor weighs in favor of approval, as well.

Therefore, the court finds that the settlement is fair and reasonable. The motion for final approval of the settlement is granted.

Pursuant to California Rules of Court, rule 3.1312(a), and Code of Civil Procedure section 1019.5, subdivision (a), no further written order is necessary. The minute order adopting this tentative ruling will serve as the order of the court and service by the clerk will constitute notice of the order.

Issued By: on 4/26/2021

[Judge's initials]

On 4/26/2021

SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA - COUNTY OF FRESNO Civil Department, Central Division 1130 "O" Street Fresno, California 93724-0002 (559) 457-2000 TITLE OF CASE: Neng Vu vs. John Hovannisian CLERK'S CERTIFICATE OF MAILING FOR COURT USE ONLY FOR COURT USE ONLY CASE NUMBER: 14CECG00062

I certify that I am not a party to this cause and that a true copy of the:

Minute Order and Tentative Ruling .

Place of mailing: Fresno, California 93724-0 On Date: 04/30/2021	0002 Clerk, by	F. Braun	, Deput
Barrett S Litt McLane, Bednarski & Litt, LLP 975 East Green Street Pasadena, CA 91106		William C. Hahesy Law Offices of William Hahesy 5260 North Palm Avenue, Suite 400 Fresno, CA 93704	,
Julius C Thompson Bet Tzedek Legal Services 3250 Wilshire Blvd, 13th Fl Los Angeles, CA 90010			
			•